



EUROPEAN UNION



## PROGRAMME FOR IMPROVED NUTRITION IN SINDH

In support of the Accelerated Action Plan, Government of Sindh



**Consultative Workshop with the Directorate of Animal Husbandry, Sindh to Review the Re-engagement Strategy and Sustainability of CLEWs**

Hyderabad - 4<sup>th</sup> October, 2021



PINS is funded by the European Union

[www.rspn.org](http://www.rspn.org)

[www.aap.gos.pk](http://www.aap.gos.pk)

[www.facebook.com/ProgrammeforImprovedNutritioninSindh/](https://www.facebook.com/ProgrammeforImprovedNutritioninSindh/)

[www.facebook.com/RSPNPakistan](https://www.facebook.com/RSPNPakistan)

**Developed by:**

Rabab Jafar – Communications Officer – PINS ER-3

**Contributors:**

Zaheer Ahmed – Capacity Building Officer – PINS ER-3

**Reviewed by:**

Mudassar Ahmed - Programme Director - PINS ER-3

**©2021 Rural Support Programmes Network (RSPN). All Rights Reserved.**



EUROPEAN UNION

Every effort has been made to verify the accuracy of the information contained in this report. All information was deemed to be correct as of October 2021. Nevertheless, the Rural Support Programmes Network (RSPN) cannot accept responsibility of the consequences of its use for other purposes or in other contexts.

**‘This publication was produced with the financial support of the European Union. Its contents are the sole responsibility of Rural Support Programmes Network (RSPN) and do not necessarily reflect the views of the European Union’**

**More information about European Union is available on:**

Web: [hp://eeas.europa.eu/delegations/pakistan/](http://eeas.europa.eu/delegations/pakistan/)

Twitter: @EUPakistan

Facebook: [European-Union-in-Pakistan/](https://www.facebook.com/European-Union-in-Pakistan/)

Contents

**Participants** .....1

**Introduction** .....2

**Proceedings of the Workshop** .....2

**The Way Forward**.....4

## Participants

### ***Livestock Department:***

- **Dr. Hizbullah Bhutto** – Director – Directorate of Animal Husbandry
- **Dr. Muzaffar Memon** - Deputy Director Livestock (DDLS) Tando Muhammad Khan
- **Dr. Riaz Ahmed Laghari** - DDLS Matiari
- **Dr. Nizam Jamali** - DDLS Jamshoro
- **Dr. Mohammad Shoaib Dero** - DDLS Dadu
- **Dr. Mansoor Ali Junejo** – DDLS Larkana
- **Dr. Gul Bahar** - DDLS Shikarpur
- **Dr. Zulfiqar Ali** - DDLS Qambar Shahdadkot
- **Dr. Syed Ausaf Abbas** - S.V.O Matiari
- **Dr. Rashid Ali Shah Kazmi** - V.O Tando Allahyar
- **Dr. Musharef Ali Malkani** - V.O Jamshoro

### ***Partner RSPs:***

- **Mr. Nazar Joyo** - Programme Manager (PM) NRSP
- **Mr. Ali Muhammad Kallar** - PM TRDP;

### ***PINS ER-3 PMU:***

- **Mudassar Ahmed** – Programme Director
- **Rao Ayub** - Sr. Tech. Agri. Manager
- **Rabab Jafar** – Communications Officer
- **Dr. Abdul Khaliq** – Government Technical Liason Officer
- **Habib Usmani** - Sr. Agriculture and Food Officer
- **Sarwar Memon** - Admin & Logistics Officer
- **Qurat Ul Ain** - Young Development Professional (Agri.)
- **Zaheer Ahmed** - Capacity Building Officer.

### ***Virtual Participation:***

- **Hamid Magsi** - PM SRSO
- **District Project Officers (DPOs)** from the 10 Programme Districts.

## Introduction

Consultation meeting(s) had been previously conducted between members of PINS ER-3 and Deputy Directors – Livestock Department and the Director at the Directorate of Animal Husbandry, Government of Sindh. A regional-level consultation workshop was proposed to discuss the need and approach for livestock extension services and to re-engage Community Livestock Extension Workers (CLEWs) trained under the EU-funded Programme for Improved Nutrition in Sindh (PINS) to meet these needs. This meeting would also focus upon the sustainability of the CLEW model by working with community institutions in the 10 Programme districts.

