REPORT
Participatory Action Research
Dynamics of Household Poverty and Inclusive Development in Balochistan with Focus on Women’s Empowerment
Under European Union (EU) Funded, BRACE Programme
REPORT

Participatory Action Research Dynamics of Household Poverty and Inclusive Development in Balochistan with a Focus on Women’s Empowerment Under European Union (EU) Funded, BRACE Programme

Submitted to
EU/RSPN-BRACE Programme

Submitted by
Momentum (Pvt.) Limited
Islamabad, Pakistan
Date: 17th, July 2020

AUTHORS
Dr. Abdul Saboor
Dr. Haroon Sarwar
Ghulam Shabbir
Fatima Shafqat

REVIEWERS & CONTRIBUTORS
Dr. Muhammad Saleem
Dr. Zafar ul Hassan
Dr. Rao Muhammad Nadeem
Muhammad Tanveer ul Hassan

FIELD RESEARCH TEAM
Muhammad Ishtiaq
Masood Baloch
&
Field Researchers

DATA ENTRY, PROCESSING AND ANALYSIS TEAM
Muhammad Ali Raza
M. Hissan Ahmad

Graphic Design
Mobeen Habib
mobeenhabib@gmail.com

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT
We thank our colleagues from RSPN who provided insight and expertise that greatly assisted in the report, especially Khaleel Ahmed Tetlay, Khurram Shahzad, Abdur Rehman Cheema, Fehmida Hassan and Rahim Khetran.

All pictures used in this publication are the property of BRACE Programme and its partners.

(c) 2020 Rural Support Programmes Network (RSPN). All Rights Reserved. Licensed to the European Union under conditions.

“This Publication has been produced by Rural Support Programmes Network (RSPN) with assistance of the European Union. The content of this publication are the sole responsibility of the authors and can in no way be taken to reflect the views of the European Union or RSPN.”

More information about European Union is available on:

Web: http://eeas.europa.eu/delegations/pakistan/
Twitter: @EUPakistan
Facebook: EUinPakistan
Annexures

Annexure A: PSC and SES Data Tables

Table 1: Demographic Data
Table 2: PSC Wise Education Status of Household Head
Table 3: Top Reasons for Not Going to School
Table 4: District Wise Primary Work Status of the Respondents
Table 5: PSC Wise Livestock Ownership
Table 6: PSC Wise Land Ownership
Table 7: Average Percentage Share in Total Household Income
Table 8: District Wise Summary Statistics of Total Annual Household Income (PKR)
Table 9: Average Percentage Share of Household Expenditure
Table 10: District Wise Summary Statistics of Annual Total Household Expenditure (PKR)
Table 11: District Wise Summary Statistics of Total Household Loans (PKR)
Table 12: District Wise Summary Statistics of Total Household Savings (PKR)

Annexure B: BRACE - Social Mobilisation, Community Organisation and Invention Related Tables

Table 1: Mobilization of HHs and Number of Community Institutions Under BRACE Programme
Table 2: Community Investment Fund (CIF) and Income Generating Grants Interventions of Brace Programme
Table 3: Technical and Vocational Skills Training, Persons with Disability and Community Physical Infrastructure Interventions in BRACE Programme
Table 4: Adult Literacy and Numeracy Skills, Youth Recreational Activities and Community Awareness Toolkit Interventions under BRACE Programme.

Annexure C: Images of Data Collection from Field
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACC</td>
<td>Arbitrary Community Councils</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BCDP</td>
<td>Balochistan Community Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BISP</td>
<td>Benazir Income Support Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRACE</td>
<td>Balochistan Rural Development and Community Empowerment Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRSP</td>
<td>Balochistan Rural Support Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BUIITEM</td>
<td>Balochistan University of Information Technology Engineering, &amp; Management Sciences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CDD</td>
<td>Community-Driven Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CIF</td>
<td>Community Investment Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO</td>
<td>Community Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>European Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FGD</td>
<td>Focus Group Discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GoB</td>
<td>Government of Balochistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HD</td>
<td>Human Dynamics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HDI</td>
<td>Human Development Index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HH</td>
<td>Household</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KII</td>
<td>Key Informant Interviews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IGG</td>
<td>Income Generating Grant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JDDC</td>
<td>Joint District Development Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LHI</td>
<td>Life History Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LSO</td>
<td>Local Support Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIP</td>
<td>Micro Investment Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M&amp;E</td>
<td>Monitoring &amp; Evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MV</td>
<td>Momentum Venture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-governmental Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NRSP</td>
<td>National Rural Support Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAR</td>
<td>Participatory Action Research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PDMA</td>
<td>Provincial Disaster Management Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PFM</td>
<td>Public Finance Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSC</td>
<td>Poverty Scorecard</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RSP</td>
<td>Rural Support Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RSPN</td>
<td>Rural Support Programmes Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TA</td>
<td>Technical Assistance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOR</td>
<td>Terms of Reference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UC</td>
<td>Union Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UCDP</td>
<td>Union Council Development Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UM</td>
<td>University of Mannheim, Germany</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>United Nations Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VDP</td>
<td>Village Development Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VO</td>
<td>Village Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WO</td>
<td>Women’s Organisation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Tables

Table 1: Dimensions of Household Level Social and Economic Resources ...................................................... 20
Table 2: Women’s Empowerment Indicators/ Sub-Indicators .................................................................................. 21
Table 3: Inclusive Development Indicators/Sub-Indicators ...................................................................................... 21
Table 4: Social Mobilisation Indicators/Sub-Indicators .......................................................................................... 22
Table 5: Sampling Matrix ........................................................................................................................................... 24
Table 6: Extent of Poverty (Percentage of Households) .......................................................................................... 31
Table 7: District-wise Poverty Push Factors as Per LHI Women Respondents .................................................... 31
Table 8: District Wise Comparison of Poverty Push Factors - Men ........................................................................ 32
Table 9: Poverty Push Factors Based on Three Phases of Life of Women Respondents in Percentage ............ 34
Table 10: PSC Category Wise Push Factors of Poverty (Likelihood Percentage) ..................................................... 36
Table 11: District-wise Poverty Pull Events/Factors, as Narrated by Women .............................................................. 41
Table 12: District-wise Poverty Pull Events/Factors as Narrated by Men ............................................................... 42
Table 13: Poverty Pull Factors/Events Based on Three Phases of Life of Women Respondents in Percentage ................................................................................................................................................................................................. 43
Table 14: PSC Category Wise Pull Factors of Poverty (Percentage Likelihood) ....................................................... 44
List of Figures & Graphs

**Figures**

**Figure 1:** Women’s Empowerment Key Areas.......................................................................................................................... 15

**Figure 2:** Conceptual Framework for the Study .......................................................................................................................... 19

**Figure 3:** Respondent Level Wise Dimensions of the Study ...................................................................................................... 20

**Figure 4:** Selection of Study Districts Using Map of Balochistan ................................................................................................. 22

**Figure 5:** Villages Profile Infographics ........................................................................................................................................ 27

**Figure 6:** Findings Summary of Women Empowerment Status in Sampled Districts .................................................................. 54

**Figure 7:** Mind Map of Social Mobilisation for Sustainable Inclusive Development ................................................................. 62

**Figure 8:** Challenges of Governance and Mitigation Measures to Improve Governance .............................................................. 75

**Graphs**

**Graph 1:** Service Quality Satisfaction Level ............................................................................................................................... 68

**Graph 2:** Change in Service Quality Over Last 12 Months in Percentages ................................................................................ 70
Introduction of the Study

The subject study titled ‘Participatory Action Research on Dynamics of Household Poverty and Inclusive Development in Balochistan with a Focus on Women’s Empowerment’ under the European Union (EU) funded BRACE Programme is a longitudinal research to be conducted in three different waves. The study has been sponsored by Rural Support Programme Network (RSPN) and conducted by Momentum Pvt Ltd (a consulting and research organisation). The first wave of the study has been completed during 2019, in three sample districts of Balochistan province, i.e. Khuzdar, Kech and Loralai.

Objectives of the Study

The main objective(s) of the study inter alia include; i. To ascertain the household poverty push and pull factors; ii. To assess the status of women empowerment and impact of women empowerment on household poverty dynamics; iii. To identify the determinants of inclusive development; iv. To highlight the role of social mobilisation for inclusive development; v. To study the local governance system and suggest structural changes in the local governance; vi. To provide evidence-based local development recommendations for the Community Driven-Local Government and Rural Development Policy Framework (CD-LGRD PFW) that is being developed by the Technical Assistance (TA) component of the BRACE Programme with the Government of Balochistan.

Study Methodology

A mix methodology, including qualitative and quantitative tools, was used to conduct the study in the sample districts, i.e. Loralai, Khuzdar and Kech. The research processes included: preparation of the conceptual framework covering the research themes, i.e. household poverty dynamics, women empowerment, social mobilisation, inclusive development and governance; operationalisation of conceptual framework (through appropriate indicators for each of the research areas as per research questions); preparation and validation of research tools, training of the field researchers followed by data collection from the field; data analysis (correlation and triangulation); finalisation of the study report in the light of RSPN comments; and providing recommendations for CD-LGRD PFW.

The study was conducted at three levels, i.e. individual, household and community as well as with key representatives of the government departments. The tools used to collect the data from the aforementioned levels (and stakeholders) were; Poverty Scorecard (PSC), socio-economic survey (SES) data, Life History Interviews (based on the approach of Chronic Poverty Research Centre UK), Focus Group Discussions (FGDs), Participatory Rapid Appraisal (PRA) and consultative meetings.

Purposive sampling method was used to identify locations for the study. Due to ecological, cultural and ethnic diversity in Balochistan, the province was divided into three zones, i.e. North, East and South. Out of BRACE nine districts, one district from each zone was selected for effective representation of each zone. From each district two union councils (02 villages from each union council) were included in the sample on a random basis. In other words, the study was conducted in twelve villages of six UCs of three districts of Balochistan province.

The respondents of the first wave of study were; PSC & SEC data for 288 households; 288 Women and 288 men (LHI respondents); 24 FGDs (12 for each women and men), 12 PRAs and 03 consultative meetings with representatives of government departments (one in each district).

Study Findings

The study identified 14 poverty push factors in Balochistan. As per findings, the main poverty push factors are; un-employment, underemployment, high dependency ratio, higher inflation, illiteracy and lack of employable skills, health shocks, loans (debt) for social and economic reasons, and natural
disasters across all the districts. The poverty push case of Bakht Bibi is evident as illiteracy (lack of education and skill within her household) and loss of agriculture income due to droughts in her area are the reasons for her household’s poverty. Similarly, Roashan Bibi has attributed high dependency ratio and unemployment (due to lack of skill and income generating opportunities) as poverty push factors for her household.

As far as the probability of occurrence of poverty is concerned, the likelihood of push events is: natural disasters 50%, death shocks (29%), illiteracy (23%), un-employment (as well as lesser income) 22.5%.

Whereas, the main poverty pull factors inter alia include; decreased dependency ratio, income generation from livestock, social safety net provided by the government, education/human resource development/skill training and availability of water for agriculture production. The case of Gul Bushra has demonstrated that due to education of her children (which subsequently led to their employment and became a reason for income generation), their household was pulled out of poverty. Shaboo Bibi has explained that due to solar based water station installed in their village, they were able to resolve their agriculture income loss issues arose due to drought like situation in their area. Hence, agriculture income led her son to complete his education (he became an M.B.B.S doctor) and started contributing to household income. Later the added income of her son also contributed to betterment of their household.

The likelihood of poverty pull factors are in the order of decrease in dependency ratio and increase in income from livestock 17% each, social safety net provided by the government 14%, education & literacy 9.3% and availability of water for cultivation 5.8%. Women’s employment has a likelihood of 3.4% to become a poverty reduction event.

**Women’s Empowerment**

Research findings indicate that women have a very low level of self-esteem, self-confidence and personal autonomy. Social and psychological empowerment of women based on their perceptions about themselves is almost none. Cultural connotations and perverted perception of men about the role of women, their importance, autonomy and empowerment, are the core reasons for a low self-esteem of women. Most of the women across all the districts are not aware of their most basic rights mainly because of lack of education (very low literacy rate amongst rural females) and access to information.

Only a few women in district Loralai, Kech and Khuzdar have access to information through mobile phones. Women have negligible contribution to decisions related to household (HH) income and spending. Women’s access to capital, credit and control over HH income and savings is very limited. One of the main reasons of lack of access to capital, credit and control over HH savings is very low level of awareness about financial matters. Participation of women in socio-economic and political activities outside the home is highly restricted due to conservatism and cultural restrictions. However, elderly women have a little liberty to attend social events like deaths and marriage in family and in the community. Women have almost no access to market hence their participation and integration with value chain activities is almost missing. One of the main reasons of low participation in value chain activities is lack of income generating skill and literacy amongst the women.

Process of social capital formation through the community institutions (Community Organisations (COs) and Village Organisations (VOs) meetings has just been initiated in district Loralai. However, social capital structure in districts of Khuzdar and Kech is a comparatively stronger due to continued social mobilisation activities of Balochistan Rural Support Programme (BRSP) and National Rural Support Programme (NRSP).

Women’s empowerment and HH poverty are interdependent and inversely proportional. Higher the level of women empowerment, lower the level of poverty. Women empowerment is synonymous to better HH management in terms of handling the finances and affairs related to social wellbeing of the whole family. Women participation in skill development programmes for initiating income generating activities, livestock management, small scale farming, education and literacy (especially skill literacy programmes), etc., can be conducive and supportive in improving the status of women’s empowerment and poverty reduction.
**Social Mobilisation**

The research provides convincing evidences that social mobilisation is an effective approach to enhance awareness and strengthen role of women in rural Balochistan. Social mobilisation can harness the human potential and ensure human resource development especially through skill development for income generation and literacy programmes.

Exposure and awareness of women in Loralai district about social mobilisation were not encouraging as only a few of respondents mentioned about their participation in the awareness sessions organised by COs or Community Resource Persons (CRPs). Mobility restrictions, lack of self-awareness of women and patriarchal culture pattern were the key causes for low participation of women to Loralai social mobilisation sessions. In contrast, the situation of women’s participation in social mobilisation sessions in Khuzdar and Kech is encouraging. Women’s mobility up to the immediate surroundings of the house is better in these districts. Livestock training and provision of Income Generating Grants (IGGs) and small loans from Community Investment Fund (CIF), mostly used to buy goats/sheep (by BRSP and NRSP) have supported the women in these districts to start the process of improving their wellbeing.

The research highlights that community institutions (COs, VOs, and LSOs) can help to develop and strengthen social capital. Furthermore, social capital supports participation of women in the value chain activities and improves their access to market and capital. The research also indicates that social mobilisation and awareness raising campaigns can play a pivotal role in addressing women’s empowerment issues. However, social mobilisation and awareness-raising activities need consent of men and community notables. Furthermore, social mobilisation can raise awareness of women about their rights and help them acquire skills also. The empowerment acquired through social mobilisation can help women in bringing about a positive change in the areas of education, health, income of the family, amongst others, and CO, VO and LSO present a forum through which service providers can carry out their outreach activities. Culturally appropriate social mobilisation approach is needed to enhance the buy-in of local stakeholders for truly harnessing the potential of women and men.

**Inclusive Development and Governance**

It is quite a matter of concern that during the democratic rule periods, the government/s of the country do not pay attention to decentralisation of local governments. The same situation holds in Balochistan. In light of this, one conclusion is clear that inclusive development-based governance model does not exist in sample districts of Balochistan. There is also a dearth of suitable human resources in the province and the Balochistan government struggles to find the right man for the right job, especially in the far-off areas. Continued deterioration of law and order situation and a sense of insecurity, is one of the key obstacles in the way of inclusive development. There is a profound influence of local notables, e.g. Maliks, tribal heads, political elites and heads of departments on the public policy and development programmes of the province. Hence, the inclusive development is missing due to over centralisation of power.

After the 18th amendment, appropriate actions have not been taken for further decentralisation up to the district level. A huge mass of the people, especially the deprived groups such as women, youth, ethnic minorities and poor, etc., have not played their role in development planning. These groups are invisible, their voices are not heard, their ideas and their potentials are not considered, they are not seen as partners by the government. In such a situation, it is even more essential that efforts are made to kick-start the process of inclusive development. Similarly, it is necessary to foster greater engagement between the citizens and the government, especially the departments responsible for the provision of basic services.

Local level government bodies such as district councils, tehsil councils, union councils, etc., do not exist at present. As a result, participation of local people in government sponsored local development initiatives is missing. The Joint District Development Committee (JDDC) is a new initiative under the BRACE Programme. It is a highly needed innovative approach for improved inclusive governance. JDDC provides a forum for improving mutual co-ordination and collaboration.
amongst the local stakeholders, including district administration, district line departments, BRSP/NRSP and representatives from LSOs. One key area for JDDC is to avoid duplication of effort, e.g. all village level Community Physical Infrastructure (CPI) schemes are presented at JDDC meetings and approved. JDDC also serves as forum where LSO leaders can raise issues relating to public services, e.g. dysfunctional government facilities, absent government staff, etc.

**Recommendations and Policy Focus**

Keeping in view the study findings, it is highly desirable to introduce inclusive development-based approach in CD-LGRD PFW being developed for Balochistan for sustainable poverty reduction and women’s empowerment. Participation of the people, especially the disadvantaged has to be assured and the PFW must reflect this inclusion. This essentially means that a bottom-up policy design approach should be followed that allows for the participation of the neglected groups in the process of community driven local development. This can happen after the people are organised into their own community institutions and begin to engage with the local authorities.

PFW needs to allow local authorities to engage with the community institutions on a longer-term basis, i.e. the local authorities must have the official mandate (through policy and business rules), resources (through budgetary allocations), and capacities (through human resource development) to fully engage with community institutions. This is an engagement that would lead to women’s empowerment and inclusive development and both these factors will contribute to poverty reduction.

Government departments should be strengthened through a consistent policy of inducting, retaining and competence development of human resource involved in service delivery for basic services (like health, education, skill development, mining, agriculture & livestock, public health engineering, etc).

Government of Balochistan should assign a priority for continuously improving road and digital communications infrastructure within the province. To this end the existing road infrastructure recently developed under CPEC should be leveraged for local industry.

Alongside road and digital infrastructure conducive policies for market development (both local and international) should be introduced to help in selling the outputs in a value-added manner.

Education and literacy, especially for girls, should be assigned top priority in policy, planning, resource allocation and implementation, etc. Gender segregated educational institutions both for boys and girls should be opened at the accessible distance. Besides, adult literacy centres especially for females should be opened. In these literacy centres all the three components of literacy, i.e. basic literacy (Reading, Writing, and Numeracy), life skills-based literacy, and income generation skills literacy should be imparted in an integrated manner.

Social mobilisation strategy should be one of the main pillars of the policy. For without involving the people, no sustainable poverty reduction, women’s empowerment and inclusive development can be impactful and sustainable. CD-LGRD PFW must include detailed provisions and guidelines regarding establishment partnerships with RSPs and community institutions; roles, responsibilities and functions of community institutions; funding for community institutions and development plans prepared by them with local authorities; guidelines and frameworks for assessment of community institutions and monitoring and evaluation of their activities should be introduced. Women’s empowerment process can be accelerated by including more women in the community institutions, building their capacities and supporting their self-identified activities for income generation. Further, women should have opportunities to benefit from adult literacy and numeracy skills (ALNS) programmes, technical and vocational skills training (TVET) programme, awareness raising session on key cross-cutting themes, e.g. health, education, civic rights, nutrition, etc. Market driven income generating activities for women should be supported and efforts should be made to add value to their labour.

---

1 These plans are Micro Investment Plan (MIP) at the household level, Village Development Plan (VDP) at the village level, and Union Council Development Plan (UCDP) at the union council level. Later all the UCDPs would be consolidated at the district level into District Development Plan (DDP).
Existing infrastructure of basic services (health, education, skill development, mining, agriculture & livestock, public health engineering, etc.) should be gradually strengthened in order to fulfil the local community requirements.

Structural changes in local governance such as reinstating of local bodies and capacity development of the local government staff (in the areas of community led development initiative planning, scheme design, scheme monitoring, social mobilisation, etc.), should be the main pillars of the policy. Furthermore, in order to empower these local bodies, powers should be decentralised.

Coordination, collaboration and partnership amongst various development partners, service providers and social organisations should be improved through mutually agreed policy, joint planning and partnership-based implementation and monitoring and evaluation. JDDC should be strengthened, activated and made effective.

These recommendations should be considered for inclusion in the CD-LGRD PFW being developed.

Huge investments are being made by the Government of Pakistan, Government of Balochistan and under the China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) in the province. Other donors are also investing in the province. While most of the investments are being made at the macro-level, EU through the BRACE Programme is investing at the micro level, in mobilising and organising the rural households into their own community institutions. A strategic opportunity exists through CD-LGRD PFW to rollout the approach across all the remaining districts of Balochistan. CD-LGRD PFW can facilitate all stakeholders from macro, meso and micro levels to develop synergies for poverty reduction, inclusive development and women’s empowerment in Balochistan.
1.1. Balochistan Province - An Overview

Around the world, over 700 million people (10% of the world population) are living in extreme poverty and surviving on less than US$1.90 a day\(^1\). 55 million of these individuals live in Pakistan, a country facing challenges on the socio-economic, political and development fronts. As per the latest poverty estimates, 24% of Pakistan's population lives below the national poverty line, 31% of which live in rural areas and 13% in urban areas. Moreover, nationally 38.8% (rural 54.6% : urban 9.4%)\(^2\) of the population are poor based on the multidimensional poverty index (MPI).

Some provinces of Pakistan are progressing more rapidly while others are at the lowest ebb of development. Balochistan is one of the least developed amongst the four provinces of the country. The total population of the province is 12.34 million (male 52.52% : female 47.47%)\(^3\). The rural population is 72.4% while 27.6% live in urban areas. Despite being the least populated province, Balochistan has the second highest rate of multidimensional poverty. Overall, 71% of the population of Balochistan is multidimensionally poor, including 85% of the rural population and 38% of the urban population in the province. Overall, more than 52% of the population lives below the poverty line\(^4\).

In Balochistan, socio-economic indicators of poverty rank comparatively low to the other three provinces of the country. According to the PSLM Survey (2018-2019), the literacy rate of children above the age of ten in Balochistan is 40% (male 54% : female 24%), while the overall literacy rate is 34% and 56% in rural and urban areas, respectively. Moreover, the literacy rate of females living in rural areas is only 17%, whereas the overall national rural female literacy rate of Pakistan is 49%.

Similar to education, health-related indicators of Balochistan are likewise not encouraging. There are a total of 132 hospitals, 574 basic health units, and 93 maternity and child welfare centres across the province. However, 90% of these health facilities do not have doctors who specialise in women’s medicine.

With regards to the environment, Balochistan is prone to natural disasters, such as earthquakes, flooding and droughts. According to the Provincial Disaster Management Authority (PDMA) of Balochistan, the province faced substantial flooding during 2010, 2011 and 2013. Similarly, earthquakes have caused serious structural damage within the districts of the province (i.e. Ziarat in 2008, Washuk in 2013, and Awaran in 2013). The drought-like condition prevailing in the districts of Balochistan has adversely affected the livelihoods of people, which is often cited as one of the causes of poverty in the province.

Furthermore, the lack of women’s empowerment presents serious challenges to the development of the province. The participation of women in the labor force is very low. The lack of inclusive development in the province can be attributed to ineffective governance. Most of the women are not aware of their rights due to the lack of education and illiteracy.

Many development partners are supporting the Government of Balochistan (GoB) in order to address the aforementioned development challenges. The Balochistan Rural Support Programme (BRSP) and National Rural Support Programme (NRSP) are two development partners who are implementing the European Union supported Balochistan Rural Development Programme (EUBRSP) and National Rural Support Programme (NRSP) throughout the province.

---

2. Multidimensional Poverty in Pakistan 2017, UNDP
4. Ibid
& Community Empowerment (BRACE) Programme in nine districts of the province. The primary focus of the BRACE Programme is to help alleviate poverty and improve livelihoods by employing a holistic participatory approach through economic empowerment and inclusive development.

