

CMST Trainings Monitoring Report



ACKNOWLEDGEMENT:

The author of this report would like to thank BRSP and NRSP colleagues and community representatives for their utmost support as reflected during these monitoring visits.



©2019 Rural Support Programmes Network (RSPN). All Rights Reserved.

“This Publication has been produced by Rural Support Programme (RSPN) with assistance of the European Union. The content of this publication are the sole responsibility of RSPN and can in no way be taken to reflect the views of the European Union.”

More information about European Union is available on:

Web: <http://eeas.europa.eu/delegations/pakistan/>

Twitter: @EUPakistan

Facebook: [European-Union-in-Pakistan/269745043207452](https://www.facebook.com/European-Union-in-Pakistan/269745043207452)

Report Prepared by:

Mr. Muhammad Ali Azizi

Specialist Social Mobilisation RSPN

Designed by:

Assad Abbas Malik, Communications Officer BRACE RSPN

Table of Contents

- Overview: 4
- Executive Summery..... 4
 - Main Observations:..... 5
 - Observations from the visit of District Kech. 5
 - Witnessing CMST Event at UC Nodiz. 6
 - Witnessing CMST Roll Out in Pishin District..... 8
- Suggestions Provided to the field team **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

Overview:

RSPN's Specialist Social Mobilisation visited District Pishin and Kech, to witness the delivery of CMST trainings being imparted by NRSP and BRSP under two BRACE Programme districts. The main objective of his visits to these two locations was:

1. To obtain feedback from District Manager, HRD Officers and CMST Master trainers on the quality and impact of CMST module developed by RSPN.
2. To identify gaps and suggest improvements in training management and delivery.

Executive Summary

RSPN has revised the three-day Community Management Skills Training (CMST) which RSPs organise for Presidents and Managers of newly formed Community Organisations (CO). The reasons for revising the CMST module were that the old module mainly focused on transferring knowledge, skills and tools regarding organizational management, cooperation and collective action which are important, but they lack materials on essential topics such as core human values, active citizenship and roles and responsibilities of the community leaders in fostering these values across the communities. Second, the old modules often relied on lecture method. Therefore, they were not effective in terms of transferring the knowledge and skills to the illiterate participants of these trainings. So in the revised CMST module, both the contents and methods were revised. BRSP and NRSP Turbat are using the new CMST module for training CO Presidents and Managers under BRCAE programme. As part of RSPN's technical support and backstopping to BRACE member RSPs, I visited CMST roll out events at Kech district of NRSP Turbat on 12 December 2018 and Pishin district of BRSP on 18 January 2019. The main purpose of my visits to the CMST events was first to see whether the field staff are able to deliver the training properly or not, and second to check the effectiveness of the module in transferring knowledge to the training participants and as to how far it is instrumental in changing their behaviour and attitude. At both places, I observed the training sessions in progress and training arrangements, interviewed training participants, trainers and District Managers about the quality and effectiveness of the training. Also obtained feedback from BRACE Focal persons Ghulam Rasul of NRSP and Dr. Shahnawaz of BRSP about the CMST module.

Main Observations:

Main observations identified by Specialist Social Mobilisation include:

1. Both BRSP and NRSP senior management, HRD staff and Social organisers highly appreciated the quality of the revised CMST module. They found the training contents quite relevant to enhance the leadership qualities of the community leaders and improve their motivation to work as professional volunteers.
2. The training arrangements at all places were satisfactory. However, the training schedule was not developed on the format provided into BRACE PIM. On my advice, the training schedule has been modified.
3. The delivery of training was satisfactory. The trainer found both the training contents and methods relevant and interesting and easy to follow compared to the old CMST module.
4. The level of learning of knowledge and skills by the participants was satisfactory. They remember the key points and messages conveyed through the training.
5. The Quality Assurance and Control Plan (QACP) was not maintained in the training file. It has been strongly recommended to maintain in all training events.

Observations from the visit of District Kech.