### **The workshop intended to achieve following objectives:**

1. To introduce the nutrition-sensitive component of PINS (PINS ER-3) to the participants
2. To discuss the scope of work for livestock extension services and issues & challenges related to extension work and potential opportunities for CLEWs
3. To work towards developing the re-engagement strategy for CLEWs and develop a sustainable model beyond the Programme run as a cadre of accountable private sector service providers

## Proceedings of the Workshop

The meeting started off with a brief overview of the nutrition-sensitive component of PINS ER-3 including its geographical coverage and focus community institutions. Rao Ayub then touched upon the CLEW model developed under PINS ER-3, a recap of what had been previously discussed in the individual meetings conducted in lieu of this workshop and recapped some of the findings from the focus group discussions conducted with CLEWs last year.

Dr. Hizbollah Bhutto (HB) then took the stage to present the work undertaken by the Department across Sindh outlining outreach and some of the challenges that they have faced. Currently, the Department is covering 34% of the total animal population surveyed in the latest census. There are two significant diseases that the Department actively works to address. The first is **Foot and Mouth Disease (FMD)** which impacts animal exports and results in a major loss of income. Secondly, vaccinating against **Peste des Petits Ruminants (PPR)** is also significant given its highly contagious nature which largely affects sheep and goats and hinders their productivity.

Given the financial constraints since the budget allocation for mass vaccinations is about 50% less than the required amount, the Department is actively partnering up with organisations and interventions working in similar areas. Similarly, given the financial limitations, there are human resource constraints which limits outreach to 15 million of the 42 million livestock animals surveyed. It is important to note that the Livestock Department has increased its targets for vaccination during the year and has set out to achieve 60% despite no changes in the budget.

After this, the floor was opened for discussion where important points were made to understand any reservations from the Department's end and how this could be addressed to ensure the a seamless implementation of the CLEW model.

**Some of the concerns raised by officials present were:**

- Some were of the opinion that the CLEWs are not authorized and have not received enough training to be certified to provide animal health services. This can have serious implications on community members who depend on livestock as a source of income
- There are some who may present themselves as veterinarians and promote practices that are harmful to the well-being of the animals
- The money that they charge can create some problems for the Department since Veterinary Assistants do not charge for their services as part of their mandate and may start charging farmers which goes against the guidelines set for them
- There are trained vets who are currently not functional but can easily take up the work that is being done by CLEWs and are formally regulated by the Department. The Programming phasing out would not affect them as much as CLEWs who may become increasingly irresponsible

To counter the concerns raised above, it was pointed out that the CLEW model had been conceptualised by the Federal Government and is being replicated under PINS and modified to achieve the targeted impact. It is also a great resource in tackling the issue of outreach, which is a significant factor outlined by the Director. There was agreement across the room for the need for more oversight that addresses the concerns raised above. Mudassar Ahmed (MA) explained that this is where PINS ER-1, the policy component would step in where they can make policy recommendations based on the experience of each of the District Representatives present and encouraged them to actively document them to kick start the process.

Along with outreach, PINS' communities have also been sensitised in creating a demand for CLEWs which contribute significantly to keeping their work consistent and improving on their present abilities to gain the community's confidence. CLEWs are also from the same communities and have a better understanding of the dynamics present and how to reach out to them and convince them of having their animals vaccinated. Being able to reach more people would justify the vaccines being provided to the CLEWs as part of the MoU signed with the Department. Referring to the issues of charging to the community, it was emphasized that these rates have been pre-decided with the LSOs and that it is not arbitrary which is well within reason given the areas and the number of people they are reaching

It was also suggested to have the CLEWs sign a disclaimer that underlines their mandate and makes them liable for formal action in the event that they exceed it. HB was of the opinion that a disclaimer was not necessary since the CLEW can be a valuable source in an instance where the case is remote. This was supported by Dr. Muzaffar Memon, the Deputy Director at Tando Muhammad Khan. He spoke positively of his experience with the CLEW and appreciated timely updates from the CLEWs regarding numbers and treatment. He also credited the CLEWs in increasing the vaccination numbers to up to 400,000 due to increased coordination between his department and the CLEWs through NRSP. He encouraged other districts to follow suit and push towards owning and encouraging them to collectively reach the targets set.