1.1.1. Overview of the BRACE Programme

The BRACE Programme was designed to support the mobilisation of local communities towards reinforced resilience, improved access to basic services, improved livelihoods and economic growth, and to build the capacity of local authorities and the government to partner with communities for effective and efficient service delivery. The BRACE Programme was also designed to assist the development of a strategic policy framework for the institutionalisation of such approaches through a sector-wide approach. Finally, the Programme also aims to provide a platform to GoB and its development partners to create a contextualised and harmonised approach for community-led development.

The key objectives of the BRACE Programme are:

- To empower citizens and communities through providing them with: the means to enable them to implement community-driven socio-economic development interventions; an increased voice and capability to influence public policy decision making through active engagement with local authorities for quality, inclusive, and equitable service delivery; and civic-oversight.

- To foster an environment for strengthening the capacities of local authorities to manage and involve communities in the statutory processes of the local public sector planning, financing and implementation process.

The BRACE Programme’s objectives aim to achieve the following results:

- **ER 1:** Establishment and empowerment of a three-tiered participative system of federated Community Organisations (COs) at community, village and UC levels capable of identifying development needs, prioritising, development planning, resource mobilisation, execution, and operation & maintenance of community infrastructures.

- **ER 2:** Increased capacity of citizens, communities, and marginalised groups, particularly women, to assert their rights and hold local authorities accountable by engaging them in joint participatory development planning and execution for a more relevant and efficient public service delivery.

- **ER 3:** Improved accesses for communities, particularly women and marginalised groups, to high quality public services and benefit from climate-resilient community infrastructures and productive assets, planned, implemented and maintained jointly with local authorities.

- **ER 4:** Engaging members from marginalised groups, such as poor community members (particularly women), Persons with Disabilities (PWDs), minorities, and socially excluded groups, in income generating activities.

- **ER 5:** Experiences on the ground are assessed and disseminated in order to inspire the design of the building blocks of a Local Development Policy Framework (LDPF).

- **ER 6:** Gender inequalities reduced through ensuring the implementation of the recommendations from the gender mainstreaming strategy to be developed by the European Union (EU) Technical Assistance (TA) with support from the Rural Support Programmes (RSPs) and Rural Support Programmes Network (RSPN).

- **ER 7:** Cross-cutting themes envisaged in
the BRACE Programme are mainstreamed, addressed, and effectively reported.

- ER8: Improved capacity of elected members, local government authorities’ staff, and officials of the line departments to involve communities in planning, co-resourcing and managing local development activities.

Each of the end results is envisaged to be achieved through the intervention logic of the BRACE Programme.

The intervention logic of the Programme is about bringing changes to socio-economic conditions at the grassroots level: improvement in health and life expectancy, nutrition, education, literacy (to develop skills in support of economic growth), population size and structure, gender and social relations.

In order to achieve the Programme’s objectives successfully, the Programme intervenes on both the «demand» and «supply» sides of the service delivery equation. It is pertinent to mention that the Programme relies on the Community-Driven Development (CDD) approach of RSPs, to ensure sustainable development. The cornerstone of the RSP approach to CDD is its unique social mobilisation strategy, which aims to build locally-led people’s institutions, for an interface with the government. Once organised, the communities have greater access to local authorities and line departments as a collective unit, giving them a stronger voice to have their demands heard. Communities are mobilised into three tier organisations: Community Organisations (COs) at the neighbourhood level, which are federated into Village Organisations (VOs) at the village level, which are then federated into Local Support Organisations (LSO) at the Union Council. Whereas COs concentrate their work on the individual household and ‘collective’ activities that benefit a group of 15-20 households, LSOs are able to work at a higher level, to link up with local authorities and undertake larger initiatives, due to their large membership and economies of scale. Planning thus takes place at various levels, such as at the household level through Micro Investment Plan (MIP), at the village level (VOs), through Village Development Plans (VDPs), and at the Union Council level, through Union Council Development Plans (UCDPs).

Under the BRACE Programme, in order to bring about sustainable CDD, the organised communities will be made financially viable, through providing the Community Investment Fund (CIF), capacity-building support and linkages with local governments. Community members, especially women, will be provided technical and vocational training and literacy and numeracy skills to increase economic opportunities and employability. The communities will be facilitated to form community institutions which will then build and manage community-level physical infrastructure schemes, and the poorest member households will be provided with Income Generating Grants (IGG) and support to persons with physical disabilities (PWD).

Based on the intervention logic and the CDD approach of the BRACE Programme, the grant component of the Programme is being implemented by three implementing partners, namely the Rural Support Programmes Network (RSPN), NRSP and BRSP in 249 of the union councils of nine districts of Balochistan (Killa Abdullah, Pishin, Zhob, Loralai, Duki, Khuzdar, Jhal Magsi, Kech and Washuk).

The Programme aims to address the policy environment to ensure sustainable CDD in Balochistan. The EU has therefore engaged the services of Human Dynamics (HD), an Austrian company, to support the GoB to foster an enabling environment while strengthening the capacities of local government and authorities to manage and involve communities in the statutory local public sector planning, financing, and implementation processes. Similarly, there is a Public Finance Management (PFM) component within the Programme. The PFM component will assist the GoB to cost and fund the community-led development policy framework, which will be carried out with the technical assistance of the Oxford Policy Management.

The role of generating research evidence for effective policy design is being played by the RSPN, which serves as the strategic network of the RSPs. RSPN has experience of harmonising strategy and implementation approaches across the RSPs. The RSPN will provide support to the RSPs, to build their technical and institutional capacities, provide the necessary support to the TA component in
developing the gender mainstreaming, and support the GoB in delivering the LDPF.

RSPN will play its role by addressing the following areas within BRACE Programme:

- The quality and effectiveness of programme implementation by BRSP & NRSP is improved through ensuring uniform programme implementation approaches and harmonised monitoring, evaluation and reporting mechanisms developed for the BRSP and NRSP.

- Gender inequalities reduced through ensuring implementation of the recommendations from the gender mainstreaming strategy to be developed by the Programme TA with support from the RSPN.

- Evidence-based policy recommendations generated and disseminated to support the LDPF for Balochistan.

- Technical and institutional capacity of BRSP & NRSP enhanced in mainstreaming, addressing and reporting on cross-cutting themes envisaged in the BRACE Programme.

- Achievements, lessons and successful development approaches drawn from the BRACE Programme widely disseminated through developing and implementing harmonised Communication and Visibility Plans.

In order to contribute to area, 3 of the RSPN’s portfolio of the BRACE Programme, RSPN will undertake the research component as defined in the research framework of the Programme. The research framework is comprised of thematic and participatory action research studies.

1.2. Introduction to the Subject Research Study

The research study “Dynamics of Household Poverty and Inclusive Development in Balochistan with Focus on Women’s Empowerment” is scheduled under the participatory action research (PAR) component of the BRACE Programme.

The primary purpose of the study is to provide and disseminate evidence-based findings around poverty dynamics in Balochistan and prepare policy recommendations to support the formulation of a LDPF for the province. Such a policy framework is intended to address the fundamental challenges of poverty alleviation through increased participation and empowerment of women while introducing inclusive development and intensively improved local governance measures for the people and communities of Balochistan.

Furthermore, the research findings will be used to promote evidence-based advocacy and learning with relevant stakeholders, policymakers and donors. Moreover, in the light of the findings, a community development framework for Balochistan will be prepared.

1.3. Rationale of the Study

Despite the serious challenge with poverty in Balochistan province, no comprehensive research has been conducted to ascertain the poverty push and pull factors, the status of women’s empowerment, social mobilisation, or inclusive development. This research study is therefore vitally important to address these issues.

Secondly, the policy-making, planning and implementation etc. in Balochistan is not research-based. As a result, the government policy, planning, and implementation of the programmes and schemes cannot achieve the goals and targets set forth. In most of the cases, the public could not benefit from the development programmes and schemes introduced by the government. Furthermore, this research is also important due to the fact that it will guide policymakers, planners and implementers to take better initiatives for benefits of the local communities.

Thirdly, the subject research study may also guide the international development partners, Government Departments, NGOs and other local organisations to improve their implementations of programmes in the light of study findings.

1.4. Objectives of the Study

The main objectives of this study are as follows:
To identify poverty push and pull factors for households (HH) and individuals in the selected districts of Balochistan.

To ascertain the likelihood of poverty push and pull events.

To assess the status of women’s empowerment in the selected districts.

To identify the determinants of inclusive development with respect to various dimensions (i.e. human, financial, natural, social and physical resources).

To assess the contribution, services and effectiveness of the functioning of the various Government Departments, the development of local communities, and the empowerment of women.

To highlight the role of social mobilisation for inclusive development.

To generate evidence-based research findings to be used to promote evidence-based advocacy and learning with relevant stakeholders, policy makers and donors.

1.5. Research Questions

The nine, basic research questions used in the study are:

- What events increase an individual’s likelihood of entering and exiting poverty?

- What is the likelihood of entering and exiting poverty given these different events?

- What is the impact of women’s empowerment on HH poverty dynamics?

- What are the determinants of inclusive development with respect to various dimensions (i.e. human resources, financial resources, natural resources, social and physical resources)?

- What can be done in view of the findings, including recommendations that are both practical and contextualised to Balochistan?

- What governance arrangements and structural changes best empower local communities and women to shape development in their area?

- What are the socio-economic drivers of inclusive development and how do these drivers help in the eradication of discrimination and alienation?

- What role does social mobilisation play in sustainably ensuring inclusive development?

- How could the findings and recommendations best serve the study purpose?
02 METHODOLOGY
2.1. **Overview of the Steps Taken for Study Design and Implementation**

The steps taken to conduct this research study are given below. Step-by-step details of the study methodology are given in the next section.

**Step 1: Literature Review**
A thorough literature review was conducted in the areas of poverty, women's empowerment, inclusive development and social mobilisation. Various frameworks for all the domains of research were consulted. Literature gaps were identified, and a consolidated literature review was used for designing the conceptual framework of the study in accordance with the study purpose.

**Step 2: Conceptual Framework Design and Approval**
The design of the conceptual framework is an important step of the study. The conceptual framework design covered aspects including dimensions of poverty dynamics, women's empowerment, inclusive development and social mobilisation. It also includes the identification of study respondents based on various dimensions of the study areas, tools and methods to be used to collect data from the identified respondents and co-relating dimensions in various areas for the data analysis process. Similarly, the conceptual framework also identified various levels of data collection (individual, household and community), as per the dimension of the research area.

**Step 3: Design of Data Collection Tools**
Data collection instruments were developed as per the study design. Data collection tools were then approved by the stakeholders of the study.

**Step 4: Compilation and Approval of Inception Report**
An inception report carrying details about the study methodology, sampling plan and sample size, implementation plan in the field for data collection, data collection tools, data analysis and report compilation procedures, was presented to the RSPN for final approval.

**Step 5: Data Collection from the Field**
The data collection exercise was started from Loralai district. Loralai was taken as a pilot district, and a report of findings from the district was prepared. The feedback about data collection quality and administrative measures taken to improve upon the efficiency of field data collection was incorporated in the data collection plan of the next two districts. Subsequently, data from the next two districts (i.e. Khuzdar and Kech) was collected.

**Step 6: Data Entry (Quantitative and Qualitative) and Analysis**
During this step quantitative data was extracted from the tablets and analysed. Based on the research questions, required tables from the SES data were generated. Similarly, qualitative data was entered in a MS-Excel environment for conducting theme and narrative based analysis.

**Step 7: Preparation and Submission of Report**
Draft study report was prepared and shared with the RSPN for feedback/expert’s comments.

**Step 8: Addressing the Comments on Report**
In light of the comments, the second draft of the report was prepared and shared with the RSPN.

**Step 9: Preparation of Research Paper and Policy Briefs**
In light of the research findings, policy briefs and research papers were prepared with an objective to resolve the issues and challenges (highlighted in the research) to improve the socio-economic status of the people of Balochistan.
2.2. Detailed Methodology for Study Design and Implementation

2.2.1. Literature Review

i. Literature Review Related to Poverty Dynamics

As identified in the literature review (while being mainly focusing on the dynamics of household poverty in Pakistan), poverty reduction has not been sustainable but has instead fluctuated remarkably, and a large proportion of the population has been found around the poverty line (almost 38% immediately above and below)\(^5\), and any micro and/or macro shock (positive or negative) is likely to push them into poverty or pull them out of it.\(^6\)

Furthermore, the literature review has helped in identifying several factors associated with the dynamics of household poverty. The changing socio-economic and demographic characteristics of the household have been considered as the key drivers of chronic and transient poverty. Regarding the demographic characteristics, a larger household size or dependency ratio are associated with persistent poverty, as it puts an extra burden on a household’s assets and resource base (Jayaraman and Findeis, 2005; Ssewanyana, 2009).

Changes in household size and age structures (young, adult and elderly) are also linked with the movements into and out of poverty because of their distinct economic consequences\(^7\). Additional children not only raise the likelihood of a household to fall into poverty, but it also leads to the intergenerational transmission of poverty due to reduction in school attendance of children with a regressive impact on poorer households (Orbeta, 2005). Households headed by a female are more likely to be chronically poor (John and Andrew, 2003). The majority of these women are serially dispossessed (divorced then widowed), which may therefore promote intergenerational poverty (Corta and Magongo, 2011). The male-oriented customary inheritance system also puts females at disadvantageous position (Miller et al., 2011). Academic findings show that limited control over household income and assets, food, healthcare, education and other opportunities which characterise poverty, affect women more than men. In contrast, women’s efforts to overcome poverty are further constrained by discrimination in access to these resources.

Chronic and transient poverty are closely linked with the tangible and less-tangible composition of assets of the households (Davis, 2011). Poverty can be viewed in terms of land ownership (Jalan and Ravallion, 2000; Arif et al., 2011), livestock ownership (Davis, 2011), possession of liquid assets (Wlodzimierz, 1999), remittances (Arif et al., 2011) and access to water, sanitation, electricity and the ability to effectively invest on land (Cooper, 2010). Mobility in land ownership is highly linked with transient poverty (Hossain and Bayes, 2010), as the amount of received land from parents is a significant predictor to remain non-poor (Davis, 2011).

Location also plays a vital role in the opportunities available to households. Households living in rural and remote areas with less infrastructure and other necessary facilities are more likely to be chronic and transient poor (Arif et al., 2011; Deshingkar, 2010). The National Poverty Report 2015-16 highlights that every third person living in a rural area is poor. Asset-less households are more likely to fall into poverty if the economy is not doing well or the distribution of assets is highly unequal (Hossain and Bayes, 2010). Poverty is not a static condition, as the poverty status of people generally changes over time as they move into or out of poverty\(^8\). Given the multidimensional and complex nature of household poverty dynamics, it always requires multiple frameworks, methods, indices and analytical patterns to recognise and define the household poverty dynamics for specific communities.

ii. Literature Review for Women’s Empowerment

Empowering women and supporting gender equality is at the heart of the BRACE Programme. Empowerment is a debated term which has been ascribed a wide variety of meanings and definitions in varying socio-economic contexts (Malhotra et al.,

---

\(^5\) National Poverty Report 2015-16, Planning Commission of Pakistan

\(^6\) Dynamics of Rural Poverty in Pakistan: Evidence from Three Waves of the Panel Survey G. M. Arif & Shujaat Farooq

\(^7\) Bloom et al., 2002
Figure 1: Women’s Empowerment Key Areas

Source: Veneklasen And Miller Framework and Index Of Women Empowerment

2002). The concept of empowerment is related to many terms such as agency, autonomy, association, self-direction, self-determination, liberation, self-confidence, participation and mobilisation (Narayan 2005).

VeneKlasen and Miller (2002) define women’s empowerment as a process whereby the lives of women and girls are transformed from a situation where they have limited power to one where their power is enhanced. This framework proposed by VeneKlasen and Miller (2002) recognises three levels at which change can take place: personal, relational and environmental.

Changes at the personal level take place within the person. This refers to changes in how a woman sees herself, how she considers her role in society and that of other women, how she sees her economic role, and her confidence in deciding and taking actions that concern herself and other women.

Changes at the relational level take place in the relationships and power relations within the woman’s surrounding network. This includes changes both within the household and within the community, and encompasses markets, local authorities and decision-makers.

Finally, changes at the environmental level take place in the broader context. These can be simple changes, such as in the social norms, attitudes and beliefs of broader society, or they can be formal changes in the political and legislative framework.

For the purpose of this study, the VeneKlasen and Miller (2002) framework for empowerment will be used as a reference in order to map the change in women’s empowerment at all the three levels, so that the relational and community context of empowerment can also be tracked.

By applying this framework to the study’s methods, we were able to understand the dynamics of household poverty with a gender lens, the significant barriers for women and girls on individual development and the complexity of power relations in the context of Balochistan.

iii. Literature Review for Inclusive Development

The knowledge of two components has characterised the conceptual understanding of inclusive development. First, the distinction between growth and development; and second, the term ‘inclusive’ (Kanbur and Rauniyar, 2009). While economic growth is easier to define and measure through monetary indicators, specifying

---

8 Agency and Empowerment-A proposal for internationally comparable indicators (OPHI working paper series)
11 http://pubs.iied.org/pdfs/G01985.pdf
what makes development ‘inclusive’ is much more contentious (AFDB, 2016).

The concept of inclusive development is a relatively new term in the field of development studies (Ali and Zhuang, 2007) and there is no consensus on a standard definition (Rauniyar and Kanbur, 2009). Whereas some scholars define inclusive development as a “process that occurs when social and material benefits are equitably distributed across divides in society” (Hikey, 2015), other experts focus on the “voice and power to the concerns and aspirations of otherwise excluded groups” (Johnson and Anderson 2012). Inclusive development also has an “integral focus on the achievement of equity and the rights of citizenship” (Hickey, 2013). This general definition primarily represents the meaning of the concept of inclusive development, knowing that these benefits necessarily comprise not only economic and material gains, but also the enhanced well-being widely experienced. Inclusive development has the following dimensions:

a. **Social inclusion, Exclusion and Participation**

The UNDP states that social inclusion enhances capabilities, broadens social ties of respect and recognition, and at the collective level, enhances social bonds, cohesion, integration and solidarity (UNDP, 2015). Social inclusion is, for example, influenced by “what institutions exist, on how they change, and on how they exclude and include people in social relations and interactions” (Johnson and Anderson 2015).

 Discrimination against women is a global issue that leads to social exclusion, as even in developed nations, women experience bias due to their gender. In developing countries like Pakistan, gender discrimination and social exclusion are more rampant in both rural as well as urban areas.

b. **Poverty and Distribution**

Reduction of income inequalities among the population and continued human development are the core pillars of the poverty and distribution dimension of inclusive development. Similarly, the notion of access to capital and financial resources (financial inclusion), access to social capital and civil society (social inclusion) and productive linkages and networks makes another important ingredient of this dimension.

c. **Political Dimension**

Menocal (2017) has maintained that the main challenge in promoting growth and more inclusive development are often not technical or even financial, but political. Political dynamics include both structural factors such as the legacy of colonialism, the distribution of power in society and the nature of elite settlements, as well as the role of individual and collective state actors (Hickey, 2013). The purpose of institutions has been similarly shown to be essential in shaping the nature of development outcomes (Acemoglu and Robinson 2012). External actors and international dynamics can also play a crucial role in determining the prospects for more inclusive growth. Although there are diverging perspectives on the part of politics in development, there is a consensus that politics heavily influences the opportunities of inclusive development.

d. **The Environmental Dimension**

Inclusive development has a strong correlation with the ecological component (Gupta J, Pouw N, Ros Tonen N, 2015). The extremely poor and vulnerable often depend upon “local resources (soil, forests, fish, water, etc.) and are vulnerable to land, water, fish and carbon credit grabbing” (Gupta et al., 2015). Large groups of vulnerable people are therefore at risk of falling into poverty, particularly marginalised rural populations. Rural households frequently face major interrelated shocks such as good or bad harvests. The well-being of all people is therefore closely related to continual investment in maintaining ecosystem services (Chopra et al., 2005). In much of the developing world, women participate in economic activities like farming, fishing, and selling fruits and other produce, alongside additional responsibility for domestic tasks like cooking, gathering wood for fuel, hauling water, nurturing and caring for children, and tending to elderly members of the household. Given the wide range of women’s daily interactions with the environment to meet household needs, they are often those most keenly affected by its degradation (Justine Sass, 2002).
iv. Literature Review for Community Mobilisation, Inclusive Development and Women’s Empowerment

The multi-layered realities of poverty and exclusion diminish feelings of empowerment, heightening a sense of risk associated with engaging in processes of development (Pieterse 2008). Community mobilisation and organisation of self-help groups is one of the fundamental approaches for triggering social inclusion, women’s participation and empowerment. Social mobilisation is a pre-requisite for community development, and it requires some specific characteristics such as homogeneity of individuals with common interests, the commonality of needs, frequent opportunity and collective strength. It has been evident that men’s and women’s participation and social organisation has been achieved through social mobilisation in many different settings and across various regions of the globe, including the Asia Pacific as well as Africa. Social mobilisation has the essential ingredient of translating collectivism into agency and social cohesion. Such collectivism can therefore lift men and women out of poverty.

2.2.2. Identification of Research Gap

Poverty in Pakistan has been studied by the Pakistan Institute of Development Economics (PIDE) under its poverty dynamics research series. These studies range from secondary data-based research publications to three-wave panel study-based researches conducted by the PIDE from 1960 to 2013. The latest research in this regard is the Multi-Dimensional Poverty Index (MPI) 2017. Subsequently, the computation of MPI 2017 was carried out by the Planning Commission of Pakistan and the UNDP jointly.

Moreover, some other institutions and organisations such as the World Bank, Asian Development Bank, Centre for Chronic Poverty and British Household Panel Survey (amongst others) have been actively involved in studying the dynamics of poverty the world over including Pakistan, using different approaches, methods and indices.

Similarly, literature and research reviews about women’s empowerment, social mobilisation and inclusive development have been conducted extensively. Studies related to these topics from Balochistan, central Asian states and other regions of the world were reviewed.

Some of the significant gaps identified in the above studies, specifically in the context of Pakistan, are as follows:

I. Although existing poverty dynamics literature in Pakistan is prolific, the causes and factors of poverty, their correlation, as well as in depth analysis of the push and pull factors across the country are missing.

II. The existing poverty related literature is mostly based on one-time studies. No longitudinal study was conducted in the past except one that is “Dynamics of Rural Poverty in Pakistan: Evidence from Three Waves of the Panel Survey” (Arif, G. M. and Farooq, S. 2012).

III. Various demographic factors, primarily household size and dependency ratio, have a significant correlation with poverty. However, the in-depth analysis and the correlation between household size and dependency ratio with poverty are almost missing in the above-mentioned studies, specifically in Balochistan context.

IV. Economic variables including the ownership of land and livestock, housing structure (pacca) and the availability of number of rooms have a significant impact on poverty. The existing literature does not provide sufficient evidences to explain this co-relationship.

V. Education and literacy greatly contribute to poverty reduction. However, following are the major gaps in this regard especially in Balochistan context;

a.) Qualitative research in education, literacy and skill development (especially related to the role of female education and skill literacy) for poverty reduction is almost totally missing in the Balochistan context. Particular focus is required on gathering evidence about the contribution of

---

12 Efficacy in Action: Mobilising Community Participation for Inclusive Urban Development Wayne Shand, November 2017

13 http://shodhganga.inflibnet.ac.in/bitstream/10603/21283/13/13_chapter%205.pdf
women's education and skill development to poverty reduction, amidst a lower rate of female participation in employment and income generation activities, especially in Balochistan.

b.) This research gap also extends to female-headed households, which are more vulnerable to fall into a transient, as well as chronic, poverty trap. Therefore, research evidence is required to establish how women's skill development and education can ensure productive and remunerative employment amongst women.

VI. The role of women's empowerment in terms of employment generation, poverty reduction and gender participation, which is largely uncovered in the existing literature, especially in the context of Balochistan.

VII. The role of inclusive development in Balochistan province is missing from the existing literature, especially its different dimensions such as social, political, economic and environmental, and their relationship with poverty push and pull factors.

VIII. The role of service delivery institutions as well as the governance system also requires further inquiry and in-depth research in the context of poverty in rural Balochistan populations.