On 12 December 2018, met with the General Body members of Village Organisation (VO) Godi, UC Nodiz, District Kech. This is a mix VO and it was revitalized on 26 November 2018 under BRACE programme. The VO was formed by seven-member COs, including four male and three female COs. All 14 CO Presidents and Managers who are the General Body members of the VO had received CMST on the revised module. The VO President had also received CMST on the old module long time ago. When I asked him how the new module was different from the old module, he told me that the old module was mainly focused on conducting meeting, collecting savings and maintaining CO records. But the new module not only teach these things but also contain other important matters, like inclusions of the marginalized groups, qualities of honest and active leader, personal development, household development and community development etc. In response to my question “what interest you most in the CMST and why” the community leaders mentioned pictures, games, group activities because they were fully taking part and involved in those activities. They suggested to deliver other contents through activities. I appreciated their comments and explained to them that not all contents could be delivered through games and activities, however, they could be delivered via interactive methods. That is why, the CMST module is a mix of games, role plays, group activities and individual activities, based on the nature of the activity. The CMST trainees found the training very learning and interesting and suggested to expand its duration from three to five days, so that they could learn more things about community development and CO management. I told them that there will be another training course for the

VO leaders named as Leadership and Management Skills Training (LMST) and in that training, they will learn more about the development of their members and their community institutions.

I asked the women CMST trainees for their views about the training. The women said that they remain very busy in domestic chores and embroidery and hence have little time to spare for any other thing. However, the CMST was so interesting and useful that they were ready to spare more days to such trainings. The women found the story of an active and honest leader, pictures of Pakistan, role plays and games as the most interesting segments.



Witnessing CMST Event at UC Nodiz.

1. Training arrangements: The training venue was a government school building which was closed due to winter vacations. The training venue had enough space for the 34 male and female leaders from 17 COs. This was the third and the last day of the training. The attendance of the trainees was 100 per cent. Akhlaq Hussain and Mah Zeb, the two CMST Master Trainers trained by RSPN were jointly delivering the training sessions. The training banner with EU visibility requirements was hanging on the wall of the training center. The training materials and illustrations were printed on panaflex banners in multi-colours. All required training aids and materials were available with the trainees. The participants had note books, pen, pencils and markers packed in a plastic folder.

Observations and suggestions: The training schedule was developed in Urdu and was given to the participants. However, it had no EU and BRACE logo on it. Second, it was not developed on the format given in the BRACE PIM. So I asked the BRACE team to fix these things.

Training delivery: I observed the trainees delivering part of a training session. Their command over the subject matter, confidence level and presentation style were quite satisfactory. The trainees said that the module is written in a systematic manner and they find no difficulty in delivering the sessions. They said that they also learn by delivering sessions and they try to incorporate their learnings in the next training sessions. According to the trainers, the three-day duration to deliver the given contents is enough.

- 2. Increase in learning of the participants:** I asked the participants about their overall experience about the CMST event. They all said that the training was very interesting and they learned variety of new knowledge and skills through it which would be useful in doing their personal, family and community development. The most interesting segments were plays, group works and stories of Zainab and Musarat, the two honest, active and successful leaders. According to the participants, the duration of the training course was short, and they suggested to expand it to five or six days so that they could understand the contents of the training properly. According to the Master Trainers, the interest level of the trainees remains quite high throughout the three-day sessions and their learning level is quite satisfactory. Both literate and illiterate participants can benefit from the module.
- 3. Retention of learning and behaviour change:** The HRD and Social mobilisation staff said that it would be too early to judge the level of behaviour change in the trainees because they had recently received it. However, they hoped that the trainees will try to share their learning with CO members and will lead their CO development in meaningful manner, because the training had increased their understanding about their roles and responsibilities as community leaders and boosted their confidence level on their abilities.
- 4. Gender Mainstreaming:** The fact that the training participants were both women and men and the Master Trainers were also a man and a woman speaks a lot about increase in gender sensitisation level of both RSP staff and the community activists.
- 5. Monitoring:** RSPN has developed and shared Quality Assurance and Control Plan (QACP) checklist with BRASP and NRSP long ago. However, this was not in use in the CMST events. I told the HRDP staff to include blank copies of the QACP in the training materials in the coming training courses. The HRDP person who organise the training course should fill in the format and put in the training file.



Witnessing CMST Roll Out in Pishin District

On 18 January 2019, I went to see roll out of CMST training at two places in Field Unit Khanozai, District Pishin. At both places, observed the training sessions in progress and training arrangements, interviewed training participants, trainers and District Manager about the quality and effectiveness of the training. Also obtained feedback from Dr. Shahnawaz, BRACE Focal Person and Head of HRD/Social Mobilisation, Akbar Khan Achakzai, Manager HID and Maqsood Ahmed, Coordinator Capacity Building about the CMST module. Below are my observations and suggestions for improvement:

- 1. Training arrangement:** The training venue at both places was quite spacious and comfortable. The training schedule was prepared in English. Note pad, pen, pencils, markers, white sheets, charts and other training materials were sufficiently available with the trainees. The training presentations were printed on Pana flex and hanging in the training center. The training banner with EU logo and acknowledgement was properly hanging on the front side of the training center. The number of trainees at both places were 20. Since both events were organised for men, therefore, no female participant was attending the course. BRSP management told me that separate CMST events are organised for women CO leaders, where men visitors are often not allowed.