Keeping in view the discussion above and the options proposed, MA asked the department to commit to sharing their plans to reach optimum numbers and offered to facilitate that by CLEWs to further the mass vaccination goals set by the Department and proposed monthly meetings. A technical refresher was also proposed, taking into account the reservations shared by the Department and HB suggested holding it at the Research and Training Institute, Tando Muhammad Khan where they have pre-designed modules that cater to the needs discussed.

**To avoid future complications with the CLEW model, the Director of Department suggested that**

- CLEWs should meet once a month with the relevant district departments
- The Department will provide the standard vaccination proforma, and CLEWs are bound to keep the record of the vaccination on it to avoid duplication in vaccinations.
- The Department will provide vaccination in vials
- CLEWs will not charge any fee/ amount for vaccination in government organized camps

**The Way Forward**

1. The Director agreed on participating in developing a strategy to best utilise the CLEWs with accountability to achieve the annual targets set. The strategy would focus on
  - a. Enhance support structures
  - b. Improve outreach
  - c. Ensure sustainability
2. The first of the series of meetings to inform the strategy was planned for in Matiari on Friday, October 8<sup>th</sup> where the plan for the refresher training for CLEWs would also be finalised. A similar meeting is planned for each of the 10 Programme districts.
3. Ten-day refresher training for CL EWs
  - a. The RSPN team along with its partner RSPs will arrange a meeting with the district livestock department for finalization of the refresher course i.e., the contents of the refresher course, execution strategy
  - b. Pre-KAP and Post Training KAP will be carried out

Government of Sindh (GoS) through the Planning and Development Department (PDD) is implementing a six-year multi-sectoral Sindh Accelerated Action Plan for Reduction of Stunting and Malnutrition (AAP), with the objective of reducing stunting rate from the existing 48 percent to 40 percent by 2021.

The European Union (EU), under the EU Commission Action Plan on Nutrition 2014, is supporting GoS in addressing the issue of malnutrition. The EU has approved the Programme for Improved Nutrition in Sindh (PINS) to be implemented in ten districts of Sindh - Shikarpur, Thatta, Kambar Shahdaskot, Larkana, Dadu, Jamshoro, Matiari, Sajawal, Tando Allahyar and Tando Muhammad Khan.

RSPN is leading the PINS Expected Results (ER) 3 component with four partners: Action Against Hunger (ACF), National Rural Support Programme (NRSP), Sindh Rural Support Organisation (SRSO) and Thardeep Rural Development Programme (TRDP). This is the nutrition-sensitive component of PINS and focuses on community-level WASH infrastructures, sustaining open defecation free status and develop improved community-level nutrition-sensitive food production systems adapted to climate change in rural areas of Sindh.



EUROPEAN UNION

'This publication was produced with the financial support of the European Union. Its contents are the sole responsibility of Rural Support Programmes Network (RPSN) and do not necessarily reflect the views of the European Union'

More information about European Union is available on:

Web: <http://eeas.europa.eu/delegations/pakistan/>

Twitter: [@EUPakistan](https://twitter.com/EUPakistan)

Facebook: [European-Union-in-Pakistan](https://www.facebook.com/European-Union-in-Pakistan)

## Programme for Improved Nutrition in Sindh

Rural Support Programmes Network  
House No: C-108, Block-2  
Clifton, Karachi  
021-35865577-8-9

[www.rspn.org](http://www.rspn.org)

[www.facebook.com/RSPNPakistan](https://www.facebook.com/RSPNPakistan)

[www.facebook.com/ProgrammeforImprovedNutritioninSindh](https://www.facebook.com/ProgrammeforImprovedNutritioninSindh)

[www.facebook.com/aapsindh](https://www.facebook.com/aapsindh)