IX. Social mobilisation and policy direction on poverty reduction in Balochistan is missing from the literature.

X. The policy direction about poverty reduction in Balochistan has not been able to take an indigenous view about the province in the recent past. The poverty reduction strategy adopted by the Government during 2003 rests upon engendering growth, managing scarce water resources, governance reforms, increasing the focus on improving human development, and addressing vulnerability to shocks, but it is in need of updating. The most recent poverty reduction strategy introduced by the Pakistan Poverty Alleviation Fund (social safety net-based organisation) during 2011, focused on institutional building at community and apex level, integrated participatory development strategies (social, economic, environmental), and private and public investment. Both of these strategies have taken in to account poverty reduction through consultative processes, but rural female viewpoints were neither researched nor considered during strategy formation. Therefore, the subject research at hand will support the evidence generation for developing a directional and indigenous women and social development policy for the province.

2.2.3. Development of Conceptual Framework

A consultative approach was adopted by Momentum Venture (MV) to develop the study design (i.e. conceptual and methodological framework). The process started with a comprehensive understanding of study Terms of Reference (TORs), a desk review of the existing literature, and a study of BRACE Programme documents. As a next step, consultative meetings with the BRACE Programme team, consultants and senior management of RSPN were held. Moreover, technical assistance was also acquired from Germany, including the Centre for Evaluation & Development and the University of Mannheim. Based on their inputs and comments, the conceptual framework for the study was developed (Figure 2, next page).

As evident from Figure 2, the conceptual framework has two core areas (i.e. poverty factors as one area, as well as women's empowerment and inclusive development as another). Each of the core areas is further broken down into various dimensions. Consequently, there are specific dimensions for poverty factors, women's empowerment and inclusive development. At the bottom of the framework rests the role of governance and institutions in addressing various components of the research study (i.e. poverty factors, women’s empowerment and inclusive development). Similarly, the framework depicts three multiple levels (for research inquiry) from which the primary data must be collected to capture the viewpoint of each level (i.e. individual, household and community).

The conceptual framework of the study was
designed to address the purpose of the research in a manner that should serve as a guiding force for identifying the set of variables through the operationalisation for all the research areas, including identifying the most relevant respondents, choosing the correct research methods, and designing the effective research instruments for data collection. Similarly, the conceptual framework has been the key to conduct data analysis and triangulation for compiling the study results.

**i. Operationalisation of Conceptual Framework through Dimensional Indicators/Sub Indicators**

The dimensional indicators/sub indicators for the three different levels (i.e. individual, household and community) have been proposed with an objective to develop appropriate research methods and data collection tools (Figure 3).

- **Poverty Dimension Indicators/Sub-Indicators**
  - The critical determinants which either pull households out of poverty or push households into poverty may exist across any of the human, financial, natural, social and physical resources. Therefore, all of these determinants were considered while developing research questions about poverty dynamics. A list of important poverty indicators and sub-indicators that were used as markers of discussion during household and community level data collection is given in...
Table 1. However, the indicators given were not exclusive and the study was open to integrate any forthcoming variables from the field.

b. **Women’s Empowerment Indicators/Sub-Indicators**

Indicators and variables for women’s empowerment as per the dimensions of the conceptual framework and VeneKlasen and Miller’s framework were used to develop the study questionnaires. Various indicators of personal, relational and environmental empowerment were included in the research, as given in Table 2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1: Dimensions of Household Level Social and Economic Resources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Human Resources</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational level of household’s head &amp; members</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Size of the household and ratio of dependents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permanent disability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health status of household’s members</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Status of self-employment and employment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital status of household members</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Inclusive Development Indicators/Sub-Indicators

Based on the literature review and research questions, different variables of inclusive development and growth (i.e. poverty, income & distribution; access to financial and land capital; social, political and environmental inclusion), were included to design the study instrument. An overview of different indicators used for generating findings related to inclusive development are given in Table 3.

### Table 2: Women’s Empowerment Indicators/Sub-Indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimensions of Women’s Empowerment</th>
<th>Indicators of Women Empowerment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Power within</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-esteem</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-confidence / Self-efficacy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Articulateness / Confidence</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal autonomy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Power to</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual capacity (application of knowledge)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge / Access to information</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Income</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Power with</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social capital</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participation in community groups</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level of support provided by groups own initiatives</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Power over</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political participation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attitude and beliefs of people around support to women’s rights</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attitude and beliefs of males inside HH (brothers, husbands, uncles, fathers, sons)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attitude and beliefs of community leaders to support women’s access to courts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Degree of influence in governing the community institutions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental / Political &amp; legal dimension of empowerment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accessibility of legal services</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stereotypes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to influence at political level</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to advocate change for other women</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality of legal services</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety of movement outside the home</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 3: Inclusive Development Indicators/Sub-Indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimensions of Inclusive Development</th>
<th>Indicators of Inclusive Development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Poverty, income &amp; distribution, access to financial and land capital</td>
<td>Reduction of income inequalities among women.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Income and distribution, access of women and marginalised groups to natural resources (land, forests, mines etc.) for livelihood and income.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social inclusion</td>
<td>Social inclusion and integration of women and marginalised groups.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political inclusion</td>
<td>Politic/legal focus on the inclusion of women/vulnerable groups; nature of ethnici-ty-based beliefs and practices within elite/ethnic settlements; role of individual and collective state actors for promoting inclusion.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental inclusion</td>
<td>Prevention and safeguarding (by the Government or any other agency) from hazards and environmental shocks that may push the HH into poverty; continual investment in maintaining ecosystem services by the Government or other actors/agents.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
d. Social Mobilisation Indicators/Sub-Indicators:

The indicators of social mobilisation include social organisation & social collateral, community development, Women’s empowerment, participation and agency, collectivism, awareness and commonality of purpose.

2.3. Study Sampling

Socio-economic disparities between regions are due to a variety of factors, prominent in nature and embedded within the social, economic, cultural, historical, political, and environmental factors.

BRACE interventions are being implemented in nine districts of Balochistan lying in various ethnic and ecological zones. Therefore, in sample two villages are from Loralai while two from Duki Agricultural ecological variation can also be observed for the intervention districts. Similarly, there is a variation in the natural disaster patterns within various zones of the province where interventions are being implemented. All these factors contribute to the socio-economic status of households and communities in these districts. Taking these facts into consideration, it is essential to define the basis of sampling purposively.

A multi-stage purposive random sampling method was used to draw the sample for the study. At the first stage, the province was divided (according to

---

Table 4: Social Mobilisation Indicators/Sub-Indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimensions</th>
<th>Indicators of Social Mobilisation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Social organisation &amp; social collateral</td>
<td>Women’s organisations and social associations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community development</td>
<td>Pooling and sharing social and referral resources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women’s empowerment, participation and agency</td>
<td>Self-help/self-initiative or intervention-based community development initiatives for community prosperity, problem solving related to access to basic social services, economic development etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collectivism, awareness and commonality of purpose</td>
<td>Women’s empowerment, increased participation, increased self-awareness, agency, improved acceptance within HH and community, increased access to finance, income, skill development, HH and community decision-making, political process participation etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Collective action based upon awareness and resourcefulness, and collective actions for achieving individual and common purpose.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 4: Selection of Study Districts Using Map of Balochistan

Source: Survey of Pakistan

RSP intervention districts) into three major zones i.e. North (Killa Abdullah, Pishin, Zhob, Loralai & Duki), East (Jhal Magsi, & Khuzdar); and South (Washuk & Kech)

At the second stage, from each identified zone a sample district was selected. Purposefully, in each zone only one district, based on lower socio-economic indicators, was selected. The selected districts within the identified zone of the province, were chosen based on the MPI value and poverty incidence.

---

14 This Programme was started in eight districts of Balochistan. Later district Loralai was divided into two districts and its tehsil Duki was notified as a separate district by GoB.
Therefore, Loralai (HDI 0.320, poverty incidence 68.5%), Khuzdar (HDI 0.285, poverty incidence 57.5%), and Kech districts were included in the study design. This district selection justifies the purpose-oriented basis for study sampling. These districts represent different parts of Balochistan (northern, central and southern parts of the province) as well as diverse ethnic backgrounds, thus representing the dynamic culture, values and pattern of life in Balochistan. Examples of the diversity in ethnic background are the Pakhtuns in Loralai district, and the Baloch culture primarily in Khuzdar and Kech districts. The diverse regional climate, agriculture and overall external environmental factors of the three districts make them dynamic as well.

2.3.1. Sampling of Union Councils (UCs) and Villages

In each of the selected districts, two UCs were randomly selected, from which two villages were included in the sample on a random basis. Hence, a total of four villages were selected from each district. A purposive and convenience basis for selection of UCs and villages were used to include the villages in the sampling frame.

i. An Overview of Sampled Villages

a. Villages of Khuzdar District

Khuzdar district is located in the centre of Balochistan province. The headquarter of district is Khuzdar town, which is situated on national highway at about a distance of 300 km from Quetta.

Four villages i.e. Kili Yar Muhammad, Hinar Noghey, Killi Mamojo and Sabzal Khanzai were included from Khuzdar district in the subject study. These villages are at an average distance of 48 KMs from Khuzdar city. All these villages are connected to the national highway through metal roads, which are poorly maintained. Road access in the immediate surrounding of the villages is not easy.

Each village has an average of 110 to 140 households. As far facilities of the villages are concerned, all the villages either have a primary school or a high school. Sabzal Khanzai has a primary school which is not functional for quite some time. Killi Yar Muhammad village has functional primary schools for both boys and girls. Killi Mamojo and Hinar Noghey villages have high schools for boys. However, Killi Mamojo has a high school for girls closer to its vicinity. There are challenges of access to school facilities for both boys and girls in these villages due to which about a considerable proportion i.e. 46% to 89%15, of children of school age are out of school. Similarly, adult literacy rate of these villages ranges from 23% to 43%16.

The state of access to health facilities is also not encouraging for these villages also. Only, Killi Mamojo has a basic health unit, but this unit is non-functional. Rest of the villages have no government owned or private health facility at all. People of these villages mostly go to Khuzdar city for their medical treatment. Agriculture and livestock are the main sources of earning a livelihood. About 86% to 97%17 of the people in these villages are landless, hence most of the cultivatable land is owned by a few landlords.

PRA data reveals that drought and lack of availability of water for agriculture usage are the key challenges for gaining a value-added agriculture output. Karez had been main source of irrigation. Non-functioning of Karez has badly hit the agricultural production. Rain and ground water have become the sole source of water for agriculture. Furthermore, there is a lack of rainwater storage facility in all these villages. Water supply schemes of the government are not available in any of the villages. Solar panel-based tube wells are installed by some of the households on self-help basis.

Electricity is provided (through national grid) to only one village (out of four) i.e. Killi Mamojo. Other villages use solar panels to fulfill their power needs. However, solar panels are only used by well to do households.

As far as social mobilisation based activities of BRACE Programme are concerned, all the sample villages of Khuzdar district have COs and VOs
for both men and women. About 66% of the HH of these villages were organised through social mobilisation activities.

**b. Villages of Loralai District**

Loralai is a historical district located in the northeast of Balochistan. Loralai attained district status in the year 1903. The district has a total population of 397,400 (53.46% male and that of 46.53% female). The district has a population growth rate at 2.46% per year. Predominantly 83.6% of the district population lives in rural areas as compared to only 16.34% living in the Urban settlements. Loralai, is one of the poorest districts of Balochistan, with a poverty incidence of 68.5% and that of 46.7% of severity.

The sample covered from district Loralai include villages; Khaskai Nushkel, Mara Khurad Malak Fateh Muhammad, Yaro Shehar and Malak Muhammad Jan. The average distance of these villages from Loralai city is 70 Kms. Villages are connected to main routes through non-metal roads. An average of 98 HH exist in each village, whereas the average household size ranges from 10 to 12 persons.

Adult literacy rate of these villages ranges from 2.84% to 16.3% (Khaskai Nushkel 5.23%, Mara Khurad Malak Fateh Muhammad 2.84%, Yaro Shehar 16.39% and Malak Muhammad Jan 6.14%). Availability of education facilities is not encouraging in these villages. Only Yaro Shar village has a primary school for girls and none of

---

**Table 5: Sampling Matrix**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S/No</th>
<th>Data Collection Tools</th>
<th>Purpose of the Tool</th>
<th>Source of Information</th>
<th>Actual Sample Collected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Poverty Score Card</td>
<td>Identification of the HH against poverty ranks</td>
<td>HH Head only</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(quantitative data tool)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Socio Economic Survey</td>
<td>Socio-economic profiling of the selected HH</td>
<td>HH Head only</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(quantitative data tool)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Life History Interview</td>
<td>Individual and HH level perspective of poverty dynamics, women’s empowerment and inclusive development, social mobilisation and governance.</td>
<td>1 LHI of Male &amp; 1 Female (Individual Level), Adults (men or married women).</td>
<td>288 with women &amp; 288 with men</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(LHI)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Focus Group Discussion</td>
<td>Community level perspective of poverty dynamics, women’s empowerment and inclusive development, social mobilisation and governance.</td>
<td>2 FGD with Male &amp; 1 Female in each village (Community Level)</td>
<td>24 FGDs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(FGDs)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Consultative Meetings</td>
<td>Govt policy, strategy, planning, to be addressed by the study</td>
<td>Government Officials (men &amp; women) from LGRD, P&amp;D, Agriculture and Livestock, Women Development Department, Social Welfare, Education and Health, and RSPN/RSP staff</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Participatory Rural Appraisal (PRA) &amp; Community Profiling</td>
<td>To incorporate the knowledge and opinions of study population in the planning and management for development projects and programmes</td>
<td>Male Community Members</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

18 Population census of Pakistan 2017
19 Ibid
20 Population census of Pakistan 2017
21 UNDP multidimensional poverty index report 2017
22 BRACE Programme secondary data
23 Ibid
other villages have girls’ school. Each of village has either a primary or a high school for boys. However, primary school in Mara Khurad Malak Fateh Muhammad is closed due to non-availability of teacher. About 54% of the school age children in these villages are out of school.

None of the villages have a medical facility except Yaro Shar, where a basic health unit is functional. People of all other villages go to Dukki or Loralai for their health-related problems. Government has not provided water supply to these villages except Yaro Shar. Water requirements for HH and agriculture purpose are fulfilled through solar based water pumps. It is worth mentioning that these solar based water pumps are mainly installed in HH of richest people in these villages. All the sample villages of district Loralai are connected to national grid for electricity, whereas Mara Khurd is an exception in this context.

Agriculture and livestock are the main sources of income. However, trading, public and private employment are other sources of livelihood of people of these villages. Semi-skilled labour based private jobs in mining and construction sectors help in providing income for a small proportion of population of these villages.

The process of social capital formation and harnessing potential of the local communities has started in the sample villages through social mobilisation. All the villages have COs and Vos for both men and women. However, female COs and VOs in Mara Khurd are yet to be organised and activated. The activities of social mobilisation are being undertaken in all the sample villages of district Loralai.

### c. Villages of Kech District

Kech district is located, in the south west part of Balochistan province. Kech attained the status of district in 1977. Gichki, Nausherwani and Hoth are the main tribes of the district. Total population of district Kech is 909,116. Out of total population of the district 54.39% is male whereas 45.61% is female.

Villages including Meer Nizar Muhammad Bazar Solband Ward, Baloch Abad Ward, Kunchiti Mashriqi, Peerani Lamb, were taken from district Kech. All these villages are located at 45 to 55 Kms from the district headquarter. Mainly access to these villages is provided through a metal road. However, the link road leading from main road to the villages is mostly Kacha (non-metaled).

The literacy rate of these villages of district Kech range from as low as 5% for village Balochabad to 50% for village Nazar Muhammad Ward. As far education facilities and services are concerned all the sample villages have school facilities for boys and girls (except for Peerani Lamb where separate education facility for girls is missing). However, in village Balochabad the school is available (building constructed in 2016) but it is non-functional due to non-availability of teachers, as per PRA data of the research. None of the villages have skill development or adult literacy centres.

Villages Meer Nizar Muhammad Bazar Solband Ward, Baloch Abad Ward and Kunchiti Mashriqi have basic health units. However, BHU of Meer Nizar Muhammad is not located at an easily accessible distance from the village. No BHU facility is provided by the government in Peerani Lamb. All the BHUs in villages are provided by the services of para medical staff and none of the BHUs have qualified doctors, as per PRA data.

All the villages have electricity provision by the government except for village Peerani Lamb. Solar based green energy arrangements also exist for fulfilling water requirements. Similarly, all the villages have been provided with water supply by the government excluding Peerani Lamb.

Agriculture, livestock, trading based small business and government employment are main sources of earning for the population of these villages. All the villages have been organised with male and female COs, under BRACE Programme. However, male and female VOs are being organised. Capacity building initiatives for social capital formation and skill development programmes are being initiated also.

---

24 PRA data of research
25 BRACE Programme secondary data
26 Population census of Pakistan 2017
27 Ibid
For further details please refer to the infographic details of village profile in figure 5.

2.3.2. Sampling of Households for PSC, SES and Life History Interviews (LHIs)

From each village a sample of 18 households was selected for inclusion into the study. The LHI method was used along-with 30% of the reserve sample in case of unavailability or unwillingness of the selected household for the interviews.

Purposely, all the households having a poverty scorecard ranking between 0-100 were considered for the sampling frame. Representative samples from all the poverty score ranges (i.e. 0-11, 12-18, 18-23, 24-50 and 51-100) were taken in order to serve the purpose of the study, from each representative village. In the event where the number of households with the required PSC were not found in sampled village(s), geographically adjacent village(s) were included (as in the case of Kech district) for arriving at the required sampled number of households. PSC and SES data were collected for all the sampled villages, in order to include households with a specific PSC in the study, as per sampling plan. Sampled households from score ranges 0-11 and 12-18, provided a basis for assessing poverty dynamics (determined by the change in poverty score over time, or during the three waves of the study) considering individual, household and community level factors. This assessment helped understand the factors which pull the poor households out of poverty or push the better-off households into poverty.

Similarly, for assessing the changes in inclusive development over time (dynamics of inclusiveness), three indicators were highlighted (based upon the literature review and secondary data for various socio-economic indicators of Balochistan): women’s participation in the labour force, access to social groups by gender, and participation of the sampled households in the political and social domains. Again three-level factors: individual, household and community, were used to explain the dynamics of inclusive development. The data on changes in poverty scorecard overtime can also be a useful indicator to explain the inclusiveness. The movement from the lowest ranges to higher ranges indicates that the development includes the poorest segments of the population.

2.3.3. Sampling for Focus Group Discussions

A purely random sampling basis was used to select participants for FGDs. However, other considerations such as the poverty scorecard and basis of sampling remained the same. Taking into consideration the overall dynamics of the districts, a specific mix of FGDs were conducted based upon the poverty score categories. Two FGDs (one with male and the other with female members) were conducted in each selected village. A minimum of nine and maximum of thirteen participants provided their feedback during FGDs at various locations.

2.3.4. Sampling for Consultative Meetings with Governance & BRACE Programme Stakeholders

Whilst considering the study design, the data from service delivery departments of the government working at district level was crucial. Therefore, governance stakeholders were included in the primary data collection process as per the purposive sampling approach. At district and tehsil level, departments including LG&RD, P&D, Agriculture and Livestock, Women Development, Social Welfare, and Education and Health, were included in the consultative meetings. Other departments related to literacy, education and social safety provision like NCHD and BISP were also included in the consultative meetings.

A total number of three consultative meetings were conducted with the above-mentioned stakeholders, whereby 16 to 18 participants provided their feedback of various research dimensions.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Areas</th>
<th>Pop.</th>
<th>Houshold Size</th>
<th>Major Casts</th>
<th>Literacy (%)</th>
<th>No. Of Schools</th>
<th>School Going (%)</th>
<th>Income Sources</th>
<th>Income Non-Poor &amp; Chronic Poor(PKR)</th>
<th>Dist From City (KM)</th>
<th>Access to the Road</th>
<th>Post office</th>
<th>No. of TVs</th>
<th>Mobile Phone ownership (%)</th>
<th>Utilities</th>
<th>Latrines</th>
<th>Health Unit</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Khuzdar</td>
<td>991</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Baloch</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>&gt;13,000</td>
<td>&lt;4,000</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sabzlai Khanzai</td>
<td>603</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Baloch</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>&gt;13,000</td>
<td>&lt;4,000</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Killi yar Muhammad</td>
<td>598</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Baloch</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>&gt;30,000</td>
<td>5,000</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mamuyaee</td>
<td>788</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Baloch</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>&gt;30,000</td>
<td>7,000</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hinar Noghay</td>
<td>826</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Baloch</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>&gt;7,000</td>
<td>3,000</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kech</td>
<td>678</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Baloch</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>&gt;10,000</td>
<td>4,000</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baloch Abad</td>
<td>834</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Baloch</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>&gt;15,000</td>
<td>6,000</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>129</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kunchi’s Mashiq</td>
<td>700</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Baloch</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>No Data</td>
<td>&gt;15,000</td>
<td>6,000</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meher Nizar M.</td>
<td>457</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Pakhtun</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>&gt;15,000</td>
<td>&lt;4,000</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loralai</td>
<td>363</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>Pakhtun</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>&gt;13000</td>
<td>&lt;4,000</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mer a Khurd</td>
<td>1055</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Pakhtun</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>&gt;30,000</td>
<td>5,000</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malik M. Jan</td>
<td>342</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>Pakhtun</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>&gt;30,000</td>
<td>7,000</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 5: Villages Profile Infographics**
2.4. Implementation Mechanism

2.4.1. Selection and On-Boarding of the Field Research Team

i. Selection and On-Boarding of Quantitative Research Team

Job description of the enumerator was developed to recruit suitable and competent enumerators (six in total) for quantitative data collection.

ii. Selection and On-Boarding of Qualitative Research Team

Qualified researchers (five in total) with experience in qualitative data collection in the field were selected. The qualitative research data collection team had an academic background of social sciences. The main characteristics of the qualitative field researchers were as follows:

2.4.2. Training of the Quantitative and Qualitative Research Staff

Detailed resource materials such as training guides, guidelines of field data collection for field researcher’s for conducting LHIs, FGDs, consultative meetings and PRAs were developed and used during the training process. A comprehensive four day training was conducted for all the research staff hired for data collection. The training was conducted jointly for quantitative as well as the qualitative research teams. Joint training ensured the contextual as well as tool-based learning and understanding of the data collection team.

A post-training test on the understanding of subjects such as poverty, women’s empowerment, inclusive development, social mobilisation, research instruments and methods was administered. Mock data collection exercises provided an opportunity for the experts to review the on-site performance of all the data collection team members.

2.4.3. Commencement of Field Data Collection

BRSP and NRSP teams in respective districts were consulted before data collection at each district before the data collection commenced in the field. As a next step, community meetings were held for data collection at the community level. An agreed schedule of consultative meetings with district and tehsil level administration and government departments was followed to conduct these meetings. It is pertinent to mention that BRSP, NRSP and RSPN teams extraordinarily supported the research activities in the field.

2.5. Data Collection Procedures

2.5.1. Participatory Rapid Appraisals (PRA) and Community Profiling During Primary Data Collection Exercise

PRA is an approach used for assessing the community, in terms of its socio-economic stature, culture, overall context and environment. Before beginning fieldwork for the data collection within a community, a PRA was conducted for the selected communities in all the sample villages.

PRA tools including Timeline/Historical Profile, Social and Resource Mapping, Wealth Ranking, and Seasonal Calendar, were all used for the purpose of community profiling during primary data collection.

These tools were administered through a facilitated community meeting (pre-arranged by the BRACE implementing partners) at an appropriate place within the community. All the qualitative research team members accompanied the field team leader and research coordinator of MV, for on-site administration of PRA tools (i.e., village time line, social and resource mapping, wealth ranking and seasonal calendar).

2.5.2. Household Poverty and Socio-economic Profiling Survey

As per sample, the household poverty and socio-economic survey covered each of the 240 sample households. PSC and SES survey tools were used to collect the household data.

PSC and SES data was collected from 288 households in total, while keeping a 30% household in reserve against a sample of 240 households from all the three districts. The CAPI method was used
for data collection for poverty and socio-economic profile data of the household.

2.5.3. Life History Interviews (LHIs)

The main objective of the LHIs was to determine the poverty dynamics, the relation between poverty and women’s empowerment and the drivers of inclusive development at the household, whilst involving both men and women. Life history is a tested method of the Chronic Poverty Research Centre (UK), for studying poverty dynamics and factors related to the social structure of the household. For each of the sample households, an LHI with one elderly woman was conducted. The LHI of women covered three periods of life span (i.e. adolescence, immediately after marriage and current). Similarly, an LHI of male head of household was also conducted for all the sample households.

