



BAHAAL

EMERGENCY RELIEF & EARLY RECOVERY FOR THE
FLOOD AFFECTEES ACROSS PAKISTAN
Emergency Response to Sindh Rains
2011-12



Field Monitoring Report
24th - 29th December 2011

Visited and Compiled by: Ali Anis (Project Monitoring Officer –Bahaal)

Contents

Progress Update as of 29 th December 2011	3
Sector Wise Cumulative Achievement:.....	4
Staffing Responsibilities and Performance of Field based MERs:.....	4
Hygiene and Water Kit Procurement:.....	4
Distribution of Hygiene and Water Kit:.....	5
CRP sessions:.....	5
Beneficiary Registration and Assessment Verification:	6
Pictures:	6
Procurement:	7
Assessment:	7
CRP Sessions.....	8
Annexure.....	10
List of Bidders.....	10

A field visit was conducted by the RSPN Bahaal Project MER officer to the districts of Badin, Mirpurkhas, Tando Mohammad Khan and Shaheed Benazirabad from 24th to 29th of December 2011. The purpose of the visit was to check and verify the beneficiaries assessed for the Bahaal Project items. In addition, hand pumps rehabilitation sites were checked. Moreover, hygiene sessions provided by CRPs were also witnessed and the quality and impact of the sessions and the CRPs was also noted down. Finally, the registration system of beneficiaries was monitored in detail and success stories were prepared.

1. Name of Monitor / Observer:	Ali Anis
2. Designation Monitor / Observer:	Project Monitoring Officer
3. Visit Date:	24 th -29 th December 2011
4. Name of RSP	NRSP
5. Name of District:	Badin, Mirpurkhas, Tando Mohammad khan, Shaheed Benazirabad

Progress Update as of 29th December 2011

S.#	Activity	Measure of Unit	Units		Households		Population	
			Target	Acht	Targt	Acht	Target	Acht
1	Procurement of Hygiene Kits	Kit	16200	8183	16200	8183	106596	106484
2	Distribution of Hygiene Kits	Kit	16200	761	16200	761	106596	5007
3	Organise Hygiene awareness sessions	Sessions	656	180	32400	9000	213192	59220
4	Procurement of Water Kit	Kit	16200	11550	16200	11550	106596	75999
5	Distribution of Water Kit	Kit	16200	754	16200	754	106596	4961
6	Procurement of Hand Pumps	Kit	225	-	4500	-	29610	-
7	Installation of Hand Pumps	Kit	225	-	4500	-	29610	-
	Total				36,900		242,802	

Sector Wise Cumulative Achievement:

RESULT	INDICATOR	CUMMULATIVE Achievement (%) Assessment	CUMMULATIVE Achievement (%) Distribution
Results 1: WASH Flood Affected Individuals have immediate access to potable water and a healthy environment	Water: Number and percentage of targeted households having Water Kits Hygiene Promotion: Number and percentage of targeted households having hygiene kits Hand Pumps: Number and percentage of hand pumps repaired Hygiene Education: Number and percent of targeted households receiving hygiene kits receive hygiene education.	100	5

Staffing Responsibilities and Performance of Field based MERs:

The new strategy of hiring 4 field-based MER personnel adopted for the second phase of Bahaal Project Emergency Response to Sindh floods is working quite well. All the MER officers are well aware of their local setup and the villages that need require the most immediate attention. Therefore, not only are they taking part in the assessment process but they are also ensuring that all the beneficiaries assessed meet the beneficiary selection criterion. As they are a part of all the activities going on in the district, therefore, they are in regular contact with affected population and present a clear first-hand view of the situation. This enables in making the right changes that help in smoothing out of the assessment and distribution processes. These MER officers report to the RSPN-based MER officer on a weekly basis, providing reports of the progress made with respect to project activities as well as response of the beneficiaries to the proposed project activities. Salaries of all the field-based monitors have been transferred to them on time after assessment of the quality of their work.

Hygiene and Water Kit Procurement:

Zahra Tents, a supplier from Lahore, who offered Rs 922 for Water Kit and 641 for hygiene kit in his quotation, was selected for procurement of project items. This was done after consultation with the USAID concerned personnel who after seeing the supplier's quoted price, quality of items and delivery capacity agreed to RSPN giving the procurement order to the supplier.

The delivery of Water Purification Sachets (WPSs) had been delayed by a week. This occurred because all the suppliers who brought quotations for hygiene and water kits did not either include good quality water purification sachets in the quotations or included Water Purification Tablets instead. The best quality sachet in the maximum price that is Rs. 5 price allocated for it is the one that is made by P&G.

This sachet is distributed by only one vendor with the name of HOPE. The distributor is located in Karachi and therefore to ensure quality a separate order was placed for the WPSs. The vendor was expected to complete the delivery of Sachets to all districts by the first week of January. However, there were some issues with Income tax and therefore, the distributor had to resubmit the quotation which delayed delivery of WPSs for a week. Their delivery will most likely be completed within the second week of January. The quality of items received at each of the four districts is very good.