Observations and recommendations: The training schedule should be developed in Urdu and it must have logos of EU, GoB, BRSP and BRACE on it as per the instructions given in the EU visibility plan. I have shared the Urdu translation of the CMST schedule prepared by NRSP Turbat under my guidance with BRSP management so that they can follow the same pattern in developing their own module.

Training delivery: At both places, it was the 3rd day of a 4 day CMST. Though the core CMST course is for three days, BRSP added the fourth day to introduce the participants with key interventions of BRACE programme and CAT sessions, which is quite good. Unfortunately, I could not see delivery of sessions at both trainings because when I arrived, the participants were making presentations of their group work. However, in response to my query the trainers said that they find delivery of the new CMST module much easier than the old one. The main reason is that in this module, each and every step of the training sessions are clearly articulated and all relevant training materials including pictures, illustrations, video etc. are readily available with them. Second, the module is interactive, so it creates lots of interest in the participants. So compared to the previous module, they find the participants fully attentive and therefore, they easily understand whatever they deliver. I tried to see the level of learning of the participants as a proxy indicator of effectiveness of the training delivery and I found that the learning level of the maximum participants was well above average. But compared to the old CMST module, the learning level is very high. This proved that the delivery of the sessions by the trainees was satisfactory

- 2. Increase in learning of the participants:** The group work presented by the participants at both events were speaking themselves the learning level of the participants, which was very high. Then I asked questions about what they had learnt so far, and found that all participants have several points of their interest as their learning. Majority participants mentioned the exclusion exercise, the qualities of good community leader, the fact that they themselves are responsible for changing the destiny and fate through collective efforts. And basically these were the topics they had covered so far.
- 3. Retention of learning and behaviour change:** Responding to my question on retention of learning and behaviour change as a result of the CMST course, Mujeeb ul Rehman, HRD Officer and trainer of BRSP said “frankly speaking, the contents of the old module was mainly theoretical and hence difficult to comprehend for the rural people, hence there was insignificant behaviour change in the large majority of the trainees. However, the contents of the new module are simple, practical and easy to learn for the illiterate and less literate participants. Interestingly they are equally interesting for the literate participants as well. This boost their motivation and hence bring in positive changes in their behaviour”. Mr. Ibrahim Agha, District Manager Pishin said “as far as the old CMST module is concerned, we simply used to give lectures and go away, but in this module, we provide them avenues

for thinking, learning from experiences and learning by doing. Therefore, the level of interest, learning and motivation is very high in this module". When I asked for indicators of learning and behaviour change in participants, he said that the trained persons become quite active and they try to put in practice their learnings immediately after returning to their villages. Visible improvements are seen in the record keeping and savings of their COs and they start self-help initiatives.

- 4. Gender Mainstreaming:** The contents and delivery methods of the CMST module has been developed in a gender sensitive manner. In fact, one senior manager of programme RSPs complained about it to me and said that the module over emphasized on gender aspects. So I was expecting that the training participants will give gender sensitive answers to my questions. But even answering my question about the exclusion session as to who are the most neglected people in our society, they all mentioned poorest, PWDs and minorities, but nobody mentioned women. When I raised this concern with the Training Officers of BRSP, they said that when external people come and speak in Urdu, they get confused and cannot express properly, but when we ask the same question in the local language, they mention women quite frankly.

Suggestion: I have no clear answer to this question except suggesting that we need to do much more to sensitise the communities on gender mainstreaming.

- 5. Monitoring:** RSPN has developed and shared Quality Assurance and Control Plan (QACP) checklist with BRASP and NRSP long ago. However, this was not in use in the CMST events. BRSP should do that and fill in the format for each and every CMST event and file it in the training file. Printed copies of the QACP should be made part of training materials. The HRDP person who organise the training course should fill in the format and put in the training file.
- 6. Pre-post evaluation of CMST Trainees:** BRSP conducts a pre-post evaluation of the trainees to check the learning enhancement level on a simple format in Urdu. The participants need to tick one of the multiple answers. The illiterate participants fill in the evaluation forms with the help of a literate participant. This is a good practice and I suggest that NRSP should also start practicing it. The evaluation format needs further improvement. For example, in question one which is about excluded segments of the society, the poorest, minorities and PWDs are mentioned but women are not mentioned.