2.5.4. Focus Group Discussions (FGDs)

The main objective of the FGDs was to develop a community profile in the areas of; poverty dynamics, women’s empowerment and inclusive development, governance and social mobilisation-based factors and variables, as per the study design. A group of 9-13 respondents from the community took part in the FGDs. A total of 24 FGDs (12 each for men & women) were conducted in all the three districts. Two team members conducted the FGDs, but due to cultural barriers and norms, female researchers conducted FGDs with women, while male researchers conducted the FGDs with men.

2.5.5. Consultative Meetings with Stakeholders

The objective of the consultative meeting with the stakeholders was to know the perception and role of women, and generate recommendations with respect to poverty push and pull factors, women’s empowerment and inclusive development. The stakeholders included in the data collection phase were government officials (men and women), such as representatives of agriculture, health, education, labour and manpower, mining, local government and rural development and social welfare departments, as well as representatives from LSOs, the RSPN, RSPs, EUD-PAK were also invited to the consultative meetings.

2.6. Data Analysis

2.6.1. Quantitative Data Analysis

PSC, SES data was analysed by using STATA software. Cross-tabulation of various variables and factors was done as required. Data tabulation was done by applying the Chi-square test.

2.6.2. Qualitative Data Analysis

All the qualitative information was analysed in the form of easily understandable frequency statistics, tabulations, narratives, themes and case studies. Poverty push and pull factors stated by the qualitative data respondents were analysed by using frequency distribution of such factors as per the responses of the men and women given in LHIs. The likelihood of the poverty push and pull factors were measured by cross-tabulation or contingency table. This is a technique to show the quantitative relationship of two categorical variables. The use of cross-tabs with the Chi-square test compares the two variables (Poverty push and pull events and PSC category of HH) and if there is any relationship or association between these two variables. This variable of poverty status of household was cross-tabbed with potential push-into and pull-out factors. Narratives, themes and case studies were also developed through qualitative data analysis collected through LHIs, FGDs, and consultative meetings.

2.6.3. Synthesis of Qualitative and Quantitative Data

Triangulation and synthesis of primary and secondary data was done to extract findings from the data as per research questions. The synthesis of data from various tools and sources helped in data consolidation. Tabular data, graphic schemes and qualitative co-relation maps were used to present the data for explanation and interpretation of results. Wherever required, the findings were cross-tallied with previous studies in the existing body of literature.
03 FINDINGS
3.1. Poverty Push and Pull Factors

3.1.1. Extent of Poverty in Sample Districts

The selected districts of Balochistan province are described as the most deprived regions of the country. However, no credible statistics are available to guide and attract the attention of policymakers towards these areas. This study has tried to provide credible data of the poverty faced by these three districts. Table 6 below shows that 54.2% of the population in these three districts is poor as per standard PSC methodology. Moreover, the highest level of poverty is prevalent in Kech district (64.6%), followed by Khuzdar (53.1%), and Loralai (44.7%). Bands of the poverty reveal that almost 19.4% households of the overall survey area are categorised as Ultra Poor.

Another important fact revealed by the table above is that, in addition to the 54.2% of the population being poor, 19.4% households are extremely vulnerable to economic shocks which can push them into poverty. Similarly, a district-wise analysis of poverty bands also shows that although the Loralai district has the lowest percentage of poor households among three districts, border-line cases in Loralai are the highest, which is a potential threat to exacerbate poverty and increase numbers in the district. These numbers have serious policy implications, suggesting that policymakers should focus on safeguarding border-line cases, whilst providing sustainable solutions and recommendations for communities and households living in poverty.

3.1.2. Poverty Push Factors

i. District-wise Poverty Push Events (Inter District and Gender Disaggregated Comparison)

Balochistan has the second highest incidence of multidimensional poverty in Pakistan, after the FATA region. Overall, 71% of the population in Balochistan is multi-dimensionally poor; 85% of the rural population and 38% of the urban population is poor, based on the indices of multi-dimensional poverty. 28 District-wise data of the study, as given in Table 7,

Table 6: Extent of Poverty (Percentage of Households)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Poverty Bands with Score Range</th>
<th>Khuzdar (%)</th>
<th>Kech (%)</th>
<th>Loralai (%)</th>
<th>Total (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Poor</td>
<td>64.6</td>
<td>53.1</td>
<td>44.7</td>
<td>54.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Poor</td>
<td>35.4</td>
<td>46.9</td>
<td>55.3</td>
<td>45.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ultra Poor (0-11)</td>
<td>26.0</td>
<td>21.4</td>
<td>10.6</td>
<td>19.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very Poor (12-18)</td>
<td>19.8</td>
<td>17.3</td>
<td>17.0</td>
<td>18.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transitory Poor (19-23)</td>
<td>18.8</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>17.0</td>
<td>16.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transitory Vulnerable (24-34)</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>19.4</td>
<td>22.3</td>
<td>19.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transitory Non-Poor (35-50)</td>
<td>11.5</td>
<td>15.3</td>
<td>17.0</td>
<td>14.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Poor (51-100)</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>12.2</td>
<td>16.0</td>
<td>11.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: SES and PSC Data Cross Tabulation, Oct 2019

Table 7: District-wise Poverty Push Factors as Per LHI Women Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Push Events</th>
<th>Khuzdar (%)</th>
<th>Kech (%)</th>
<th>Loralai (%)</th>
<th>Total (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Unemployment/ under employment</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Large family size and dependency ratio</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illiteracy/ Lack of skills</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less income</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health expenses</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loans</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natural disasters</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Death shock</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic shocks</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Higher inflation</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conflicts within family and tribes</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No access mobility and communication</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of utilities</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drug addiction</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Life History Interviews of Female Respondents, Oct 2019

shows that:

- Overall unemployment is the biggest poverty push factor, as expressed by 19% of women respondents overall. Similarly, overall 19% of men have stated unemployment as the
highest poverty push factor. One third of male respondents from Kech district have described it as a poverty push event.

- Higher dependency ratio lack of education or skill literacy are believed to be poverty push factors by an overall 18% 13% of women respondents respectively. Whereas, higher dependency ratio is mentioned as a poverty push event by 15% of men overall. Overall, only 9% of the men regard illiteracy as a poverty push factor, and this response is only given by 2% of men in Khuzdar district.

- Low income (due to lack of adequate employment opportunities) and health shocks are explained as a poverty push factor by 9-10% of the women respondents.

- Higher inflation is attributed as a poverty push factor by 4% of men respondents.

- Both natural disasters and loans are explained as poverty push factors by 7-8% of the women respondents. A similar number of men respondents (7%) stated natural disasters as a poverty push factor, whereas a higher proportion of men respondents (16%) have said that loan(s) are a poverty push event for their household.

- Unemployment, illiteracy and loans are the highest cited poverty push factors in Loralai district, with 21%, 15% and 10% respectively as per response of women.

- Natural disasters are attributed as a push factor by 11% of the respondents in Kech district, whereas 5-6% of respondents have highlighted it as a cause of poverty overall. Lesser income generation (due to non-availability of adequate employment opportunities) is a significant contributor to poverty for Khuzdar and Kech districts as stated by 15% and 13% of men and women respondents respectively.

- Only 1% of the respondents from Kech district mentioned drug addiction as a poverty push factor because of the incapability of drug addicted people to contribute to economic output.
Case Study

NOOR JAN- POVERTY PUSH CASE - KECH DISTRICT

This poor woman lived in a family of 15 members, including parents, five brothers, seven sisters and a grandmother. Livestock was the only source of income for her family. Her father was a shepherd. “We used to raise goats and sheep and earn income by selling these goats and sheep.” Unfortunately, a time came when a number of goats and sheep died due to the outbreak of a disease. This pushed her family into extreme poverty. Her mother was a very hard-working woman. She used to perform all the household chores such as washing, cooking and cleaning. She was empowered to rear, sell and purchase the goats and sheep. Besides, she was also an expert in knitting and sewing. This is how she earned some income to support the family.

Thirteen years ago, this woman got married at the age of 20. The decision was made by her father. “No other member of the family including my mother was consulted while making this important decision.” Her husband was employed in Dubai and earning a relatively good income. This was the golden period as he used to send his whole salary to her. She succeeded to save the money for future use. A daughter was born to her. Her husband came back from Dubai and decided not to return. Here he mixed up with the wrong company and slowly became an addict of opium. He consumed all the savings and sold out important things which she purchased from her savings. Her husband disappeared for the last five years due to this addiction. Presently, her economic situation is miserable. She works to feed her children and family. She earns her livelihood through sewing and embroidery.

All the decisions including education and health of her children, she now takes by herself. She considers herself fully empowered. She was of the opinion that women should be given education, literacy and especially income generating skills. Women should also be fully empowered regarding household decisions and partially empowered along with the husband or other senior members of the family in external affairs.

She was not a member of any social mobilisation organisation, but according to her, NRSP has initiated a social mobilisation campaign in her area. An awareness has been created amongst the women regarding their education, literacy, and skills and the subsequent benefits of women’s organisations. NRSP advised the community to initiate some saving schemes, such as donating a certain amount in different committees for social work, self-help and saving. We appreciate NRSP for their contribution in resolving the serious issue of water scarcity through installing a solar system and water boring equipment.

We are living in inter-generational poverty and we have not been able to get any support from the Government or any other organisation. We have no land or any other resources that can help to pull us out of poverty. My father works as a labourer, on the land of others. All my family members, particularly my brothers, are illiterate. Therefore, they could not find suitable employment to get out of the vicious cycle of poverty. Our women are also illiterate. As a result, poverty has continued.

(Bakht Bibi, Loralai)
Poverty Push Factors Based on Three Phases of Life of Women Respondents

Data about poverty push factors was collected for three different phases of the life span of women respondents. These phases include: before marriage phase, immediately after marriage phase; and current phase.

It is quite clear from the from Table 9 that:

- Higher dependency ratio, unemployment and illiteracy are the key factors that lead a household towards poverty for all the three phases of a woman’s life. Furthermore, the tendency of response for these factors is high for all the three districts.
- Within all the districts, 14% to 25% of women have responded that a higher dependency ratio is an important household poverty push factor, for all the three phases of their lives. However, in the post-marriage (current) phase, only 9% of women in Loralai have identified it as a poverty event.
- Unemployment is stated as a household poverty push event by 15% to 22% of respondents for all the districts during all the three phases. However, it is worth mentioning that unemployment is explained as the most

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Push Events</th>
<th>Khuzdar</th>
<th>Kech</th>
<th>Loralai</th>
<th>Gross</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pre-M.</td>
<td>Post-M.</td>
<td>Post-M.</td>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pre-M.</td>
<td>Post-M.</td>
<td>Post-M.</td>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pre-M.</td>
<td>Post-M.</td>
<td>Post-M.</td>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pre-M.</td>
<td>Post-M.</td>
<td>Post-M.</td>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployment/ Under Employment</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Large Family Size and Dependency</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illiteracy/ Lack of Skills</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less Income</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Expenses</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loans</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natural Disasters</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Death Shock</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Higher Inflation</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic Shocks</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conflicts Within Family and Tribes</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of Utilities</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No Access Mobility and Communication</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drug Addiction</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Life History Interviews of Female Respondents, Oct 2019
Poverty is on the rise due to increased unemployment, deteriorating agriculture, marriage expenses and higher dependency ratio. These issues were explained by the participants of a consultative meeting in their local language as follows;

“Aik baloch kamata hai aur baqqi sab khatay hain. Yeh aisa hai jaisay aik engine hoota hai aur baqqi sab boogjoon kou khainchta hai. Hum shadiyoon pey bahut paisa phainktay hain, bedardi sey wasayal kou zayah kertay hian. Har shaddi pey 50 50 hazaar uradha daitay hain, aur who kambakhat jou 50 hazaar aik raat mein banata hai yaani entertainers/dancers/singers, woh bhi aglay din 100 rupaya maang raha hoota hai kay mere paas paisay khatam hou gaey hain.”

One person earns and everybody else in the family eats. It is like a train in which one engine drags all the bogies with it. We hurl large sum of money on marriages and burn our resources ruthlessly. We lavishly spend up to 50 thousand on a single function and the person who earns that amount in one night (entertainers/dancers/singers) also seen asking for 100 rupees the next day because they don’t have anything left.

(Consultative Meeting, Kech)

important poverty push factor by most of the women respondents in all the districts during post-marriage (immediate) phase. In Loralai district, this response is given by 27% of respondents (which is highest among all the three phases across the sampled districts).

• In Khuzdar district, a higher dependency ratio is a poverty push factor for 14% of women in the pre-marriage phase, 18% of women in post-marriage (immediate) phase, and 25% women in post marriage (current) phase.

• Health expenses and death shocks are believed to be important poverty push factors also.

• In Khuzdar district, 16% of respondents attribute health expenses as a poverty push factor, whereas in post-marriage (immediate) and post-marriage (current) phases, 11% and 5% of respondents have explained health expenses as a poverty factor.

• In Kech district, health expenses are mentioned as a poverty factor by 12% of respondents in the post-marriage (current) phase. However, for the other two phases, only a small proportion of respondents have attributed it as a poverty factor.

• In Loralai district health expenses are an important household poverty push factor for 9% to 10% of women for all the three phases of their lives.

iii. Likelihood of Occurrence of Poverty Push Factors for Various PSC Categories

Likelihood of poverty push factors computed through cross-tabulation of poverty push events and the number of respondents who have mentioned these events as contributors to household poverty.

The cross-tabulated data given in Table 10 shows that:
Unemployment or under employment, is the factor with significant likelihood for pushing a household into poverty for all the categories of PSC. The tendency of this factor to push a household into poverty is 50% overall. Similarly, this factor has 60% likelihood to push transitory poor into poverty, whereas for transitory non-poor and non-poor, the factor has 56% and 42% likelihood respectively, to push households of these PSC categories into poverty.

A higher dependency ratio has a likelihood of pushing 37.45% of the households into poverty across all the PSC categories. However, transitory poor, transitory non-poor and chronically poor categories are most vulnerable to the extent of 47%, 43% and 39% respectively.

Illiteracy and lack of skill literacy has a likelihood of 29% to cause poverty to all the PSC categories. There is between almost 32% to 35% likelihood among households from transitory non-poor, transitory poor and ultra-poor PSC categories, to get pushed into poverty due to this factor.

There is 22% likelihood for all households to be pushed into poverty, based on the loans taken for various socio-economic reasons. There is one fourth (25%) likelihood for ultra-poor, chronically poor, transitory poor and transitory non-poor categories to be pushed into poverty due to the loan(s) factor.

Natural disasters have about 19% tendency to push the households into poverty from all the categories. For transitory poor and non-poor categories this tendency of likelihood is 26% and 21% respectively.

Health expenses increase the likelihood of being pushed into poverty for 20% of HHs (for all PSC categories).

The above-mentioned findings corroborate with the primary data collected through data collection methods other than LHIs, such as FGDs, consultative meetings, PRAs, village profiles and SES, as well as secondary data.

Unemployment or under employment, is the factor with significant likelihood for pushing a household into poverty for all the categories of PSC. The tendency of this factor to push a household into poverty is 50% overall. Similarly, this factor has 60% likelihood to push transitory poor into poverty, whereas for transitory non-poor and non-poor, the factor has 56% and 42% likelihood respectively, to push households of these PSC categories into poverty.

A higher dependency ratio has a likelihood of pushing 37.45% of the households into poverty across all the PSC categories. However, transitory poor, transitory non-poor and chronically poor categories are most vulnerable to the extent of 47%, 43% and 39% respectively.

Illiteracy and lack of skill literacy has a likelihood of 29% to cause poverty to all the PSC categories. There is between almost 32% to 35% likelihood among households from transitory non-poor, transitory poor and ultra-poor PSC categories, to get pushed into poverty due to this factor.

There is 22% likelihood for all households to be pushed into poverty, based on the loans taken for various socio-economic reasons. There is one fourth (25%) likelihood for ultra-poor, chronically poor, transitory poor and transitory non-poor categories to be pushed into poverty due to the loan(s) factor.

Natural disasters have about 19% tendency to push the households into poverty from all the categories. For transitory poor and non-poor categories this tendency of likelihood is 26% and 21% respectively.

Health expenses increase the likelihood of being pushed into poverty for 20% of HHs (for all PSC categories).

The above-mentioned findings corroborate with the primary data collected through data collection methods other than LHIs, such as FGDs, consultative meetings, PRAs, village profiles and SES, as well as secondary data.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ultra Poor (0-11)</td>
<td>46.67</td>
<td>26.67</td>
<td>31.11</td>
<td>22.22</td>
<td>26.67</td>
<td>24.4</td>
<td>17.78</td>
<td>22.22</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>6.77</td>
<td>8.33</td>
<td>2.22</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chronically Poor (12-18)</td>
<td>51.16</td>
<td>39.53</td>
<td>23.26</td>
<td>23.26</td>
<td>25.58</td>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>18.6</td>
<td>28.57</td>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>4.65</td>
<td>7.14</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3.57</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transitory Poor (19-23)</td>
<td>59.52</td>
<td>47.62</td>
<td>35.71</td>
<td>38.1</td>
<td>23.81</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>26.19</td>
<td>17.24</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>4.76</td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>2.38</td>
<td>3.45</td>
<td>2.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transitory Vulnerable (24-34)</td>
<td>46.67</td>
<td>35.56</td>
<td>26.67</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>15.56</td>
<td>22.2</td>
<td>15.56</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>6.67</td>
<td>6.67</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4.44</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transitory Non-Poor (35-50)</td>
<td>56.25</td>
<td>43.75</td>
<td>32.26</td>
<td>18.75</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3.13</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3.13</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Poor (51-100)</td>
<td>42.86</td>
<td>32.14</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>14.29</td>
<td>17.86</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>21.43</td>
<td>14.29</td>
<td>10.71</td>
<td>10.71</td>
<td>7.14</td>
<td>3.57</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total (Likelihood Percentage)</td>
<td>50.64</td>
<td>37.45</td>
<td>29.06</td>
<td>23.4</td>
<td>22.55</td>
<td>19.6</td>
<td>18.72</td>
<td>17.45</td>
<td>10.64</td>
<td>5.53</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>2.55</td>
<td>1.34</td>
<td>1.28</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: SES and life History Interviews of Female Respondents, Oct 2019
debts of the HHs. Similarly, loans are obtained in Kech and Khuzdar districts for various socio-economic needs like marriage, catering to health and death related expenses. As per the respondents from FGDs, a higher dependency ratio pushes a HH into a vicious cycle of poverty. The HH head with a higher dependency ratio has to struggle for every spending. HHs with a higher dependency ratio don’t prefer to educate their children and youth because these HH members are engaged in income generating activities. Hence, the lack of human resource development (through education and literacy) keeps the HH in poverty for protracted periods.

Unemployment and lack of employment opportunities is a multi-faceted cause that leads the HH to poverty. The employment-to-population ratio, (defined as the proportion of the working population that is employed) is 48.7%30 for the province of Balochistan. The economy of Balochistan is therefore providing employment to only half of its population of working age. This clearly indicates the lack of employment opportunities in the province. Main sectors of employment (in the sampled districts) include; agriculture and agriculture labour, livestock, mining, and government jobs. Primary data from SES data (see table 3 in annexures) suggests that a vast majority of respondents are involved in un-skilled labour (i.e. 43% in Khuzdar, 48% in Kech, and 27% in Loralai). Skilled labour occupation is adopted by an average of 9.5% of respondents, whereas this was 20% in Kech district. Agriculture farm labour (self-owned farm) is a source of earning for an average of 2.11% respondents. A total of 8% of respondents have on-farm agriculture labour as a source of their employment. Since agriculture and livestock is under threat of natural disasters and droughts, they are vulnerable sources of income and push HHs into poverty. Responses from consultative meetings and FGDs shows that the government has not initiated employment and skill development programmes. Illiteracy and lack of skills don’t allow the younger population to get involved in decent income generation activities. Since employment opportunities in local areas (villages) are very limited, people go to other cities and provinces for employment. For example, unemployed youth from Loralai seek work in Multan and Southern Punjab, whereas people from the surroundings of Khuzdar and Kech go to Karachi. This fact is also substantiated by Ghamz, Irman, & Ayesha, 2018 31.

Balochistan province has the highest prevalence of out of school children between the age of 5 to 16 years (59%).32 Gender disaggregated data shows that 67% of girls and 52% of boys of this age group are out of school33. Similarly, 54% of children from 5 to 16 years have never attended school in Balochistan34. Furthermore, only 47% of the young population (15 to 24 years) of the province is literate35. The sampled districts for this study have even worse literacy indicators. Khuzdar and Loralai have a literacy rate of 32%, whereas that of Kech is 40%. Literacy rate of the sampled villages of Khuzdar range from 25% to 43% and that of Kech ranges from 5% to 50%. One out of four sampled villages form Khuzdar have no educational facilities. Villages in Loralai have a literacy rate range from 2% to 16%. This low literacy rate of the villages exists due to lack of availability of educational facilities in some of the villages. Longer distances of educational facilities from the villages (ranging from 30 minutes to one hour)36 is cited as a reason for the
absence in school by boys and girls. Other reasons for school non-attendance are the lack of access to transportation, lack of teachers and non-functional schools found in the villages.

These disappointing education and literacy indicators have rightly been explained as the contributors to poverty within all the sampled districts. Government officials (included in consultative meetings) state that the lack of education and skill impedes the process of capable human resource development, which can add value to the economy, while becoming part of the workforce in future. Furthermore, the existing curriculum lacks the ability to educate children in a manner that they can become invaluable.
human resources in future. Lack of literacy and skills is attributed as a poverty factor by all the respondents that leads to intergenerational poverty. Furthermore, due to defective planning, militancy and insurgency, a proportion of younger population is disengaged from the government in ideological and moral perspectives.

The province of Balochistan is prone to multiple natural disasters including earthquakes, floods, and drought. PDMA Balochistan data reveals that serious earthquakes occurred in Ziarat in 2008, in Washuk in 2013, and in Awaran in 2013. Similarly, there were serious floods in the province during 2010, 2011, and 2013. Drought or drought-like conditions occur in several western and central districts of the province. Therefore, natural disasters have been an important cause of poverty in the sampled districts. Natural disasters have impacted agriculture and livelihood in these districts. As per the Balochistan Drought Needs Assessment (BDNA) Report 2019, 28% of households cited non-availability of water for agriculture cultivation, followed by 37% of which have said that very limited water is available for agriculture cultivation. Similarly, in the Kech district, 50% of households have said that they have very limited water available for agriculture use, followed by another 50% which have responded that water is available to some extent.

Respondents of PRAs, FGDs and LHIs in Khuzdar district have stated that non-availability of small-scale rainwater storage structures have been a cause of loss of agricultural produce as well as a cause for flood in these villages. The topography of the land and its latitude surrounding these villages let the rainwater flow freely from a higher altitude to a lower one, which then hits the area under cultivation and destroys the crops. Responses from the consultative meetings have helped us to realise that the lack of properly skilled human resource in agriculture, livestock and public health engineering departments, is the cause of non-availability of such structures. The Public Health Engineering Department of Balochistan has only one employee, working as an expert of dam construction. Hence, agriculture loss due to natural disasters is complemented by the man-made problems related to governance and the lack of required skill in government officials.