Distribution of Hygiene and Water Kit:

The tentative plan for distribution of Bahaal Project Sind Emergency Response phase 2 which was shared with USAID was altered by the field teams of all districts due to a delay in procurement of Water Purification Sachets. This cause of this delay is mentioned in detail under the procurement heading. The distribution of the rest of the items has also been delayed for a few days. This was because of a delay in delivery from the supplier. Appropriate action will be taken by RSPN for this delay.

Hygiene and Water kit distribution have commenced in Badin where cumulatively almost 750 items of each have been distributed. This distribution was conducted under the supervision of NRSP and RSPN MER officer, Project Coordinator and SOs. The distribution was organized at a point that was in close proximity to the nearby beneficiary villages and was spacious enough to accommodate distribution of 450 beneficiaries. Distribution counters were setup where registration tokens were verified and the item mentioned on it was handed out to the beneficiary. The discipline of the distribution was very good and beneficiaries seemed very happy with items handed out to them.

CRP sessions:

CRP sessions are being conducted in all the four districts that fall under the project. To date 180 CRP sessions have been conducted in these districts. The sessions organized have been attended by not only the project beneficiaries but also others who have not been selected. Most of the beneficiaries of these sessions were quite satisfied with their delivery and content. The CRPs adopted an interactive approach for these sessions. The regularly questioned the listeners on the topic being taught in the session. In addition, they also used items to practically demonstrate the usage of each item in the kit that was to be handed out to them.

Generally the discipline was good in most of the sessions and beneficiaries were quite responsive. No. of beneficiaries for sessions varied from 25 to 103 hhs. The session with over 100 HH beneficiaries was found lacking in discipline and order. The MER and SOs who organized this session were asked to retake it after reducing the number of beneficiaries. There were also a few sessions in which only adult male members were seen. The MER and SOs were directed to encourage the listeners to bring their women and children along for the sessions.

Beneficiary Registration and Assessment Verification:

The assessment of beneficiaries for different project items has been completed and in Badin, item distribution has begun. The assessment of beneficiaries for all categories of items was done according to the general and specific beneficiary selection criteria provided to NRSP. The registration and issuance of tokens to beneficiaries was done in a centralized way. The assessment data from all the four districts was sent to the Regional head office in Badin. Here at Badin, all the data was merged together and computer generated tokens were issued for each assessed household. This method ensured that all districts issued one single type of token and therefore eliminated the chances of making an error in beneficiary token registration.

A field visit was made in the last week of November by RSPN MER officer for Bahaal to assist the field staff in the assessment of beneficiaries in the four districts. This visit was reported in the November's field report shared with USAID. The visit followed by another one in the last week of December before the commencement of distribution of project items. The purpose of this visit was to check whether the assessment of beneficiaries has been done according to the criteria handed out and whether all the beneficiaries who were assessed had been handed out their tokens. It was noted that overall more than 8000 beneficiaries were assessed for each of the districts. This was done because in many cases NIC numbers are repeated once the data is put into excel sheets. Thus before the generation of tokens from this data, the NIC numbers that are repeated are filtered and only one token issued for a particular NIC number. This results in elimination of duplication of beneficiaries. As a result of this measure while going through the beneficiary survey data from the field it was noticed that not all the assessed beneficiaries for a village had tokens issued to their names. The number of tokens issued for a village was mostly less than the number of beneficiaries assessed for that village.

Pictures:

Procurement:



Above: District: Tando Mohammad Khan
Procurement delivery receipt and delivered items
Date: 25nd December 2011

Assessment:

Above: District Badin and Tando Mohammad Khan
Beneficiary Assessment Data
Date: 25-26th December 2011



District: Badin
Beneficiary Tokens and Assessment Data
Date: 27th December 2011



Left: District: Nawab Shah; Village: Mehr Ali Jamali
Right: District Badin; Village: Belchak
Item: Assessed Hand Pumps for rehabilitation
Date: 26th and 27th December 2011

CRP Sessions



Left; District: Shaheed Benazirabad; Village: Mehr Ali Jamali; CRP: Abu Bakr, Zeenat
Right; District: Badin; Village: Belchak; CRP: Sana
Date: 26th-27th December 2011



District: Tando Mohammad Khan
Left; Village: Ali Mohammad Masgi; CRP: Gawar Mehri
Right; Village: Naro Malkoli; CRP: Noor Hussain
Date: 28th December 2011

Annexure

List of Bidders

RURAL SUPPORT PROGRAMMES NETWORK (RSPN)

Name of Tender: Procurement of 16,270 Water and Hygiene Kits
Name of Project: USAID/OFDA funded BAHAAL project
Tender Opening Date: November 25, 2011