Case Study

MUHAMMAD ALIM - POVERTY PUSH CASE – KHUZDAR DISTRICT

Mr. Muhammad Alim, a 39 year old illiterate man, narrated his life history with great sorrow. He was engaged to a girl when he was just three years old. He got married at the age of 27. Meanwhile, her father died and her family was pushed into extreme poverty. He purchased her by paying Vulvar (bride price). In order to pay the amount, he earned some money and also took out a loan. He was already living in poverty during his pre-marriage period. Marriage expenditure further pushed him into severe poverty. His children died in infancy due to the poor health condition of the mother, who fell ill. In order to meet the health expenditure, he had to take more loans. He suggested that people should ask the government to help them. Alim narrated that his wife does household chores, takes care of him and the kids. She does not vote because voting is haram (forbidden). It is forbidden for the women to leave the home. He told his wife in the very first day that if she ever set foot outside home without his permission he will never let her in again. He also argued that a man loses respect in society if he lets his woman go outside the home. This world, hinting towards NGOs, has spoiled our women. Their claim that women should leave the home and work outside the home is not acceptable. Even Allah disapproves and does not like such people who let their wife wandering outside. He emphasised that he would not allow his wife to go to such institutions. Although the government wants it, we should not let our women work. If Allah wanted women to work, He would not have associated a husband with her. He concluded that a woman is only created to serve her men only and that is it.
Government officials and local communities have stated that poor governance of initiatives like the construction of the Meerani dam at an inappropriate site has also caused floods and natural disasters in Kech district. Flash floods pour huge flows into Dasht River, which could not drain freely due to the Meerani dam structure. On the other hand, since the dam cannot hold the water storage beyond a certain level, in the event of excessive rains, once the spill-ways of the dam are opened, the excessive water outflow damages the area under cultivation. This is a case of human resource incompetence and poor governance. Such governance-oriented problems become a root-cause of poverty. Lack of capable human resources in agriculture and livestock is cited as a cause of low agricultural produce, which in turn becomes a poverty push factor due to the decrease in HH income for the respondents from the Loralai district. These findings clearly show that poverty factors are intertwined. Governance affairs, natural disasters and loss of agriculture are a nexus of causes, which complement each other and bring poverty to various regions of Balochistan.

**Case Study**

**BIBI QUBLI—POVERTY PUSH CASE STUDY – LORALAI DISTRICT**

This is the story of an chronic poor lady. Her father was a casual labourer, working for landlords in their fruit orchards. His employment was of temporary nature. He was the only bread winner in his family. There was no other source of income like agriculture, livestock and poultry. There was no electricity in her village. At occasions, drought severely affected her village, and fruit production was affected leading to the father working less and earning less. This pushed the family into severe poverty. Her mother was involved in traditional roles of HH chores. She took care of family members and her in-laws. She was not allowed to work outside the home as it was strictly prohibited due to local cultural norms.

Twenty years ago, this woman got married at the age of 18. The marriage was arranged by her family. Her father demanded Rs. 200,000 as Vulvar. Since her future husband was also from a poor family and could never raise the required bride price, her father reduced the required price. Her father-in-law was a daily wage labourer. He worked for the landlords in their orchards. The entire family was depending upon her father-in-law. Her husband and his family were all illiterate. They were settled in an area where there was no means of transportation. Drought badly affected that area, and left no employment opportunities. Most of the time her husband remained jobless. They had to depend on the low and declining income of her father-in-law. They were enduring poverty due to unemployment and a high dependency ratio. Her family, especially children, suffered a lot due to this vicious cycle of poverty. Often, her children had nothing to eat except some left over and stale bread.

Now, she has realised that women are not empowered. Decision making and power rests with men only. An empowered woman is considered characterless. Women have no freedom to take decisions, to go outside the home, visit the market or attend any meeting or seminar. She said that women have a very limited role to the extent of only taking care of children, cooking and housekeeping. Women have no participation in any outside home activity. Even if women fall sick they cannot visit the doctor without the permission of men. If a woman goes outside without the permission of her husband, sometimes, she is threatened of being killed. Sometimes, NGOs visit the area but they are not allowed to interact with them. Their patriarchal cultural norm does not permit women participation in NGOs activities. Her husband also does not give her permission to be part of any NGO or social group.
3.1.3. Poverty Pull Events

i. District-Wise Poverty Pull Events (Inter-District and Gender Disaggregated Comparison)

Poverty pull events are considered as those factors whose occurrence pulls the household out of poverty. The table (Table 11) clearly shows that:

Human resource development is rated as the biggest poverty pull factor by all the respondents across all the districts. Human resource development is defined (by the respondents) as the activities that make human beings capable of adding value to the economic output. Such activities include education, literacy, skill development or any other training, that can help in employability of the human resource, thus leading to income generation. Overall 35% of women respondents and 28% men respondents have attributed human resource development as a poverty pull event. A total of 43% of women respondents in Kech, 37% in Khuzdar and 24% in Loralai stated this. About 50% of men respondents from Loralai and 39% from Kech mentioned human resource development as a significant poverty pull event.

A decrease in dependency ratio (due to employability of an additional member of the household) is another important poverty pull event according to 19% of the total women respondents. Feedback from 24% of women respondents of Loralai, indicates that this factor pulls the household out of poverty. From both Khuzdar and Kech districts, 16% of women mentioned that a decrease in dependency ratio can pull households out of poverty. In comparison, it is quite astonishing to report that only 5% of men respondents have mentioned decreased dependency ratio as a poverty pull factor, whereas 9% men from Kech district have mentioned decrease dependency ratio as a poverty pull event, the highest feedback for this factor across the districts.

Availability of water for agriculture cultivation and livestock income are mentioned as poverty pull events by 12% and 10% of the women respondents respectively, compared to 22% and 8% of men respondents respectively. Furthermore, availability of water is described as a poverty pull factor by 16% of women respondents in Khuzdar district, which is the highest response across the districts for this factor. Similarly, 13% of women respondents from Kech district have mentioned livestock income as a poverty pull event, recorded as the highest percentage for this factor.

- Increase in land ownership (characterised by an increase in agricultural income) and social support systems (based on joint family) are poverty pull factors for 8% and 5% of the total women respondents respectively. However, only 1% of women respondents in Kech mentioned increase in land ownership as a poverty pull event, and only 2% of women respondents from Khuzdar said so for a social support system. It is quite striking to find that a social support system (based on joint family) is a poverty pull event for 12% of men respondents overall and the highest response is

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pull Events</th>
<th>Khuzdar (%)</th>
<th>Kech (%)</th>
<th>Loralai (%)</th>
<th>Total (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Human Resource Development</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decreased Dependency Ratio</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water Availability for Cultivation</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Livestock Income</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increase in Land Ownership</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Support System</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Govt Supported Social Safety Net</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Real State</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Started Small Business (shop, Hotel,etc)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women Employment</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loan Completely Returned</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Life History Interviews of Female Respondents
It is quite interesting to realise that 2% of women respondents and 5% of men respondents (in total) have said that women’s employment is a poverty pull factor, whereas none of the women or men in Loralai district believe that women’s employment can potentially pull a household out of poverty.

Another finding worth noting is about the government supported social safety net. 3% of women respondents and 10% of men respondents mentioned government supported social safety net as a poverty pull factor. Only 1% of women respondents and none of the men respondents from Loralai mentioned it as a poverty pull factor, whereas 5% of women respondents and 17% of men respondents from Kech have stated this.

### Table 12: District-wise Poverty Pull Events/Factors as Narrated by Men

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pull Events</th>
<th>Khuzdar (%)</th>
<th>Kech (%)</th>
<th>Loralai (%)</th>
<th>Gross (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Human Resource Development</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decreased Dependency Ratio</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water Availability for Cultivation</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Support System</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Livestock Income</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increase in Land Ownership</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Real State</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Started Small Business (Shop, Hotel, etc)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Govt Supported Social Safety Net</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women Employment</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loan Completely Returned</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Life History Interviews of Male Respondents, Oct 2019*
Poverty Pull Factors Based on Three Phases of Life of Women Respondents

Taking the findings from three different phases of women’s life into consideration, i.e. pre-marriage, post-marriage (immediate), and post-marriage (current), the table above (Table 13) highlights that:

- Human resource development (to prepare the human resource for future employability) is identified as the biggest poverty pull event by women for all the three periods, across all the districts. For all the phases, about 40% of the women respondents have said that human resource development is a significant poverty pull event in Khuzdar and Kech, whereas about 23% to 29% respondents from Loralai have mentioned so.

- Decreased dependency ratio is explained as a poverty pull factor by 14% to 20% of women respondents for all the phases. However, this event was given as a reason for poverty pull of a household by 24% to 29% of women respondents (for all the phases).

- Similarly, increase in land ownership and availability of water for agriculture produce are given as reasons for poverty pull out by about 12% and 8% of respondents respectively, for all the phases.

### Likelihood of Occurrence of Poverty Pull Factors for Various PSC Categories

Likelihood of poverty pull events is derived through the cross-tab of PSC category-wise responses and poverty pull factors as mentioned by the respondents, through LHI data.
From the table 14, it is realised that:

- An increase in livestock income is the poverty pull factor that has a likelihood of 19% in total. However, for chronically poor and transitory poor PSC categories, the likelihood of livestock income to be a poverty pull factor is 32% and 21% respectively.

- A decreased dependency ratio has a tendency of 17% to be a poverty pull factor. This tendency of 17% is similar across categories of ultra-poor, chronically poor and transitory poor. For chronically poor and non-poor categories the tendency is as high as 21% each.

- Increase in land ownership has a likelihood of 14% to be a poverty pull factor in total. The tendency of this factors is highest (25%) for the chronically poor category, followed by 17% for the non-poor.

- Government supported social safety net has a tendency of 14% to pull the HH out of poverty. This tendency is almost the same across all the PSC categories except for transitory non-poor where it’s as high as 22%.

- Literacy and education have a likelihood of 9.3% to be a poverty pull factor, whereas for transitory poor and chronically poor, this factor has no tendency at all to have a likelihood of becoming a poverty pull factor.

- Women’s employment has a likelihood of 3.4% to become a poverty alleviating event. However, for chronically and transitory poor categories, it has absolutely no likelihood to become a poverty reducing factor.

A synthesis of the findings from poverty pull factors, mainly extracted from LHIs, with the data obtained from other sources (i.e. FGDs, consultative meetings, PRAs, Village Profiles and various secondary data sources), was carried out by the research team. The triangulated view of findings is given as follows:

Human resource development in terms of education, literacy and skill training contributes to poverty reduction. Responses from LHIs, FGDs and consultative meetings, help to recognise that there is a direct correlation between human resource development (through education, skill development and some access to capital) and the ability of the human resource to get employed. Capable human resource adds to the economic output of households. Both men and women FGD respondents mentioned that education, literacy and skill training of their children, and the younger population (between age 15 to 30 years), can significantly reduce poverty in the event of their employment being based on education and skill. Some of the literacy and skill training programmes for youth and women implemented by institutions like IDSP and UNDP have positively impacted

### Table 14: PSC Category Wise Pull Factors of Poverty (Percentage Likelihood)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PSC Range</th>
<th>Livestock Income</th>
<th>Decreased Dependency Ratio</th>
<th>Increased Land Ownership</th>
<th>Gov Supported Social Safety Net</th>
<th>Social Support System</th>
<th>Water Availability for cultivation</th>
<th>Loan Completely Returned</th>
<th>Started Small Business</th>
<th>Women Employment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ultra Poor (0-11)</td>
<td>17.78</td>
<td>17.78</td>
<td>11.11</td>
<td>11.11</td>
<td>7.69</td>
<td>11.1</td>
<td>11.1</td>
<td>5.56</td>
<td>4.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chronically Poor (12-18)</td>
<td>32.56</td>
<td>18.6</td>
<td>25.58</td>
<td>10.71</td>
<td>11.11</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6.67</td>
<td>7.14</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transitory Poor (19-23)</td>
<td>16.67</td>
<td>21.43</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>13.79</td>
<td>13.72</td>
<td>15.4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transitory Vulnerable (24-34)</td>
<td>15.56</td>
<td>11.11</td>
<td>8.89</td>
<td>16.67</td>
<td>6.89</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>9.52</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transitory Non-Poor (35-50)</td>
<td>21.88</td>
<td>21.88</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>22.22</td>
<td>8.82</td>
<td>7.14</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>11.11</td>
<td>6.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Poor (51-100)</td>
<td>7.14</td>
<td>17.86</td>
<td>17.86</td>
<td>14.29</td>
<td>5.35</td>
<td>28.6</td>
<td>7.14</td>
<td>7.14</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>19.15</td>
<td>17.87</td>
<td>14.47</td>
<td>14.09</td>
<td>11.31</td>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>5.81</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>3.83</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: SES and life History Interviews of Female Respondents, Oct 2019
the income generation ability of those who have attended these programmes, as explained by the FGD respondents. Sewing and embroidery skills have been used by women to fund the education of their children and brothers. Those educated children and brothers have been able to join good professions and hence their earning has contributed to the alleviation of poverty in their respective households.

Most of the respondents (FGDs, PRAs and consultative meetings) have mentioned the fact that education and skill development leads to a decrease in the dependency ratio of a HH. Once the HH gets more earning heads, the income and consumption gap is rationalised. Therefore, education, literacy and skill development are causes for a decrease in dependency ratio, which has been given as an important factor of poverty reduction. Literacy and skill development become a pull factor once literate and skillful people are employed (by someone or self-employed) and they start contributing to HH income.

Livestock income and availability of water are significant poverty pull events in the context of all of these districts. The total cropped cultivatable area of Balochistan has dropped from 1.14 million hectares in 2010 to 1.06 million hectares in 2018, due to water scarcity. The area under cultivation for all fruits and vegetables has declined in Khuzdar and Kech districts. Furthermore, agriculture and livestock departments have not been able to devise effective strategies for the value chain development of agriculture and livestock produce. Therefore, agriculture produce is sold in a non-value-added state and the resulting income is small as described by the respondents. Therefore, if handled well, these factors can help in the eradication of poverty.

As per the views of the respondents, availability of water, easy access to water and the availability of water storage structures help in livestock raising and other agricultural activities. This livestock becomes an important contributor to the livelihoods of people in all the districts. Similarly, availability of water has a direct correlation with the output of agricultural produce. Agricultural produce leads to poverty alleviation because it becomes the source of income for the HHs in these areas. Furthermore, respondents are of the view that in order to get agricultural produce, a lot of inputs are required. When water is available in their areas, they gather the agricultural inputs on credit. This leads to credit and cash circulation in their local economy, hence there is a benefit for everyone associated in the agriculture value chain.

40 Agricultural Statistics of Pakistan 2017-18
41 Ibid
3.2. Women’s Empowerment and Its Impact on HH Poverty Dynamics

In this section, findings related to the state of women’s empowerment in the sampled districts of Balochistan are discussed based on VeneKlasen and Miller’s framework of women’s empowerment. Dimensions and relevant indicators of women’s empowerment (as given in ...) are used to present the findings. Imprinting of women’s role is studied through the reflective/historical questioning method as the women respondents were asked to describe the role of their mothers (which they observed during their childhood & adolescence).

Social mobilisation is discussed as a driver of women’s empowerment based on the operationalised indicators as per the framework.

The role of the mother serves as a reference to study any change in the empowerment profile of the respondents versus that of their mothers, across their lifespan. Later in this section, a correlated view of the findings for the impact of women’s empowerment on HH poverty dynamics is presented. The correlated findings further provide an elevated view about the effects of social mobilisation on women’s empowerment.

3.2.1. Narratives of Women Empowerment

i. Role profile of respondents’ mothers (Imprinting of empowerment)

The vast majority of respondents (LHIs, FGDs and consultative meetings) mentioned that their mothers (women from earlier generation) had a very submissive role within their HHs. Many of the mothers were illiterate. Illiteracy has an inherent relationship with low level of women’s empowerment. There are increasing references in the existing literature about this fact. Similarly, cultural norms and values (for both Pashtun and Baloch cultures) are reasons for lower empowerment of mothers, as men do not allow their women to voice their opinions in various socio-economic affairs of the HH. Mothers (earlier generation women) had been involved in child rearing, household cleaning, cooking and providing care and attention to sick members of the HHs. A vast majority of these women were not allowed to move out of their homes across all the districts. However, in Baloch areas (Khuzdar and Kech) a very small proportion of mothers have been engaged in livestock raising and embroidery work for their own use.

ii. Narratives of Women’s Empowerment (for current generation of women)

a. Narrative of Power from Within

Empowerment acquired by women in the form of self-esteem, self-confidence and personal autonomy is terms as power from within. The state and status of such power is generally lacking all over Pakistan, but the findings from this study reveal that it is particularly low in Balochistan. For generations, women have been socially, psychologically and culturally snubbed in such a way, that their self-confidence is almost nil or non-existent.

A majority of respondents in the categories of both men and women have highlighted that the women have a very low level of personal astuteness, because women are not considered as important counterparts by men. Self-awareness of women about their own importance within the family is almost negligible. Personal autonomy related beliefs of women are very weak. Most of the women are not aware of their legal and religious rights.

It is like a sin (Harram), if a woman goes out of home. Why should a woman go outside? If my wife set foot outside my home without my permission, I will never let her in again in my home.

(Noor Adam, Loralai)
One of the reasons for this low level of realisation of importance of self, is highly restricted mobility of women in the boundary walls of their homes. Women are not allowed to participate in social events. This restriction is strictly observed in Loralai district (i.e. Pashtun area). However, in the Kech and Khuzdar districts (i.e. Baloch area), women have a little mobility outside of their home for cattle raising, supportive activities for the agricultural field work and attending some of social events like marriage or death. Another reason assigned to very low power by women is illiteracy. Due to illiteracy, women are not aware of their potential. The true potential of women is therefore not realised. The constricted view of women about their self-image and personal autonomy is rooted back to the local culture which has been entrenched for many generations, and there has been very little change across time. The connotations of the confined role of women are closely linked with the cultural beliefs and stereotypic patterns of men and women thinking about the role of women. The dominance of men, along with a very mythical view about women’s importance as per cultural norms, is another contributor to a low level of self-esteem amongst women.

Some women are of the view that the use of skills such as embroidery and sewing helps to improve their self-image. Women have used these skills for income generation to support their family and their contribution to income generation for their household to gradually allow them to voice their opinion on HH matters. The skill-based earning capability of women has led to human resource development for their HHs through education and literacy. This has served as a cause for bringing the dependency ratio down and pulling the households out of poverty. The more opportunities for such skills, the greater the likelihood of an increase in self confidence that boosts the efficiency and productivity of women in the artistic and domestic works, which subsequently help in poverty reduction at the household level.

b. Narrative of Power To

The narrative of “power to” reflects the empowerment of women with particular reference to their individual capacity, knowledge and state of their access to information. Another determinant of power to dimension of empowerment is the contribution of women to HH income, savings and access to credit. As far as this narrative is concerned, there is a slight change over the years, but the pace and ultimate impact of that change is not fairly encouraging with the perspective of the welfare level of HHs and communities.

c. State of Individual Capacity

Almost all the women have a limited individual capacity mainly due to illiteracy and cultural norms. Cultural norms usually serve as a hurdle for women, preventing them from getting education and literacy. Illiteracy amongst men and women has played an adverse role in promoting the individual capacity of women. These factors discourage women to use their potential and they fall in the lowest level of self-confidence and self-belief.

Due to remote and difficult to reach areas, there are fewer facilities available to women for educational attainment. In this way, due to limited mobility as per cultural norms, most of the women are bound to be illiterate. Women who lack individual capacity, education and/or knowledge about certain household matters pertaining to socio-economic domains, have less power to become part of the decision making process, within their respective households. Illiteracy and restricted movement outside home, coupled with the limitations of local culture placed on the
women's participation in socio-economic facets of life, are both cited as the key contributing factors to the limited individual capacity of women.

The state of women’s individual capacity with reference to an important determinant of their empowerment is generally weak across all the districts. However, the scenario is a bit distinctive in the districts of Kech and Khuzdar. Cultural connotations in these districts do not allow women to go outside of the boundary of their home as explained by the women there. Similarly, men have a little different view of women’s participation in social mobilisation and awareness raising programmes. Awareness raising programmes for women, run by institutions like UNDP, NRSP, BRSP, BISP (see section 3.2.3) have encouraged women to challenge the beliefs associated with cultural taboos. These blunt statements clearly reflect the culture, that they are leading their life in silos and the walls of such silos are multi-layered.

d. State of Women's Access to information

Many people in Kech, Loralai and Khuzdar districts cannot afford to purchase available sources of information such as TV, radio, mobile or newspaper, which is evident from the SES data of possession of HH assets. Part of the problem is accessibility, while part of it is low purchasing power. Moreover, even if the above two conditions are relaxed, men do not allow their women to have access to these sources of information, due to cultural norms and social taboos. Even watching the picture of a stranger is considered ethnically wrong. Consequently, the dream for women’s empowerment remains immaterialised. Access to information sources like cell phones is an important pathway towards women’s awareness and empowerment, even in one of the villages of the Loralai district. Generally, Loralai culture strictly does not allow women to have any kind of access to information.

Since, the majority of women only have limited access to sources of information, they are bound to accept whatever the male members are preaching at HH level. However, a few can afford and have access to the said sources of information. Furthermore, a number of respondents are of the opinion, particularly from Kech and Khuzdar districts, that they have some access to information due to the social mobilisation activities of BRSP, NRSP and other NGOs.

It has also been noted that private interventions are of much attraction for the HH, when compared to the public sector initiatives. This is because the approach of NGOs is inclusive as compared to the government where political liking and disliking may prevail for the potential beneficiaries. This proves the fact that there is great potential for doing work with local communities in Balochistan to enhance the empowerment of women if the accessibility of right information is disseminated in the right way at the right time and in a culturally sensitive manner.

e. State of women's contribution to income, savings and access to credit

The “power to” indicator related to HH income contribution by women is negligible, due to the fact that women have almost no contribution to income generation activities except for a few women from Khuzdar and Kech. However, it’s encouraging to find (during LHIs) that some of the respondents have mentioned income generation ability of women as a poverty pull factor for their household.
Since, women are not encouraged in HH decision making, related to income and expenditure therefore their control over savings is very weak, as explained by a majority of LHI respondent women and men. Patriarchal culture patterns do not allow women to participate in financial matters of the HH. They are not at the earning end so there is no power to saving. Though a rare occurrence, some educated women are empowered enough to save some money out of the income of their husbands. This may suggest that education of women is the key determinant not only of income but of saving as well. Education plays an important role in inter-generational poverty reduction.

The majority of the respondents in the sampled districts of Balochistan were of the opinion that the understanding or awareness of women about finances, is substantially low. Their role in the HH savings and financial matters is very limited. They have not been exposed to the aforementioned matters by any means in their domestic life, due to illiteracy and cultural barriers. Some evidence clearly shows that any opportunity of women's power to the pursuits of income, saving and credit may turn them from low to high trajectory of empowerment.

**iii. Narrative of Power with**

Women’s empowerment is also based on the narrative of “power with”, which accounts for the state of social capital and state of their participation in community groups. Both are complimenting each other for achieving the broader goal of women's empowerment, and their contribution towards poverty reduction.

**a. State of Social Capital**

Social capital is considered to be a “set of social relations” that provide access to resources. Social association, trust, sharing, reciprocity and collective action, are the fundamental attributes of social capital formation. Through social capital formation, individuals or groups can enhance their capacity to access resources and address their needs or interests.

---

43 Pierre Bourdieu and Coleman and Putnam et. al.
44 PhD dissertation titled as “The contribution of levels of social capital to community development” by Syed Noor Ali Tirmizi, 2005

---

**We do not go to meet anyone as across the street, there are homes of another tribe and people of our two tribes do not like to meet each other because of certain rifts**

(Wazir Bibi, Loralai district)
**b. State of Women’s Participation in Community Groups**

Cultural norms and social taboos do not allow women to participate in community groups even if they are available. Social pressure is not only from within the households and men, but from the corners of other community members (such as tribal heads and community leaders), who are reluctant to allow female participation.

In some villages of Loralai district, there is a clear reflection that women who are participating in such group meetings are not considered respected in the eyes of other community members. Furthermore, some women pointed out, that due to the tribal system and mobility constraints, they have not been able to join any formal or informal community groups of women even at vicinity level. Tribal rifts may be one of the key hurdles in the formation and sustenance of social and community groups.

Participation of women in social mobilisation activities within Khuzdar and Kech districts is encouraging. The underlying reason is acceptance of women’s mobility within the local vicinities of men. Women from Khuzdar have mentioned attainment of skills and literacy through social mobilisation Programmes of institutions like UNDP and IDSP. Similarly, participants of consultative meetings and FGDs have mentioned that women in Kech participate in social mobilisation activities carried out by Rahnuma, BISP, NCHD and the like. Very few of the women mentioned about participation in the social mobilisation sessions organised by BRSP and NRSP through the BRACE Programme.

**iv. Narrative of Power Over**

The “power over” dimension of women empowerment is significant for making a real change at HH and community level. This change leads the community to develop a self-sustaining capability in masses which can eradicate poverty and initiate sustainable and inclusive development. The key indicators of “power over” includes state of women political participation, state of men’s support for women’s rights, state of power, influence and participation of women in business, involvement and in household decision making.

Even if a woman casts a vote, she does so on the directive of her husband. Women are not set free to exercise this right of political participation during voting. “How can we cast a vote in a situation where we are not even allowed to meet our neighbours”. “All the decisions related to voting are made by our men, we are not allowed to even discuss about the vote casting at the end.”

(Maroon Bibi, Women, Khuzdar)

**a. State of Women’s Political Participation**

The findings from LHIs, FGDs and consultative meetings, reveal that political participation is almost an unknown concept for women in sampled districts. They have been rarely involved in political activities. Even if they are interested in it or some interest is created, they are ignorant of the political dynamics. Most of the women interviewed do not vote. Some of those women who cast a vote do so due to the command of their men. They follow the instructions of men for voting to a candidate and vote as per their free will. Women’s participation is thus very low in political affairs, mainly due to cultural barriers, restricted women’s mobility, low self-image, and lack of awareness about the importance to vote.

In short, women’s political participation in selected districts of Balochistan is very low, which indicates their weak political empowerment.

The deprivation of women for their political rights are also highly associated to their economic and social sufferings. Some of the quotes of women given in the text box highlight the same fact.

**b. Status of Women’s Rights**

Triangulated view of the data collected from various sources including LHIs, FGDs and consultative meetings with the government representatives provide adequate evidence that men generally do not support women rights. The situation of
women’s rights to water, food, health and education is not encouraging at all. All the matters related to women rights are decided by their men or tribal heads, obviously led by a man. They are dangerously orthodox in their dealings with women. Even the fundamental rights related to inheritance, equity and participation in the socio-economic, and political processes are generally not recognised and respected by them. Participants of the consultative meetings, FGDs and LHIs have mentioned culture as a fundamental barrier for denial of women’s rights by men. Even educated women are not given a right of free choice and employment. Women who demand their rights are considered as disgraceful by men. This situation is almost similar across all the districts and villages. However, in Pashtun communities the situation about women’s rights is gloomier. It is not only the case that rights are subjugated, but the decision about their rights lies with other influencers against their will.

Community leaders and elders possess a narrow point of view about the role of women in society and community. Culture allows the tribal leaders to decide about the education, marriages, employment of the adolescent and young girls. Their social grooming under such circumstances makes up their mind to follow the tradition without any objections. The doors of education and information are already closed.

The government has not been able to provide fair rights to women through provision of services. Even some basic rights like education, health and social protection are not adequately covered due to the ineffective system of governance as explained by the government officials. Similarly, women and men have stated that even if the women are allowed to go outside, they will not be able to meet their basic health and education rights, due to long distance of health and education facilities from the villages (as evident from villages profiles given section 2.3.1).

Therefore, local culture, societal attitudes, illiteracy and lack of awareness of women about their rights, as well as the strong influence of men to command the life trajectory of women and the inability of government to provide basic rights, are the key causes for a deprived state of women’s rights in Balochistan.

c. State of Power, Influence and participation of women in business

The primary data collected from three representative districts of Balochistan demonstrate that power, influence and participation of women in business and the market is very limited. The main factors attributed to such a low participation of women include specific emphasis of the local culture on restricting the mobility of women, lack of education and literacy skills, lack of women’s individual capacity and a lack of awareness of women about their own selves. 

Furthermore, neither men nor women respondents of LHIs, FGDs and consultative meetings supported the idea of women’s participation in economic matters and their access to the market. At some places, even the women have competency to run an independent business but men are scared to allow them. In some places, a strong will to succeed is there, but the lack of funds restricts women from initiating a business. These findings give a very rigid scenario which needs to be further studied deeply to arrive at some policy measures.
to be taken at individual, HH and community levels. Furthermore, there is clear evidence that wherever the influence and participation of women in business was facilitated (by any means), there has been a healthy impact on their empowerment. Such HHs have been able to reduce their poverty, in some of the villages of Khuzdar and Kech. Stories of women for livestock-based income generation activities and earnings from Baloch designs of embroidered clothes clearly establish this fact as well. Government officials have mentioned that government departments like agriculture, livestock, women and social development have not been able to work adequately to provide access for women to the markets. Government authorities have not taken adequate policy measures to support micro enterprise-related initiatives of women.

v. Underlying causes of the lack of women’s empowerment

The status of social, economic and political dimensions of women’s lives are highly discouraging in Balochistan overall. The social and economic strength of women in Balochistan is very low, as per the view of most of the respondents because they are not allowed to move outside home and their contribution to economic output generation for the HH is almost nil. Low intergenerational empowerment is the first and foremost cause of the low level of women’s empowerment in Balochistan. Respondents have seen their mothers as submissive household members. Similarly, mothers are illiterate, and they stick to household affairs like cooking, child rearing and taking care of elderly and the sick. Mothers had very limited or even no-mobility outside home, except the mothers in villages of Khuzdar and Kech. Hence the next generation has imprinted similar kind of disempowerment levels, as stated by the women respondents. The existing literature clearly supports this finding. Empowerment in one generation of women would have a positive influence on the lives of grown daughters and daughters-in-law.

Furthermore, culture and tribalism are the key underlying causes of disempowerment of women in Balochistan (in both Baloch and Pashtun areas), as mentioned by most respondents. Women are submissive to their male counterparts. In the male dominated society of Balochistan, women are humiliated, pressurised and discouraged, for receiving education. Baloch people are very sensitive to their culture, their women’s image and their identity. Due to the emotional attachment with the old traditional customs, norms made by the ancestors (late) and the tribal men show more consciousness for the implementation of the old customs, it is also part of tribal set up that they are ethnocentric. It has been observed that people of the Baloch community, believe that their cultural patterns regarding women related-norms and traditions are superior and better managed than any other ethnic group.
The government has not been able to provide adequate policies, resources, facilities and service (education, health and legal) to women, to address their empowerment at community or HH level, across all the districts.

vi. Impact of Women’s Empowerment on Household Poverty Dynamics

It is a key finding that women’s empowerment can potentially impact the household poverty in a positive manner. Women respondents of LHIs, participants of FGDs and consultative meetings, all emphasised that the active participation of women in household activities and external affairs can pull the household out of poverty. Both women and men have responded that women’s employment is a poverty pull factor for the household. In Khuzdar and Kech a significant proportion of about 10% men have mentioned women employment as a poverty pull event. However, none of the men respondents from Loralai believe that there is a relationship between women’s employment, and poverty reduction in a household. This reflects the different cultural context of Kech, Khuzdar and Loralai districts.

Women, who have exercised their empowerment either at social or individual levels, were able to contribute to the improvement of the household economy. Some of the women who worked outside the house due to certain compulsions were of the view that the role of women, whether working within or outside the house, is very important for pulling the family out of poverty. Their participation in outer activities may be economically beneficial for the reduction in consummation expenditure and increase in income level.

Similarly, women with better relational empowerment (access to finance, participation in HH decision making, etc.) have also stated that their household has benefited from their engagement in HH decision-making, and had a positive impact on the economic wellbeing of the family.

It remains a fact that women engaged in social work-based income generation activities like LHVs, and those involved in other income generation activities outside the home are labelled as characterless women by the rest of society in from Loralai district. However, extreme poverty and hunger have compelled these women in Loralai to seek work outside their home. In Khuzdar and Kech areas, women raise livestock and are involved in sewing and embroidery. These women can work with other women at a local level (within their vicinity), and only some of them have the freedom of mobility to main towns in order to collect inputs for their work. Some of the women are employed in government jobs after graduating from the literacy programme of one of the NGOs, as stated by respondents from consultative meetings. Women involved in income generation (by any means) across all the districts have been able to improve upon their personal and relational empowerment. Furthermore, women have stated that better awareness and empowerment helps them to indulge in the HH decision making, which in turn leads to better management of HH chores and reduces poverty.

On the other hand, some women respondents stated that the disempowerment of women can have a negative impact on HH poverty. According to them, no other intervention is so inclusive and sustainable for enhancing the wellbeing of thousands of households as that of empowering women through skill development, freedom of speech and freedom of decision making.

According to the views of respondents of FGDs and consultative meetings, education and income generating skills are the most effective contributors to poverty reduction. Education and skill literacy predominantly fall in the necessary condition for women’s empowerment for all the districts. Education includes both formal and informal learning one gets through the institution, through the family, and/or any other institution(s) respectively.

It is also evident from the existing body of literature that access to capital, savings and human resource skill development programmes positively impact the lives of rural women through increasing their income, uplifting their standard of living and improving their decision-making power in their household.  

---

Impact assessment of economic interventions of AKRSP on the lives of rural women: a case study of northern areas of Pakistan. Abdul Saboor PMAS - Arid Agriculture University, Nabila Khurshid COMSATS University Islamabad, Mar 2013
### Dimensions of Empowerment

#### Power within
- Self-esteem
- Self-confidence/efficacy
- Articulateness/confidence
- Personal autonomy

#### Power to
- Individual capacity (application of knowledge)
- Knowledge/Access to information
- Income

#### Power with
- Social Capital
- Participation in community groups
- Level of support provided by groups own initiatives

#### Power over
- Political participation
- Attitude and beliefs of people around these women/men’s support to women’s rights
- Attitude and beliefs of relations inside HH (brothers, husbands, uncles, fathers, sons)
- Attitude and beliefs of community leaders to support women’s access to courts
- Degree of influence in governing the community institutions

#### Environmental/Political & legal dimension of empowerment
- Accessibility of legal services
- Stereotypes
- Ability to influence at political level
- Advocate change for other women
- Quality of legal services
- Safety of movement outside the home

---

**Figure 6: Findings Summary of Women Empowerment Status in Sampled Districts**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimensions of Empowerment</th>
<th>Indicators of Women Empowerment</th>
<th>Khuzdar</th>
<th>Kech</th>
<th>Loralai</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Power within</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-esteem</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-confidence/efficacy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Articulateness/confidence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal autonomy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Power to</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual capacity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge/Access to info</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Income</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Power with</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Capital</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participation in groups</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level of support</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Power over</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political participation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attitude and beliefs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attitude and beliefs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attitude and beliefs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attitude and beliefs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Degree of influence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental/Political</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accessibility of services</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stereotypes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to influence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advocate change</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality of services</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety of movement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.3. Determinants of Inclusive Development

Inclusive development has a vast connotation, encompassing social, economic, political and ecological factors. With regards to social interactions, inclusive development can refer to the inclusion of groups, classes and individuals belonging to various creeds, ethnic backgrounds, genders and various other forms of identity. Economic inclusion can refer to inclusion in employment, income generation and access to resources. Political inclusion gives another view of inclusive development, including structural factors such as the distribution of power in society and the nature of the areas where elite population lives, as well as the role of individual and collective state actors. Similarly, there is an ecological dimension of inclusive development as well, which considers the inclusion of people and classes in terms of their access to various natural and ecological resources.

In this section, research findings related to determinants of inclusive development are presented from the sampled districts. Firstly, the viewpoint of respondents about various variables of inclusive development is presented from the findings within the domains of human resources, financial resources, natural resources, social and physical resources. The determinants of inclusive development have been visualised from two angles. One dimension is from the side of the process of growth and development, where we have attempted to explore whether all kinds of available resources including human resources are going to be a dynamic part of the process or not. Secondly, we will explore who benefits the most from development in comparison to other isolated and marginalised economic classes.

Generally, Balochistan is not a region that shows a good and encouraging picture of inclusive development for many segments of the society who are deprived across multidimensional levels. Rural groups, women, girls, elderly, disabled and other disadvantaged segments of the population are struggling for survival without any reasonable public support.

The specific findings as per the framework are given in the following sub-sections.

3.3.1. Inclusive development factors in the domain of Human Resources

Human resources are a significant factor of production for economists. Human resources are considered to be a pivotal contributor to inclusive development and growth. The study finds that the availability of educated and skilled human resources and equitable access of all the classes of population to schools, hospitals and social services (legal, employment, social security etc.) are the key contributors to inclusive development in the domain of human resources, as stated by the government officials. This fact has also been stated by the participants of LHIs and FGDs. A majority of FGD participants and a considerable portion of LHI respondents are of the view that the availability of literate, educated and skilled human resources are the key determinants of inclusive development.

Similarly, the inclusion of all the classes of population, creeds, tribes and people located in distant areas in the provision of health services is another significant indicator of inclusive development, as explained by the study participants (LHIs, FGDs & consultative meeting participants). LHI respondents added that health shock is an important poverty push factor. Health shocks lead to household poverty and many household deprivations (e.g. imbalance in income/expenditure, taking loans, loss of earning family
members, increased dependency ratio etc.)

Therefore, availability and access to health services can lead to inclusive development, because this can save households and communities from deterioration of their economic conditions and loss of human capital.

The state of inclusive human development is incredibly low in Balochistan across all districts. The villages of Loralai have an average literacy rate of 7.6% (total for men and women both), whereas Mera Khurd village has the lowest literacy rate of 2.8% (for both men and women). Khuzdar has a total literacy rate of 35.5%, and that of Kech is 25%, with a significant variation across the villages.\textsuperscript{49}

As education and literacy rates are low, employment and skill development indicators are therefore also low. The low human development index of these districts (i.e. Khuzdar 0.381 and Loralai 0.412)\textsuperscript{50} clearly supports these findings. Similarly, women’s participation rate in employment is 20.5% in Balochistan,\textsuperscript{51} which clearly speaks about the non-inclusiveness of women in labour force participation.

Most of the women respondents were of the view that because of the lack of education and literacy, hardly any women are employed (in the public or private sector). Moreover, the lack of access of women to education and health facilities and lack of awareness of their own potential has kept them away from the process of inclusive development. It has therefore been realised that a high proportion of the benefits of development is being enjoyed by the politically influential, especially men. Even when poor women are involved in the process of development, it is just the war of economic survival.

It is also a very important finding of the study that the government officials included in the study sample were not aware of the concept of inclusive development. Furthermore, human resource development related policy and planning processes are not based on the concept of inclusive development, as stated by the government officials. This has also been endorsed by the participants of FGDs (male and female), that their communities are not consulted for the planning of schools, water schemes, road and health facility construction. The policy and planning are top-down exercises at all the levels of governance (i.e. provincial, district).

Security related issues have led to a trust deficit between the government and general population (particularly in Khuzdar and Kech). These are mentioned as the aftermath of non-inclusive policies and governance practices. The government has not provided adequate access to social services to the poor and marginalised. Baloch and Pashtun culture in the study area has a deep relationship with malicious governance practices. The political elite and tribal heads influence the public policy and governance at all levels (i.e. provincial, district and the local vicinity). As a result, marginalised, poor, ultra-poor, disabled, labourers and very small farm holders are not included in the development schemes being planned at provincial, district and local levels.

Access to road and connectivity is another factor that has a close link with human resource development. The majority of participants from FGDs and LHIs mentioned that access to the road can bring inclusion for human development and health-related issues. In their view, road connectivity provides access to education and health facilities, as well as support for the communities to get involved in promising livelihood activities. All these factors contribute to inclusive development of poor, marginalised and neglected groups, which otherwise pose a huge challenge for poverty eradication.

Even the cost of travel for availing health services

\textsuperscript{49} See village profile given in section ...

\textsuperscript{50} Human Development Index Report 2017, UNDP

\textsuperscript{51} Ibid
(even private) becomes a huge impediment to inclusive development. The root cause to this fact is the lack of adequate health services at a reachable distance in almost all of the districts of the study.

Furthermore, government officials have stated that the policy development and governance mechanism adopted in the study districts of Balochistan is not gender-responsive. The government has not been able to introduce development programmes for the development of women and girls. BISP has been rated as a good programme which takes care of the inclusion of people from the bottom of the pyramid, women and girls. BISP-led social safety net programmes are explained as inclusive by women of all the districts.

3.3.2. Inclusive Development Factors in the Domain of Financial Inclusion

The poor masses have always been in shortage of finances for meeting both ends (i.e. income and consumption). For the poor masses of Balochistan, particularly in remote rural regions, there is limited access to financial resources for lack of saving backed by low income, seasonal unemployment and high dependency ratio. Most of the respondents have stated that the extent to which employment opportunities are given to various classes of society makes them financially inclusive.

As per SES data, unskilled labour is given as the biggest source of income by about 40% of the household included in the sample of study. Earning through skilled labour is posted as a source by only 4% of respondents in the Khuzdar and Loralai districts.

Consultative meetings and FGD respondents have supported the fact that access to loans and credit for various household and income generation activities (like finances for agriculture inputs and livestock etc.) are important indicators for financial inclusion. This finding corroborates with another one about the loans, which for various social and economic reasons are given as a significant poverty push factor by LHI participants. Pakhtun communities get Vulvar as a bride price, which is used as an input to cater to various expenditures.

Social safety net provision from the Government in the form of BISP is a key determinant of financial inclusion of ultra-poor and poor, across all the study districts. Respondents have mentioned that the funds obtained from BISP are used by beneficiaries for household expenditure and education. The inclusion of poor, marginalised and neglected classes in government schemes of financial and social security can therefore potentially impact financial inclusion. Financial inclusion in other respects, like ease of access to the bank, is not encouraging. Hardly any access exists for micro loans for household level income generating activities, especially for the poorest and for women.

3.3.3. Inclusive Development Factors in the Domain of Inclusion in Natural Resources

Access to natural, ecological or environmental resources is an important factor of inclusive development. With respect to the indicators of environmental and natural resources, the case for inclusive development in this domain are not encouraging at all, across all the sample districts of the study.

Village timeline data taken during the PRA exercise from all the villages, suggests that equitable provision of access to land (landless respondents as per SES data are 81%), natural resources like water, support of the government in agriculture, and livestock through value chain development initiatives, are the key dimensions of inclusion in natural and ecological resources.
PRA participants from almost all the villages mentioned that their villages have faced natural disasters in the last 15 to 20 years. Drought and closure of Karez in Loralai and Khuzdar have hit the agriculture badly. There have been intermittent floods in Kech district during 2011 & 2013. Non-availability of a water reservoir and small dams in Khuzdar are yet further key reasons for the loss of agricultural produce. All these factors are also explained as underlying causes of poverty. These facts substantiate that access to natural resources, particularly water and integration of all groups of people in the agriculture value chain for better access to markets are important for inclusive development through natural resources.

A government-led solar energy scheme for water supply does not provide equitably to the small farm holders. The political and social influencers take a major benefit of such schemes, as stated by the participants of consultative meetings and FGDs. Similarly, small storage facilities for water are not provided in district Khuzdar to avoid natural disasters. Respondents are of the view that from scheme design to development, all the processes adopted by the government departments were non-inclusive, as people were not consulted at planning and development stages. People from lower socio-economic classes and marginalised groups therefore remain deprived of equitable access to natural resources and are more prone to and suffer from natural disasters.

Land ownership is mostly in the hands of men, while women are not given a share from the inheritance. Almost 80% to 98% respondents (with a little variation) from ultra-poor, very poor, transitory poor and non-poor categories have no land ownership, as per SES data (Table 4 in annexures.) The skewed pattern of natural resources ownership is creating a big hurdle in the way of inclusive development.

3.3.4. Inclusive Development Factors in the Domain of Social Resources

Social inclusion related parameters are important for inclusive development and growth. Inclusion of all the social classes in the development process persuades inclusive growth. The process of improving the ability, opportunity, and dignity of those disadvantaged based on their identity to take part in society is termed as social inclusion, as defined by the World Bank.

Women’s participation in socio-economic spheres is the key component of social involvement as per the opinion of the participants of FGDs, LHIs and consultative meeting. The extent to which gender discrimination is curtailed determines the social involvement level also. The focus on providing equitable importance to include girls in the domains of education, health and nutrition, is vital to ensure their social inclusion throughout life.

However, both Baloch and Pakhtun cultures do not value or give importance to the involvement of women and girls in household decision-making, as evident from the status of women’s empowerment in the sample districts.

Similarly, government officials have explained that social association and agency of the marginalised and poor with the political and tribal elites
also determines the extent of social inclusion. This association, in turn, translates into the development of socially inclusive programmes at government level through the influence of these classes in government departments. The extent to which the opportunities for participation in social development programmes (like social mobilisation, involvement in health camps, involvement in skill development programmes) are provided to women also determine the level of social inclusion.

The participation rate of poor, deprived, and socially excluded groups in social mobilisation are emphasised as an important factor leading to social involvement and social association (explained by most of the participants of consultative meetings).

Availability of equitable opportunities to socially excluded, marginalised, women and disabled groups for employment is perceived as another indicator of social inclusion. Employment quotas for disabled and women in government employment is a leading indicator of this fact. However, inclusion indicators of women’s employment in these districts are generally weak except for Kech district (mentioned by the government officials).

In the sampled districts, social inclusion of deprived and poor classes as per PSC classification in development programmes and schemes is not much evident at the government policy and government programme level, as stated by the participants from the government departments.

The tribal system has unique values which serve as a social resource to resolve domestic conflicts which hamper the potential of human resources. This tribal mindset is highlighted as another indicator for social inclusion. Pakhtun tribes of Loralai and Baloch tribes of Khuzdar and Kech have been leading their life in this value system. There is a huge diversity in the social set up, but the key to their social system is that if they are given trust, they give back to society more than that. This study clearly demonstrates that without the participation of tribal heads and their association, any social intervention will not be leading to inclusive development.

The joint family system is given as another factor leading to social inclusion, by men respondents of LHIs. Men are of the view that there is a high probability of understanding one another’s issues in a joint family system. Such an understanding is translated into social and moral support at the time of need. Similarly, the joint family may also help in the running of businesses effectively through better work distribution among the members of households.

Furthermore, in joint families, elderly women have more freedom to make decisions for their children and grandchildren.

3.3.5. Inclusive Development Factors in the Domain of Physical Resource

Access of all the social classes to physical infrastructure is considered as a key factor for inclusion in physical resources. Major physical resources that matter the most for inclusive growth include; schools, literacy centers, skill development centres, health facilities (dispensaries, hospital etc.), roads (both from the main town to the sub-urban center and from the sub-urban center to villages), water supply infrastructure and waste management infrastructure as per the perception of study participants from all the districts belonging to government ranks.

Availability and access to household facilities like water and washrooms is another driver of physical resources-based inclusiveness. As per SES data availability of washrooms in households, the lowest is in Loralai (16%), as compared to Kech (56%) and Khuzdar (86%). Therefore, deprivation in WASH facilities worsens the health and wellness of household members. All the segments of society (including deprived and disadvantage) do not have equal access to water resources and facilities.

Most of the infrastructure of the villages provided by the government is very weak. There is a dearth of education facilities for girls in villages of Khuzdar and Loralai. Health facilities are either not available or are not provided with qualified doctors and paramedical staff. Not even a single village of the study sample has a skill development centre and adult literacy center.

Along with infrastructure, transportation and technology are the key physical resources which are termed as essentials for inclusion by almost all the government officials. Justifiable physical
resource allocation lacks across various segments of the population in the sampled districts of Balochistan. Furthermore, poor infrastructure and insufficient access to physical resources is termed as a contributor to poverty because of a lack of access to infrastructure, which impedes the participation of various classes/groups of society to economic activities, further leading to poverty. These findings clearly highlight that inclusive physical resource provision efforts have not been made by the government.

3.3.6. Inclusive Development Factors in the Domain of Political Resources

Political inclusion has manifestations such as the number of registered voters, number of active voters (both women and men), as well as access of the population to political influencers and stakeholders. Similarly, political activism and participation in political processes by people from various segments of the society are explained as key variables for political inclusion by the government officials. The inclusion level of various classes/groups for raising their voice for the issues and challenges being faced by their localities is another determinant of political inclusion.

In Balochistan, most of the development projects are in the hands of politically influential persons. These elites interfere and influence government departments, institutions and employees. Furthermore, the participants have explained that for any small to big scale infrastructure or natural resource management project, feedback of various classes/groups of the society has never been included in the planning stages. However, in some villages of Khuzdar and Kech like ..., micro-level solar schemes for water provision are planned by including representatives of COs and VOs by BRSP and NRSP respectively.