Draft Comparative Statement

#	Name of Bidding Firm	GST & Income Tax Registration (Yes/No)	Bank Draft Submitted (Yes/No)	Sample Submitted (Yes/No)	Unit Cost Offered for 1 Water Kit (Rs.)	Unit Cost Offered for 1 Hygiene Kit (Rs.)
1	M/s IMEX Trading Services	Yes	Missing	Hygiene kit bag missing	1,000	924
2	Zahra Tents		Yes	Yes	922	641
3	Kashif Traders		Yes	Sachet missing	931	737
4	Shabbir Jan & Co.		Yes	Yes	1,068	721
5	Indus Associates		Missing	Yes	748	687
6	Shahid Trading Co.		Yes	Yes	549	630
7	AZ Traders		Yes	Sachet missing	1,010	960

8	Zohaib Tradeco		Missing	Yes	1,065	793
9	Sarwish Traders		Yes	Sachet missing	871	631
10	Classic Molty Quilts		Yes	Sachet missing	769	785
11	IMGC Global (Pvt) Ltd.		Yes	Water kit missing	659.1	674.65
12	SA Traders (Not interested in supplying hygiene kit)		Yes	Hygiene kit missing	1,005	0
13	Pearl Associates		Yes	Water kit missing	1,086	640
14	Paramount Tarpaulin Industries		Yes	Yes	876	696
15	Al-Mehdi International		Yes	Sachet missing	873	757
16	Husnain Enterprises (Interested in supplying hygiene kit only)		Yes	Water kit missing		889.5
17	Aalyan Enterprises		Yes	Yes	1,431	622
18	Khurram Enterprises		Yes	No	843.2	813.9
19	Medicate International		Yes	Yes	911	874

20	MA Shah & Sons		Yes	Sachet missing	1,010.63	727.06
21	Potohar Steel Corporation (interested in water kit only)		Yes	Hygiene kit missing	747	
22	Pak Business International		Yes	No	972	692.92
23	MIMA TEX		Yes	Yes	1,314	791

Distribution Process – Observations

<p>1. What is the process of Distribution? The distribution process was carried out in the most convenient way for the beneficiaries. It was ensured that the distribution is located as close to the village of beneficiaries as possible. The process itself was carried out in a very transparent fashion. The beneficiaries had arrived at the distribution points with their tokens and original identity cards. The items were handed out to beneficiaries after verification of their tokens and id cards by the field staff. They were also provided with acknowledgement slips once the items had been handed out to them.</p>			
	Good = 1	Adequate (some problems) =2	Poor (major problems) =3
3. How effective is the registration process (does everyone have an equal chance of being registered)?	1-yes		
4. Do enough registration points made for timely registration?	1-yes		
5. Is the Registration Venue appropriate overall?	1-yes		
6. How well the registration record is made?		2- Its initially maintained excel sheets	
Proper date/time of distribution and place of distribution communicated to the registered beneficiary?	1-yes		

<p>1. Additional Information, issues/ problems (if any) At one distribution point the lines were not made that well. Field staff was not adequate to maintain the discipline in the chaotic crowd.</p>
<p>2. Suggestions for improvement (if any) Enough staff members should always be taken to the distribution points. NRSP was informed of this occurrence and ensured that future distributions will take in the presence of adequate personnel.</p>

Distribution Venue and Environment – Observations

1. Where is the distribution being held?				
	Good = 1	Adequate (some problems) =2		Poor (major problems) =3
3. Is the Registration accessible to the beneficiaries?	1-yes			
4. How the distribution is managed?	1- yes			
5. Is the distribution point appropriate for women and children?	1- yes			
1. Additional Information				

Beneficiaries

1. How many household provided relief packages during your visit (Own observation)	Total HHS.....241..... Male:131..... Female:110.....
2. How effective was the beneficiary selection process. Were the most deserving beneficiaries selected (own observation)?	All deserving=1, Some deserving =2, Non-deserving =3 1
3.How transparent was the beneficiary selection process	1

4. Did any registered member fail to turn up, or leave halfway through the distribution process? (check the number of registered members of the date and time and actual present or received)	2			
5. Details or Additional Information. (if any):				
6. Opinion of the beneficiary (ask randomly selected beneficiary about their satisfaction level):	All satisfied	Mostly satisfied	Few satisfied	None-satisfied
Overall distribution process	Yes			
Quality of the relief package	Yes			
Quantity of the relief package		Yes		
Accessibility of the relief package		Yes		
Any additional Information (if any)				

Logistic

	Yes = 1	No = 0
1. Do the District team have a safe place for the stock of relief items?	1	
2. Have they deployed proper logistic in terms of human resource and vehicles etc.	1	
3. Do they have clear distribution SoP in place?		0
4. Observation/comments		

Overall Assessment

	Yes, good =1	Adequate =2	Less than adequate =3	Poor = 0
1. Overall do you think the distribution process was adequate according to the local needs?	1			

ANY OTHER OBSERVATIONS: The distribution generally was well organized. Discipline was maintained transparency was ensured. The beneficiaries were quite satisfied with the proceedings. The only major concern was paucity of personnel available at the time of distribution which prolonged the entire process.