The active local government system is another enabler for political inclusion of the population, as mentioned by the government officials. The local system of governance and politics is absent in Balochistan since 2019. However, Balochistan has been the first province to conduct local body polls during 2013. As per the participants of consultative meetings and FGDs, it is very difficult in this system to vote against the will of their respective tribal leaders. Women, in particular, are politically deprived as they cannot cast their vote without the consent of their husband and father. Women’s inclusion in the political process being candidates for local bodies or provincial assembly by virtue of the prevailing quota. Here, law and policy have supported the inclusion of women in political positions, but government officials are of the belief that women have not been able to exhibit a change in their empowerment, as all the mobilisation activities of their political campaigns are carried out by men. The concentration of political resources in the hands of the politically influential few has therefore adversely affected the likelihood of the reduction of poverty and the promotion of women’s empowerment.

3.3.7. Role of Joint District Development Committee in Inclusive Development

Joint District Development Committee (JDDC) is an important structure introduced by the BRACE Programme with the support of the Government of Balochistan for improvement in the overall state of inclusive development through a close co-ordination with the local governance stakeholders. JDDC, provides a forum for joint action, collaboration and co-ordination for effective planning and management of local initiatives and to avoid duplication of effort. The capacity development process carried out by the BRACE Programme at various tiers are designed to lead to area specific local plans at the household, village, UC, tehsil and district levels (currently, only the first three are being prepared). These plans are indigenously developed by local people through an inclusive and bottom up approach. Representative

Even if a woman casts a vote, she does so, on the directive of her husband. Women are not set free to exercise this right of political participation during voting. "How can we cast a vote in a situation where we are not even allowed to meet our neighbours". “All the decisions related to voting are made by our men, we are not allowed to even discuss about the vote casting.”

(FGD, Women-Khuzdar)
members of the communities from various classes, tribes and backgrounds help in preparing the village, UC and tehsil-based plans through a participatory approach.

All the plans (finalised through a bottom up and inclusive approach) are discussed in JDDC along with other initiatives of the BRACE programme. As per the views of the BRACE Programme staff and various stakeholders of JDDC meeting in Khuzdar, it is obvious that JDDCs are pivotal to inclusive development. The overall approach adopted for preparing a development plan for various tiers of governance is based on the principles of inclusive development. Similarly, JDDC forum ensures a participatory review about the such plans while including all the stakeholders. Representatives of government service delivery departments i.e. district education officers, district health officers, social welfare directors, directors from agriculture and livestock departments, etc., take part in the JDDC for conducting the reviews of the plans. Furthermore, representatives from not-for-profit organisations, members of LSOs, etc., all participate in JDDC to this end. At district level JDDC is chaired by the concerned deputy Commissioner.

The forum of JDDC potentially provides an opportunity for addressing challenges in executing the development plans and improves upon the co-ordination mechanism desired to achieve the goals of such plans.

**BRSP has initiated social mobility of women in the local areas, through the social mobilisation activities and events. Our women go outside home and attend meetings organised by LSO, COs. Some of the women are now members of the VOs and COs.**

“There was a time when none of the women could talk to the representative (women) of an NGO. This was due to the perception that men folk often character of the NGO women. They were of the view that, Women from an NGO may spoil our women. However, this connotation has changed with the passage of time.

Our people now allow us to listen to representative women from NGOs and consider such conversations beneficial for family and society as a whole.

*(FGDs - Khuzdar)*
Social Mobilisation

Poverty Reduction
- Income Combination to Household
- Improved Participation in Household Expenditure and Income Decisions
- Decreased Dependency Ratio
- Improved Family Health
- Human Resource Development
- Inclusion of Voice in Savings and Consumption Decisions

Women Empowerment
- Agency and Relationship
- Awareness about Laws
- Personal Empowerment
- Mobility
- Income Generation
- Access to Market
- Improved Participation in Household Decisions
- Contribution to Household Income

Formation of Social Collateral
- Social Association
- Social Organisation
- Social Inclusion

Inclusive Development
- Awareness, Literacy and Skill Development
  - Skill Learning / Literacy
  - Skill Utilisation
  - Awareness about Self and Surrounding

Inclusive Development
- Improved Social Inclusion at Household Level
- Improved Social Inclusion at Community Level
- Improved Social Association with People / Groups
- Improved Political Participation
- Better Access to Local Government Institutions

Local Level Community Development
- Increased Participation in Development Planning
- Monitoring Development Schemes
- Continued Engagement with Influential Classes

Figure 7: Mind Map of Social Mobilisation for Sustainable Inclusive Development
3.4. Role of Social Mobilisation for Sustainable Inclusive Development

Social Mobilisation is a process whereby people are organised in order to enable them to collectively think and act upon their development. Furthermore, social mobilisation harnesses their inherent potential to improve their own households and livelihoods. As per the community-driven development approach of RSPs, social mobilisation consists of organising communities in rural and peri-urban areas into three tiers. At the first tier, these communities are organised into Community Organisations (COs) which work at the neighbourhood or Mohallah level. Whereas Village Organisation (VO) and Local Support Organisation (LSO) work at village and UC level respectively. A scientific inquiry about the role of social mobilisation in sustainable yet inclusive development has been an essential part of this research study.

In this section, findings on the role of social mobilisation in sustainable, inclusive development are given. In order to maintain the chronology of findings, the current state of social mobilisation activities being undertaken by the BRACE Programme is mentioned first. In the next, subsections triangulated evidence from primary and secondary data are given around the role of social mobilisation in sustainable, inclusive development.

3.4.1. Status of Social Mobilisation in Sampled Districts

Social mobilisation is the pillar which underpins the entire CDD approach of RSPs. Secondary data of the BRACE Programme reveals that there is an average of four community organisations for both men and women in all the villages of the study. There are no village organisations (for both men and women) in the sample villages of Kech district. Two out of four villages, in Loralai, have no village organisations, whereas all the sample villages in Khuzdar have organised village organisations.

Exposure and awareness of women in Loralai district about social mobilisation were not encouraging (men were the same). Only a few LHI respondents mentioned their participation in the awareness sessions organised by COs.

Due to social mobilisation we successfully motivated women to enroll in Adult Literacy Centres and they completed fast-track adult literacy course with full interest, enthusiasm and zeal. The graduated women were awarded matriculation certificates. A total of 150 women joined government to take forward many of its outreach initiatives within various public sector departments. This is one of the biggest achievements ensured through social mobilisation.

(Consultative Meeting, Kech)

“We need to get out of the influence of the tribal influencers in the matters related to women’s autonomy and participation. We don’t let our women get their rights. We even deny the women rights which are accorded as per preaching of our religion.”

(Participants of FGD, Khuzdar)

Social mobilisation ka humeh bohat faida howa hay or humari khwaten ko apnay haqooq ka pata chala hay. I.e We greatly benefited from social mobilisation, our women come to know about their rights.

(Consultative Meeting, Khuzdar)

or community resource persons. Mobility restrictions, lack of self-awareness of women and patriarchal culture pattern were the key causes for low participation of women to Loralai social mobilisation sessions.

In contrast, the situation of women’s participation in social mobilisation sessions in Khuzdar and

53 Definition of Social Mobilisation as per RSPs
Kech is encouraging. Women’s mobility up to the immediate surroundings of the house is better in these districts. Livestock training and donation of goats (by BRSP and NRSP) have supported the women in these districts to raise ruminants for their financial advantage.

3.4.2. Social Collateral Formation through Social Mobilisation and Social Inclusion

Social inclusion is one of the fundamental determinants of inclusive development and growth. Social mobilisation can potentially support the formation of social capital as per the respondents from consultative meetings. Women and men associations through COs and VOs or even through any other form of an association like pooling in money through a social structure termed as committees (collective saving), contribute to social capital formation, in one way or another. Women use their skills of sewing, embroidery and financial pooling for collecting inputs from the market. However, the aforementioned fact is given by a few women only.

Some of the women and men respondents from Khuzdar and Kech have stated an improvement in their understanding of financial matters through social mobilisation activities.

The existing literature also supports this evidence. Credit, saving and human skill development programmes can positively impact the lives of rural women through increasing their income, uplifting their standard of living and improving their decision-making power in their family.54

The social mobilisation approach has yielded positive results in organising poor women into self-help groups and linking them to banks for small credit and thus enabling them to improve their livelihoods. Consequently, concrete social capital has been created among women and the social empowerment of women has been strengthened as well55.

The findings also depict a strong correlation between social mobilisation and association with any form of social organisation and women’s empowerment. Social mobilisation improves agency and association, as stated by respondents from consultative meetings, men and women FGDs. Similarly, most respondents have mentioned that social mobilisation sessions provide an opportunity from all the social classes, tribes and creeds to become part of the socio-economic development process. The focus of BRACE Programme on including disabled men and women in the mobilisation activities also provides an opportunity of inclusion of the ones who are traditionally excluded. This fact was stated by disabled participants in FGDs conducted for men in district Loralai and Khuzdar.

Based on the findings above, it is substantiated that social mobilisation improves social capital or social collateral formation, women’s empowerment and agency. All these factors lead to social inclusion of marginal and deprived classes/groups in the socio-economic development process.

BRSP conducted a series of social mobilisation sessions for women in our community. Based on the social mobilisation and training related to livestock management, BRSP distributed 135 goats to the selected beneficiaries. Livestock distribution has helped these families strengthen their financial status. We feel that goat rearing and selling add a great value to the economic wellbeing of our household.

(FGD, Khuzdar, Women)

Prior to awareness raising social mobilisation sessions, they were of the view that poverty or economic wellbeing is due to good or bad fate. Social mobilisation positively changed their perception. However, the perception and mind set of our men is yet to be changed.

(Dolat Bibi, Khuzdar)

54 Role of Women Organisation in Development: A Case Study of AKRSP Development Projects In Northern Areas of Pakistan; Nabeela Khurshid 08-arid-12
55 Social Mobilisation-A strategy for Poverty Alleviation Andhra Pradesh India Chapter 5
Most of the respondents stated that in principle, they agree to the fact that women’s empowerment can bring about socio-economic development. Social mobilisation and awareness-raising campaigns can play a pivotal role in addressing women’s empowerment.

The areas of development wherein women’s empowerment can bring about positive change are; education, family health, family income and improved social image of the family, amongst others.

Social mobilisation-based awareness-raising has helped the women to realise their own potential. Due to improved awareness, women have handled their family health, education and expenditure in a better manner. Social mobilisation leads the women to participate in skill development programmes, as per respondents of consultative meetings in Kech. Such participation can help them acquire income generation skills also.

The participants have also mentioned that social taboos and limiting beliefs ingrained in certain areas can be addressed by fact-based social mobilisation activities. Social mobilisation is believed to be a contributor to raise awareness of men and women about their rights. All these positive effects of social mobilisation help in increasing the participation of deprived women in household and community affairs. This increases participation, and in turn, gives dividends in the form of including girls into education stream, the participation of women in household decision making and improved access of women to the institutions of government. The increased participation rate of girls in school enrolment, and income generation of women, therefore becomes a contributor to sustained development and inclusion. Social mobilisation can subordinate the effects of cultural beliefs related to the status and role of women in a household, as explained by the participants of consultative meetings. Awareness of women and men pushes back the hardened shell of cultural beliefs associated with the constricted view of women in socio-economic spheres. Therefore, women’s empowerment is imparted...
through social mobilisation, which becomes a propelling factor for improving upon their inclusion at all levels. Similar is the case of inclusion with the disabled segment of the population. Social mobilisation of the population and government institutions has led to the inclusion of disabled to development programmes and schemes.

3.4.4. Women’s Empowerment, Participation and Agency through Social Mobilisation

Most of the respondents stated that, in principle, they agree to the concept that women’s empowerment can bring about socio-economic development. The areas/fields of development wherein women’s empowerment can bring about positive change are; education, family health and family income, amongst others. It is also a fact that Pakhtun culture does not allow the involvement of women in matters/tasks to be undertaken outside the home. However, in Baloch culture, men are considered lazy as compared to women.

Social mobilisation and awareness raising campaigns can play a pivotal role in addressing these women’s empowerment issues. However, social mobilisation and awareness-raising activities need approval by the men. The men do not encourage interaction and influence of NGOs over their women. Education and literacy are considered as most effective, and a pre-requisite for women’s empowerment by most of the respondents of LHIs, FGDs and consultative meetings. Women in Khuzdar district have referred to the effective mobilisation efforts undertaken by UNDP, IDSP and BRSP as important contributors to skill development, adult literacy and increased awareness of rights.

3.4.5. The Nexus of Social Mobilisation, Inclusive Development, Governance and Women’s Empowerment

Governance and inclusive development go side by side. The more we improve the governance structure, the higher the likelihood of achieving inclusive development.

Different dimensions of inclusive development such as social, economic, political and environmental inclusion, can be addressed through social mobilisation and improved governance approaches. Women, handicapped, ethnic minorities and disadvantaged groups of people can be mobilised and organised to voice for their political rights. Similarly, social mobilisation can encourage and build the capacity of communities to influence the service delivery of government institutions positively, stated by the participants of consultative meetings. Furthermore, most of the government officials have stressed the need to make social mobilisation part of all the development programmes of the governments in all the domains, (i.e. education, health, skill development etc.).

The influence of tribal leaders over their tribal men and women is one of the key underlying causes of lacking inclusive development. Furthermore, the influence of the political elite (such as Maliks, MPAs and MNAs), as well as their lack of awareness about socio-economic challenges and needs particularly at the household level, is another factor which impedes the preparation and implementation of inclusive development-based policies and programmes, as mentioned by respondents in consultative meetings and FGDs. The respondents of FGDs and the consultative forum meeting unanimously stated the following

We don’t have the right people for the right job. HR capacity is compromised. Our officers neither know the importance not competent to conduct the research. In the coming days, I am telling you that non-availability of work and unemployment will be a big challenge in future. There may be a fight like situation in our province for getting work. Our irrigation/water resource staff don’t have any say in planning and using new irrigation system such as drip irrigation etc. All such planning is centralised in provincial level. They are planning for installing solar water pumps. How can solar pump raise the water level? We don’t have water under our soil.

(Consultative Meeting, Loralai District).
reasons and factors to be attributed to the lack of inclusive development-based governance.

Social mobilisation can potentially influence the thought process of the population to positively influence the political elites for gaining political inclusion at all levels, as government by the government officials. Accountability of the political and tribal elites can also be initiated due to increased awareness of communities based on social mobilisation. Hence, social mobilisation can be an impelling contributor to the process of political inclusion for women, marginalised, ignored and socially excluded classes/groups of society however this process will take time hence sustained support is needed.

Similarly, participants from FGDs and consultative meetings have mentioned that, social mobilisation harmonises the literacy and skill development of the people (youth, women and adults from all spheres of life). Literacy and skill development become a reason for financial inclusion and empowerment of individuals and communities. Such empowerment brings many dividends like an increase in employability and a decrease in the dependency ratio, thus leading to poverty alleviation. Literacy and skill development can bring the community and local governance institutions of the government closer, as explained by the participants of the consultative meetings. Furthermore, it is evident that social mobilisation of the local community improves upon their ability to carry out accountability and monitoring of local government institutions.

Social mobilisation bestows the power to local communities of bottom-up participation at the planning stage of government and community-led development schemes. Collectively, social mobilisation is a powerful social action that has the potential to productively influence inclusive development and governance practices at all levels.

3.5. Governance arrangements and structural changes for empowering local communities and women

3.5.1. Current State of Governance and Public Service Delivery

The existing state of governance and institutional infrastructure laid down by the government for public service delivery has been termed as highly unsatisfactory by almost all the participants of the consultative meetings and FGDs. The majority of the participants of the LHIs and FGDs (across all the districts) have given dismal views about the state of local governance institutions (education, health, women & social development, agriculture & livestock, mining etc.). There is strong resentment among most of the respondents about the working mechanism of the institutions of the government. People have difficulties in accessing basic services like health, education, water, livestock care and agriculture care. Respondents have stated that the government has failed on many fronts for employment generation and skill development.

SES data shows that education and health are severe problems for 49% and 96% of household respondents, respectively. Poverty and access to credit are rated as severe problems by a majority of 58% and 97% of the total household respondents.

Similarly, most of the respondents ranging from 25% to 40% are either moderately unsatisfied or highly unsatisfied from basic social services provided by various government arrangements like LHVs, schools, veterinary clinics, police, water provision, and agricultural services.

Public sector service delivery is dismal in almost all the sectors including education, health, skill development, agriculture, livestock, social and women’s development and mining, and is severely below the mark as per the government officials and FGD participants. Furthermore, it has been explained by the government officials that the service delivery in these domains is highly ineffective across all sectors. For example, in education, the curriculum has been termed as ineffective, while in health and agriculture, the poor technical competence of staff, lack of focus on research and lack of knowledge about agriculture
planning and development are given as areas have all underperformed. Continued insecurity and the deteriorating law and order situation have led to a huge trust deficit between the people and the government in Khuzdar and Kech districts. Some people have lost an emotional and ideological attachment with the government due to the prevailing situation of insecurity.

Government policies and development programmes are largely flawed and non-inclusive. Inclusive governance will remain an unrealised dream for Balochistan due to a host of factors; including non-availability of competent human resources in the government, lack of bottom-up planning and policy development, and passive work culture. Policy and development programme design is driven from the provincial level down to the district and tehsil level. Flawed planning and allegedly misappropriated allocation of resources are given as other reasons which further add to the malfunctioning of the government departments.

Local government bodies are non-functional after completion of their term in Dec 2018. This inactivity of local bodies has further complicated the government service delivery at the local level.

### 3.5.2. Structural Changes in Governance for Empowering Women and Local Communities

All the participants of consultative meetings have mentioned a need for reorganisation of the existing governance structure for ensuring community development, women’s empowerment and a regime of initiating inclusive development.

#### i. Decentralisation of Governance

It has been mentioned by the government officials that all the elements of government related to
Unfortunately, there is an indigenous resentment among the people of Jhalwaan region against the state. People are completely dis-associated from the state, due to the lack of basic utilities that has to be provided by the government. LOG HAKUMAT SAY BOHAT DOUR CHALAY GAIE HAIN.

Our government has not been able to steer our youth towards the right path of constructive development. Overall the element of violence within the society has spurred in last ten to twelve years. The violence has let our youth lose its faith on the government and hence they have been disengaged from the government organs. Youngsters are becoming drug addicts and very likely to fall prey in the hands of violent forces. Parents don’t know where their children are and what they do and children don’t bother to take their parents in loop for their day to day matters.

We need to adopt indigenous effective measures in order to educate youth and associated with the ideology of our country. We need to provide young people with education, health and sports facilities. We need to inculcate patriotism & trust in our country and in the government institutions. It is certainly possible through an able governance system which justifiably plans and invest its resources for the provision of basic services, facilities, education, training and employment to our people.

(Consultative Meeting, Khuzdar).

Failure of our education system due to ineffective governance is yet another major cause of poverty in our district. The current education system has badly failed in human resource development. People come to us with master’s degree but unfortunately, they do not know the basics concepts, their concepts are not clear. We must invest more time and money to make them competent for the job assigned to them. Our curriculum is outdated and archaic. The required human development through the existing curriculum and education system is not possible. "We should change our curriculum, we should hire a khudkush (Suicide) bomber to destroy the existing one, once and for all, because it adds no value to our people’s competence. Yeh curriculum kissi kaam ka nahi hai, yeh munshi paida ker sakta hai, chai cigrette peenay waly paida ker sakta hain, deewaan aur mehfiloon kailye banday paida ker sakta hai, muft tankha lainay waly paida ker sakta hain, lekin value added resource paida nahin ker sakta. Hum khawar hou gaey hain logoon kou sikhattay skuikhattay, laikin koi bara banda paida nahin ho raha hai”. Hakumat Apni Koum Ki Tarbiyaat Kernay Mein Buri Tarha Nakaam Rahi Hai. The above is the bitter criticism of existing curriculum being taught in education institutions of Balochistan Province.

(Consultative Meeting, Kech District ).
public service delivery, once decentralised from provincial level to district and tehsil level, can empower the women and local communities. A bottom-up approach for the planning of development programmes is required if empowering women and communities is to be the main aim. District and tehsil level officials need to prepare the plans for their respective departments. Such plans should include the voice of local communities through their own community institutions and other local stakeholders, e.g. locally elected representatives, community elders, people from all the socio-economic classes, creeds and tribes. Women need to be made an integral part of the planning process.

Such a decentralised approach will redirect the focus of planning to rightly prioritise all the

Our life is by and large governed by our culture, with the tribal system at its core. Our political culture concentrates the power in the hands of “Sardars” and Tribal Leaders. In Balochistan, inclusive development is a cry nothing more than a slogan and myth. All the planning and execution is top down. Planning and budgets are under strict control of maliks, sardars, political elites or bureaucracy. We are at the mercy of ministers and sardars for all the functions and development.

We seriously need the placement of right man for the right job. On one hand we need competent human resource and on the other we need reforms in the overall structure of governance.

Humary woh afsar jou ko kaam kerna chantay hain unn kou krny nahin deya jata. Bas hum b majbori mein kam krty hein. “Nah kuch Aap ky hath mein hy nah merry hath mein.”

We have no power and no authority in performing our duties rather we are dictated by Sardars, Nazims, Ministers and higher level bureaucracy.

(Consultative Meeting, Loralai)
development issues at the local level. Decentralised planning will therefore ensure inclusion at all levels. This element of inclusion can translate into improved empowerment of women as they will be an integral part of development programmes.

**ii. Co-Ordination of Departments for Effective Decentralised and Bottom-Up Planning**

As per the participants of consultative meetings, the existing governance model lacks coherence and coordination within the departments at the planning and execution stages. Socio-economic development requires an integrated approach for planning and service delivery. The process of planning for government service delivery needs to be coordinated among all the development stakeholders of the government, as well as that of non-government. All the activities of a development plan should be designed in close coordination with all the other government departments. An all-inclusive planning approach will therefore ensure that all classes/groups of society benefit from inclusive growth. Inclusive and coordinated planning will lead to inclusion and empowerment of women, and thus women's participation will reduce poverty.

**iii. Restructuring the Role of Human Resource in Government Service Delivery Departments**

Human resource incompetence, their complacent attitude towards work, political and bureaucratic interference at provincial and districts levels for postings and transfers, non-existing performance management, and their punishment and reward system are given as the key causes for malfunctioning institutions, by the government officials. Human resource hiring and deployment-related policies need changes in terms of introducing a unique framework of hiring, performance management and compensation, as well as a reward system. This policy-level change will enable the province to have a capable human resource for public service delivery. The capable human resource will undertake its responsibilities in accordance with the requirements of inclusive development.

**iv. Introduction and Compliance to Monitoring, Supervision and Evaluation Procedures**

Weak monitoring and evaluation systems for the overall operations of government service delivery departments is a key contributor to the weaker governance of the institutions, as stated by the government officials. All the government departments need a comprehensive monitoring and control system, as mentioned by the participants of consultative meetings. The goals of inclusive development and women empowerment will be materialised through continued monitoring of indicators set up for these goals in various development schemes.

**v. Social Mobilisation and CDD as an Enabler for Changing the Structure of Governance System**

All the public and private sector schemes should be prepared in participation/partnership with the communities. All the maintenance work should be handed over to the local committees. JAB TAK MAMLAT LOGON TAK NA LE KER JAIEN MASAIEL HAL NAHI HO SAKTAY HAIN (Decentralisation of powers and effective participation of public is important for improvement). Social mobilisation is an effective approach to do that.

(Consultative Meeting, Khuzdar)
planning approach. Under the BRACE Programme organised communities have begun to undertake planning at household level through Micro Investment Plans (MIP), at village level through Village Development Plans (VDP) and union council level through Union Council Development Plans (UCDP).

Social mobilisation enables the communities to oversee the performance of the government system for all the areas of development. Therefore, community-driven monitoring can ensure efficiency in the governance system.

Government officials have further stated that social mobilisation strategies, methods and approaches, need to be an integral part of all the development programmes of the government. This is an essential and inevitable structural change in the government, required in the service delivery and planning within all government departments. Mobilised communities can make the service delivery inclusive at all levels because any inequality and non-compliance to the planning can be closely monitored by the community.

Social mobilisation can potentially impact the governance model related structural changes at all levels (i.e. district, technical and union council) since mobilisation can build the capacity of communities for better governance and monitoring of governance systems at the local level.

vi. Reinstation of Local Bodies and Capacity Development of Members of Local Bodies

The absence of local bodies is highlighted as one of the vital causes for continued misgoverning in the province of Balochistan by almost all the participants of consultative meetings. Furthermore, participants were of the view that only reinstating local bodies will not solve the governance related problems faced by the population. To ensure effective local bodies, the first and foremost need is to build and develop the capacity of local body representatives. Necessary structural changes for capacity development of representatives of local union, tehsil and district councils are inevitable for ensuring smooth working of such representatives. Capacity development is desirable in the areas of social mobilisation, joint planning, health, education, water management, agriculture and livestock management, as suggested by the government officials. Based on this capacity, the local counselors and other representatives will be able to participate in bottom-up planning, community driven monitoring & oversight, effective budgetary utilisation, and maintaining transparency during the execution of public service delivery processes, as mentioned by the government officials.

Local government system is paralyzed. Our institutions need dynamic leadership and revival. Honest and committed leadership is required at all levels (i.e. community, politics, district administration etc.). We need to empower union councils. We need to empower our local counselors. We need to empower union councils as bodies as well as their staff. We need to bring structural changes in the local governance system. All the resources at local government level should be under the supervisory, monitoring control of the counselors. Only empowered and capable UC members should be made responsible to manage the schools, health and other social issues like smooth functioning of LHV’s, dispensaries etc.

Abhi tou problem yeh hai kay appointment kahian aur hai aur banda kahain aur baitha hai, kiyoon nizam sab maflooj hai. There is favoritism and corruption in appointments. Newly appointed Govt servants are not dutiful and work somewhere else.

(Consultative Meeting, Kech)
vii. **Role of JDDC and the State of Local Governance**

JDDC is a significant structure to bridge up the gap in the demand as well as supply side of public services, as explained by the BRACE Programme staff. Area specific local development plans are an evidence of joint action by the community. Furthermore, the development plans are prepared for different levels of governance structure. The preparation of these plans by the community members provides an evidence about the usefulness of capacity development initiatives of the BRACE Programme.

These plans are periodically discussed in respective JDDCs (of the district). In this manner JDDC acts as a catalyst for effective implementation of such plans. Similarly, JDDC is a recognised and agreed upon arrangement to improve the local governance at all the levels i.e. UC, tehsil and district. Therefore, JDDC is a driver of inclusive development as well as inclusive governance. JDDC model can potentially guide local government officials about the desirable structural changes related to co-ordination, reporting, budget utilisation, monitoring and control etc. in the local governance mechanism.

The role of JDDC in improving the state of local governance for the larger benefit of the general public based on the principles of inclusive development will be continuously referred in the upcoming waves of the study.

However, it should be noted that JDDCs are not as yet formalised part of local governance system. It is hoped that the role of JDDCs will be formalised in the CD-LGRD PFW and that the mandate of JDDCs will be officially notified and backed up with suitable changes in rules of business. Subsequently it is also anticipated that various development plans prepared and monitored through JDDCs will attain adequate budgetary allocations through legitimate changes in public financial management framework. Based on the aforementioned provisions JDDCs will be in a position to provide ‘supply’ to the ‘demand’ created by the community institutions through their planning processes. In the absence of the said provisions, the probability is high that JDDCs will only be ‘project committees’ and their probable impact will diminish once the programme is completed. The opportunity is highly visible to mainstream JDDCs through inclusion in CD-LGRD PFW for longer term benefits.

Local bodies of Musharraf era (i.e. 2002), is referred to as best model for improving local governance by the government officials.
Current Challenges in Local Governance
- Lack of appropriately skilled human resource
- Human resource development
- Centralized and top down approach
- for policy and development
- Political and bureaucratic influence
- Non-inclusive governance model
- Absence of local bodies and representatives
capacity development of local bodies staff for
effectives and oversight of public service

Effects of Malfunctioning Governance
- Ineffective and non-inclusive development
- Inefficient government service delivery
- Poverty and dearth of capable human resource
- Lack of women participation in
development process
- Concentration of power in a few political,
tribal and bureaucratic circles

Mitigating The Root Cause of Malfunctioning Governance

Structural Changes in Governance
- Decentralized governance model
- Bottom up approach for public policy
- Improved coordination and communications between government
departments for policy and development programme
- Restructuring of human resource hiring, deployment and development
- Effective monitoring, supervision and procedure for the
Government service delivery
- Social mobilisation for community driven development
at the heart of all government policies
and programmes
- Improved inclusive development
- Reinstation of local bodies

Women Inclusion through Public Policy and Development Programmes
- Women education and literacy
- Skill development of women
- Culture responsive social mobilisation of women
Inclusive development and poverty alleviation

Inclusive development and poverty alleviation strategies need to focus on several key areas:

1. **Skill Development:** Providing vocational and technical training to individuals to enhance their employability and earning potential.
2. **Healthcare Initiatives:** Access to healthcare services, especially in rural areas, to improve health outcomes and reduce poverty levels.
3. **Financial Inclusion:** Expanding access to banking and financial services to ensure that everyone has access to credit.
4. **Education:** Investment in education to improve literacy rates and provide better opportunities for the future.
5. **Social Mobilization:** Engaging communities in decision-making processes and empowering them to address local challenges.

These strategies, if implemented effectively, can contribute significantly to reducing poverty and promoting inclusive development.
This field research was conducted in Khuzdar, Kech and Loralai by employing mixed method approach. The composite results from the findings derived
from PSC, SES, LHI, FGDs and Consultative Meetings are concluded as follows:

4.1. **Dynamics of Household Poverty in Balochistan**

- Un-employment/underemployment, high dependency ratio, higher inflation, illiteracy and lack of employable skills, health shocks, loans for social and economic reasons, are the main poverty push factors across all the districts. Natural disasters like dearth of water and floods also lead to poverty

- Lack of water storage structures and inappropriately constructed dams due to lack of competence of government staff poses agriculture losses and hence leads to poverty

- In terms of likelihood or probability of events to push a household into poverty, natural disasters (drought, have 50% likelihood to be a poverty push factor. Death shocks and illiteracy are likely to be poverty push events, with a probability of 29% & 23% respectively. un-employment as well as lesser income attracts a likelihood level of 22.5%, to be a poverty push factor.

- Human resource development/skill training, income generation from livestock, decreased dependency ratio, availability of water for agriculture produce are the main pull factors.

- Decrease in dependency ratio and increase in income from livestock have a likelihood of 17% to be poverty pull factor. Social safety net provided by the government has 14% probability to be a poverty pull event. Literacy and education have a likelihood of 9.3% for being a poverty pull determinant.

4.2. **Women Empowerment and its Role in Household Poverty Alleviation**

- Mothers’ role within HH is concentrated on handling of HH chores like cooking, cleaning, child rearing, providing care of elderly people etc. in Pakhtun areas.

- In Baloch areas (Khuzdar and Kech), the snap-shot of mothers’ role profile included; housekeeping, cooking and serving food to the HH members, taking care of all children in terms of feeding etc. Only a few mothers have been involved in mobility outside home for some HH chores like livestock feeding etc.

- Women education, literacy, skill training, social organisation and mobilisation can impart women empowerment

- Women empowerment and participation in HH chores can lead to poverty reduction

- Empowered women can influence government service delivery based on their awareness and mobilisation

4.3. **Inclusive Development, Social Mobilisation and Structural Changes in the Governance**

- Inclusive development and governance in Balochistan is non existent due to lack of the capacity of government officials and top down policy and development programme design

- Bottom up governance arrangements coupled with indigenous engagement of citizens through provision of education, health and employment opportunities etc are the keys to improve local governance

- Improvement in local governance through provision of better education, health services and employment opportunities while harnessing the potential of agriculture value chain can lead to poverty reduction

- Local governance system needs to be placed across the Balochistan province.
Local bodies need to be capacitated in terms of the awareness and skills of local body representatives in the areas of financial management, scheme design, monitoring, social mobilisation and joint civic action etc. Institutional capacity of local government bodies in terms of facilities, services, office equipment and resources required to support the overall management of local governance initiatives etc.

Social mobilisation can bridge the gap between communities and local government institutions and this can be used as a lever for improving the government service delivery because it can empower communities to get involved in the local development initiatives viz a vi local government officials.

Social mobilisation can empower women at all levels.

Social mobilisation has the potential to eradicate the stigmatic connotations found in our social and culture fabric for participation of women in various household chores and socialisation related events.

Government needs to provide a safe, secure and terrorism free conducive environment to its people so that state and people cohesion can be improved.

Government needs to introduce conducive and inclusive policies for education, health, employment, agriculture, livestock, mining etc.

4.4. Recommendations

Considering the study findings, it is highly desirable to introduce inclusive development-based approach in CD-LGRD PFW being developed for Balochistan for sustainable poverty reduction and women’s empowerment. Participation of the people, especially the disadvantaged has to be assured and the PFW must reflect this inclusion. This essentially means that a bottom-up policy design approach should be followed that allows for the participation of the neglected groups in the process of community driven local development. This can happen after the people are organised into their own community institutions and begin to engage with the local authorities.

PFW needs to allow local authorities to engage with the community institutions on a longer-term basis, i.e., the local authorities must have the official mandate (through policy and business rules), resources (through budgetary allocations), and capacities (through human resource development) to fully engage with community institutions. This is an engagement that would lead to women’s empowerment and inclusive development and both these factors will contribute to poverty reduction.

Government departments should be strengthened through a consistent policy of inducting, retaining and competence development of human resource involved in service delivery for basic services (like health, education, skill development, mining, agriculture & livestock, public health engineering, etc).

Government of Balochistan should assign a priority for continuously improving road and digital communications infrastructure within the province. To this end the existing road infrastructure recently developed under CPEC should be leveraged for local industry.

Alongside road and digital infrastructure conducive policies for market development (both local and international) should be introduced to help in selling the outputs in a value-added manner.
Education and literacy, especially for girls, should be assigned top priority in policy, planning, resource allocation and implementation, etc. Gender segregated educational institutions both for boys and girls should be opened at the accessible distance. Besides, adult literacy centres especially for females should be opened. In these literacy centres all the three components of literacy, i.e. basic literacy (Reading, Writing, and Numeracy), life skills-based literacy, and income generation skills literacy should be imparted in an integrated manner.

Social mobilisation strategy should be one of the main pillars of the policy. For without involving the people, no sustainable poverty reduction, women’s empowerment and inclusive development can be impactful and sustainable. CD-LGRD PFW must include detailed provisions and guidelines regarding establishment partnerships with RSPs and community institutions; roles, responsibilities and functions of community institutions; funding for community institutions and development plans prepared by them with local authorities; guidelines and frameworks for assessment of community institutions and monitoring and evaluation of their activities should be introduced. Women’s empowerment process can be accelerated by including more women in the community institutions, building their capacities and supporting their self-identified activities for income generation. Further, women should have opportunities to benefit from adult literacy and numeracy skills (ALNS) programmes, technical and vocational skills training (TVET) programme, awareness raising session on key cross-cutting themes, e.g. health, education, civic rights, nutrition, etc. Market driven income generating activities for women should be supported and efforts should be made to add value to their labour.

Existing infrastructure of basic services (health, education, skill development, mining, agriculture & livestock, public health engineering, etc.) should be gradually strengthened in order to fulfil the local community requirements.

Structural changes in local governance such as reinstating of local bodies and capacity development of the local government staff (in the areas of community led development initiative planning, scheme design, scheme monitoring, social mobilisation, etc.), should be the main pillars of the policy. Furthermore, in order to empower these local bodies, powers should be decentralised.

Coordination, collaboration and partnership amongst various development partners, service providers and social organisations should be improved through mutually agreed policy, joint planning and partnership-based implementation and monitoring and evaluation. JDDC should be strengthened, activated and made effective.

These recommendations should be considered for inclusion in the CD-LGRD PFW being developed.

Appropriate social mobilization approaches, which are acceptable by men folk and are not in direct contradiction of the cultural norms, should be adopted. It is suggested, that men should be sensitized about the importance of role of women at the first place through social mobilisation activities. Engaging all local stakeholders, including local notables, formal, informal and religious leaders, is important. During the process of this engagement the objectives, approach and methodology of social mobilisation should be explained. Relevant examples from within the tehsil or district should be shared with these notables. In some cases, it may be important for such local leaders to visit other nearby communities where social mobilisation process has begun and households are already gaining benefits. Since BRSP is already working with the religious leaders under the Madaris Mainstreaming Programme, therefore some of key resource persons from this project can also facilitate in conduction of effective community dialogues around the importance of women in the society. Similarly, the importance of the role of women should be highlighted to male members of the community from various aspects. The

---
56 These plans are Micro Investment Plan (MIP) at the household level, Village Development Plan (VDP) at the village level, and Union Council Development Plan (UCDP) at the union council level. Later all the UCDPs would be consolidated at the district level into District Development Plan (DDP).
role of women in the society as per teachings of our religion, the importance of women rights, importance of role of women in the household chores like health, education, child upbringing, as well as their potential to make economic contributions to the household, are the elements, that should be included in the social mobilisation sessions with men folk. The emphasis should be exerted on the education as an important right of men and women. Similarly, women’s right to health, better living conditions, their right of respect for their privacy and their overall importance in a household and society should be discussed continuously during such sessions with men. This kind of sensitization will support in positively levelling the perception of men about importance of women. Identification of local champions would further support RSPs’ efforts to reach out to rural women for their effective mobilisation and organisation.

- Huge investments are being made by the Government of Pakistan, Government of Balochistan under the China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) in the province. Other donors are also investing in the province. While most of the investments are being made at the macro-level, EU through the BRACE Programme is investing at the micro level, in mobilising and organising the rural households into their own community institutions. A strategic opportunity exists through CD-LGRD PFW to rollout the approach across all the remaining districts of Balochistan. CD-LGRD PFW can facilitate all stakeholders from macro, meso and micro levels to develop synergies for poverty reduction, inclusive development and women’s empowerment in Balochistan.
ANNEXURES
### Table 1: Demographic Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Demographic Characteristics</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total HHs</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average of HH Size</td>
<td>7.378472</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of people are under 18 or above 65</td>
<td>710</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor HHs</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average of Poor HHs</td>
<td>17.333</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 2: PSC Wise Education Status of Household Head

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PSC Range</th>
<th>No Education (%)</th>
<th>Up to Class 5 (%)</th>
<th>Class 5 to 10 (%)</th>
<th>Class 11 &amp; Above (%)</th>
<th>Total (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ultra Poor (0-11)</td>
<td>48 (85.71)</td>
<td>6 (10.71)</td>
<td>2 (3.57)</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
<td>56 (100)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chronically Poor (12-18)</td>
<td>42 (80.77)</td>
<td>6 (11.54)</td>
<td>3 (5.77)</td>
<td>1 (1.92)</td>
<td>52 (100)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transitory Poor (19-23)</td>
<td>33 (68.75)</td>
<td>10 (20.83)</td>
<td>5 (10.42)</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
<td>48 (100)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transitory Vulnerable (24-34)</td>
<td>34 (60.71)</td>
<td>6 (10.71)</td>
<td>9 (16.07)</td>
<td>7 (12.5)</td>
<td>56 (100)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transitory Non-Poor (35-50)</td>
<td>20 (47.62)</td>
<td>7 (16.67)</td>
<td>8 (19.05)</td>
<td>7 (16.67)</td>
<td>42 (100)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Poor (51-100)</td>
<td>14 (41.18)</td>
<td>4 (11.76)</td>
<td>6 (17.65)</td>
<td>10 (29.41)</td>
<td>34 (100)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>191</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figures in parenthesis are percentages, \( \text{Pearson Chi}^2(15) = 55.1251 \), \( P < 0.000 \)

### Table 3: Top Reasons for Not Going to School

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reasons</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Response Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Poverty</td>
<td>266</td>
<td>29.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parents not permit</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>10.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School far away</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>10.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child not ready</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>7.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Costly</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>5.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Helping in work</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>3.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 4: District Wise Primary Work Status of the Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pull Events Primary Work Status</th>
<th>Khuzdar</th>
<th>Kech</th>
<th>Loralai</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Freq</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Freq</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unskilled labour/ mazdoori</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farm labor (cultivation/harvesting)</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultivation on partnership/share crop</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skilled labor</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business/ trade</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-cultivator/own farm</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Livestock (only)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Govt job</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private job</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Household chores/work</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family helper without monetary payment</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Begging</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>153</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5: PSC Wise Livestock Ownership

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PSC Range</th>
<th>Buffalo/bull</th>
<th>Buffalo &amp; Sheep</th>
<th>Sheep/Goat</th>
<th>No Livestock</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ultra Poor (0-11)</td>
<td>0 (0.00)</td>
<td>0 (0.00)</td>
<td>4 (7.14)</td>
<td>52 (92.86)</td>
<td>56 (100.00)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chronically Poor (12-18)</td>
<td>5 (9.62)</td>
<td>0 (0.00)</td>
<td>8 (15.38)</td>
<td>39 (75.00)</td>
<td>52 (100.00)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transitory Poor (19-23)</td>
<td>5 (10.42)</td>
<td>2 (4.17)</td>
<td>8 (16.67)</td>
<td>33 (68.75)</td>
<td>48 (100.00)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transitory Vulnerable (24-34)</td>
<td>2 (3.57)</td>
<td>3 (5.36)</td>
<td>10 (17.87)</td>
<td>41 (73.21)</td>
<td>56 (100.00)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transitory Non-Poor (35-50)</td>
<td>4 (9.52)</td>
<td>6 (14.29)</td>
<td>17 (40.48)</td>
<td>15 (35.71)</td>
<td>42 (100.00)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Poor (51-100)</td>
<td>9 (26.47)</td>
<td>3 (8.82)</td>
<td>11 (32.35)</td>
<td>11 (32.35)</td>
<td>34 (100.00)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>25 (8.68)</td>
<td>14 (4.86)</td>
<td>58 (20.14)</td>
<td>191 (66.32)</td>
<td>288 (100.00)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figures in parenthesis are percentages. Pearson $\chi^2$(15) = 68.9781 \( Pr. = 0.000 \)

Table 6: PSC Wise Land Ownership

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PSC Range</th>
<th>No Land</th>
<th>&lt;12.5 Acre</th>
<th>&gt;12.5 Acres</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ultra Poor (0-11)</td>
<td>55 (98.21)</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
<td>1 (1.79)</td>
<td>56 (100.00)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chronically Poor (12-18)</td>
<td>50 (96.15)</td>
<td>1 (1.92)</td>
<td>1 (1.92)</td>
<td>52 (100.00)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transitory Poor (19-23)</td>
<td>43 (89.58)</td>
<td>2 (4.17)</td>
<td>3 (6.25)</td>
<td>48 (100.00)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transitory Vulnerable (24-34)</td>
<td>47 (83.93)</td>
<td>7 (12.50)</td>
<td>2 (3.57)</td>
<td>56 (100.00)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transitory Non-Poor (35-50)</td>
<td>30 (71.43)</td>
<td>11 (26.19)</td>
<td>1 (2.38)</td>
<td>42 (100.00)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Poor (51-100)</td>
<td>9 (26.47)</td>
<td>20 (58.82)</td>
<td>5 (14.71)</td>
<td>34 (100.00)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>234 (81.25)</td>
<td>41 (14.24)</td>
<td>13 (4.51)</td>
<td>288 (100.00)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figures in parenthesis are percentages. Pearson $\chi^2$(10) = 96.0392 \( Pr. = 0.000 \)
### Table 8: District Wise Summary Statistics of Total Annual Household Income (PKR)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>District</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Khuzdar</td>
<td>364,737</td>
<td>603,931</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kech</td>
<td>151,637</td>
<td>256,739</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loralai</td>
<td>210,867</td>
<td>124,881</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>243,482</td>
<td>397,913</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 9: Average Percentage Share of Household Expenditure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>District</th>
<th>Food</th>
<th>Non-Durable</th>
<th>Durable</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Khuzdar</td>
<td>83.8</td>
<td>13.9</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kech</td>
<td>84.7</td>
<td>13.8</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loralai</td>
<td>83.9</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>84.2</td>
<td>13.2</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 10: District Wise Summary Statistics of Annual Total Household Expenditure (PKR)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>District</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Khuzdar</td>
<td>255738.6</td>
<td>244193.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kech</td>
<td>339907.8</td>
<td>465706</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loralai</td>
<td>186905.3</td>
<td>172965.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>261328.6</td>
<td>324851.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 11: District Wise Summary Statistics of Total Household Loans (PKR)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>District</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Khuzdar</td>
<td>1572.9</td>
<td>7609.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kech</td>
<td>4071.4</td>
<td>18913.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loralai</td>
<td>127872.3</td>
<td>304480.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>43645.8</td>
<td>182821.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 12: District Wise Summary Statistics of Total Household Savings (PKR)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>District</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Khuzdar</td>
<td>1662.8</td>
<td>2709</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kech</td>
<td>7742.6</td>
<td>76599.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loralai</td>
<td>1615.3</td>
<td>9013.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>2954.3</td>
<td>36441.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 1: Mobilization of HHs and Number of Community Institutions Under BRACE Programme

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No.</th>
<th>Village</th>
<th>Total HHs</th>
<th>Organised HHs</th>
<th>% HHs Organised</th>
<th>Total COs</th>
<th>Female COs</th>
<th>Male COs</th>
<th>Mix COs</th>
<th>Total VOs</th>
<th>Female VOs</th>
<th>Male VOs</th>
<th>Mix VOs</th>
<th>LSOs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Meer Nizar Muhammad</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Baloch Abad Ward</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Kunchiti Mashriqi</td>
<td>190</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Peerani Lamb</td>
<td>196</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Kili Yar Muhammad</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Hinar Noghey</td>
<td>138</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Mehmoodani</td>
<td>189</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Sabazal Khanzai</td>
<td>196</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Kashkai Nuskhel</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Mara Khurd</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Yaro Shehar</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>156</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Malak Muhammad Jan</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,586</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,087</strong></td>
<td><strong>849</strong></td>
<td><strong>102</strong></td>
<td><strong>56</strong></td>
<td><strong>45</strong></td>
<td><strong>1</strong></td>
<td><strong>24</strong></td>
<td><strong>10</strong></td>
<td><strong>12</strong></td>
<td><strong>2</strong></td>
<td><strong>6</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 2: Community Investment Fund (CIF) and Income Generating Grants Interventions of Brace Programme

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S/NO.</th>
<th>Village</th>
<th>Community Investment Fund (CIF)</th>
<th>Income Generating Grants (IGG)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0-23 HHs</td>
<td># CIF Benef HHs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Meer Nizar Muhammad</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Baloch Abad Ward</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Kunchiti Mashriqi</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Peerani Lamb</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Kili Yar Muhammad</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Hinar Noghey</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Mehmoodani</td>
<td>129</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Sabazal Khanzai</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Kashkai Nuskhel</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Mara Khurd</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Yaro Shehar</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Malak Muhammad Jan</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>730</strong></td>
<td><strong>71</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S/NO.</td>
<td>Village</td>
<td>Tech &amp; Vocational Skills Trg.</td>
<td>Persons with Disability (PWD)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pax Trained in TVST</td>
<td>Total Persons with PDs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Meer Nizar Muhammad</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Baloch Abad Ward</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Kunchiti Mashriqi</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Peerani Lamb</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Kili Yar Muhammad</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Hinar Noghey</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Mehmoodani</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Sabazal Khanzai</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Kashkai Nuskhel</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Mara Khurd Malak</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Yaro Shehar</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Malak Muhammad Jan</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>28</strong></td>
<td><strong>51</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S/NO.</td>
<td>Village</td>
<td>Adult Literacy &amp; Numeracy Skills (ALNS)</td>
<td>Youth Recreational Activities (YRA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No. of Women ALNS Participants</td>
<td>No. of YRA Events</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Meer Nizar Muhammad</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Baloch Abad Ward</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Kundhiti Mashriqi</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Peerani Lamb</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Kili Yar Muhammad</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Hinar Noghey</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Mehmoodani</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Sabazal Khanzai</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Kashkai Nuskhel</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Mara Khurd</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Yaro Shehar</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Malak Muhammad Jan</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>32</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Annexure C: Images of Data Collection from Field
"This Publication has been produced by Rural Support Programmes Network (RSPN) with assistance of the European Union. The content of this publication are the sole responsibility of the authors and can in no way be taken to reflect the views of the European Union or RSPN."

More information about European Union is available on:
Web: http://eeas.europa.eu/delegations/pakistan/
Twitter: @EUPakistan
Facebook: EUinPakistan